

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

Board of Directors
Minutes of the 1,861st Meeting
April 9, 2020

A regular meeting of the Board of Directors was held on April 9, 2020, convening at 9:00 a.m. via teleconference, pursuant to Governor Gavin Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20 and the California Shelter-in-Place mandate. President Simon presided; Patricia K. Williams, District Secretary.

Present: Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman and Simon.

Absent: None.

President Simon gave instructions on the virtual meeting, accessing presentation materials online, and public comment and announced that the order of the agenda items would be changed.

Consent Calendar items brought before the Board were:

1. Approval of Minutes of the Meeting of March 12, 2020.
2. Suspension of Board Rules Regarding the Annual Budget.

Director Dufty made the following motions as a unit. Director Saltzman seconded the motions, which carried by unanimous roll call vote. Ayes: 8 – Directors Allen, Dufty Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 0. Absent: 1 – Director Ames.

1. That the Minutes of the Meeting of March 12, 2020 be approved.
2. That the timeline requirements for Fiscal Year 2021 Annual Budget preparation and presentations be suspended.

President Simon called for Public Comment from telephone participants and gave instructions on the Public Comment process.

Ms. Williams read a written comment submitted by Edward Giordano into the record.

The following individuals addressed the Board via telephone:

Ryan Rivera
Amarez Danza
Nathifa Clark
Aleta Dupree

President Simon thanked Ms. Williams and the District Secretary's Office; commented on receiving feedback from public speakers; requested that Mr. Robert Powers, General Manager, submit a memo to

the Board regarding the current status of providing adequate personal protective equipment (PPE) and safety measures for frontline employees, efforts to source products, current distribution of products, and the goals for ensuring that every frontline staff member has the equipment they need; and commented on hearing requests for assistance from employees.

Director Dufty commented on a public comment regarding reimbursement for providing supplies for employees and noted that he believes that reimbursement is reasonable.

Director Dufty, Chairperson of the Engineering and Operations Committee, brought the matter of Award of Contract No. 15EK-145, Traction Power Substation Replacement KTE Installation, before the Board. Mr. Myat San, Group Manager, Electrical and Mechanical Engineering, Maintenance and Engineering, and Mr. Powers presented the item.

Director Dufty commented on the bid amount being 2% lower than the Engineer's Estimate, the absence of multiple bidders, the competitive nature of the bidding environment, the lack of firms that are capable of performing the work, and indicated that BART was fortunate to receive a bid from a firm that has previously worked with BART, noting the firm's professionalism and the bid amount being lower than the Engineer's Estimate.

Director Allen noted that five potential contractors purchased the plans and asked whether the remaining four contractors were asked why they did not submit bids and for clarification of the timing to start the project; commented on her experience with asking large contractors why they were not interested in BART work, noting that she received feedback suggesting that most large agencies that attempt to complete large projects typically publish a listing of upcoming projects 18-24 months in advance so that large firms can schedule their bidding for the work and that BART does not publish the projects with enough time for large firms to be included in the bidding schedules; and expressed desire for staff to publish lists of upcoming large projects for the next two years, or more if possible, noting that contractors in this competitive environment need to schedule their bidding.

Director McPartland commented that at the last Transbay Tube drill, he noticed that the work performed in the Tube is potentially impeding the access route and emergency responders' ability to work, noting that extension cords were placed in front of doors and the fire department's inability to access the stand pipes at the vent structure on the Oakland side; emphasized that maintaining emergency access while work is performed is essential; asked for the proposed completion date and duration of the project; expressed a desire to ensure that proper PPE is available for workers because COVID-19 may resurge in the fall during the flu season; commented that wayside workers have proper safety equipment, including helmets, hard shoes, gloves, vests, and flashlights, but no respiratory protection; that workers at the worksite, especially individuals in stations, train operators, and station agents, should be provided with respiratory protection given the information issued by the Governor's Office regarding respiratory protection; indicated that he would contact union representatives regarding respiratory protection; and expressed disappointment regarding the submission of only one bid and satisfaction regarding the bid amount being lower than the Engineer's Estimate.

Director Saltzman moved that the General Manager be authorized to award Contract No. 15EK-145, Traction Power Substation Replacement KTE Installation, to Rosendin Electric, Inc., for the Bid amount of \$12,552,540.97, pursuant to notification to be issued by the General Manager. President Simon seconded the motion.

Director Foley expressed support for Director Allen's comment regarding making contracts as visible as possible for contractors' scheduling purposes and expressed disappointment regarding the submission of one bid and satisfaction regarding the bid being lower than the Engineer's Estimate.

Director Dufty indicated that in addition to the bid being lower than the Engineer's Estimate, Rosendin Electric, Inc. has performed other work for BART and this history is important because BART can have confidence in the firm; commented that renovation of the Powell Street Station was an important piece of work and that he asked Mr. Powers and Mr. Carl Holmes, Assistant General Manager, Design and Construction, to arrange meetings with five of the key construction firms; that he received feedback from Web Corp and Swinerton suggesting that the firms were grateful, noting that the environment was more competitive with private sector work, and that he believes BART will receive more competition in the future; and expressed that his experience with major companies indicated that they were satisfied with BART's outreach.

The motion brought by Director Saltzman and seconded by President Simon carried by unanimous roll call vote. Ayes: 9 – Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 0.

Director Saltzman, Chairperson of the Planning, Public Affairs, Access, and Legislation Committee, brought the matter of Update on BART and Valley Transportation Authority Phase I before the Board. Mr. Holmes; Mr. Shane Edwards, Chief Maintenance and Engineering Officer; and Ms. Tamar Allen, Assistant General Manager, Operations, presented the item.

Director Ames commented that she is concerned about the timing of the labor bidding for operations and asked for clarification of the timing of the labor bidding process for operations, the ridership plan regarding the number of trains, the timing between trains, and how the timing of the bid process relates to testing.

Director Dufty thanked Mr. Edwards for working on this project on a full-time basis; commented that Mr. Holmes and his team are also providing great leadership; and expressed confidence in Mr. Edwards' leadership and work on the project.

Director Li echoed Director Dufty's comments.

Director McPartland expressed that he is looking forward to completion of the project and indicated that his reservations are focused on a different phase.

Director Raburn congratulated Mr. Holmes and Mr. Edwards for reaching the three important milestones and asked whether any benefits have been realized from the operations-to-capital workload shift.

Director Foley thanked and congratulated Mr. Edwards and Mr. Holmes for their hard work; asked for confirmation that they are not experiencing any challenges with the impacts of COVID-19 and that the project is on-schedule; asked whether the work orders or trouble tickets are paper copies touched by multiple people, or digital without any physical contact with the orders or tickets; and expressed appreciation for staff's work.

Director McPartland, Chairperson of the Administration Committee, brought the matter of COVID-19 Update: Impact of and Responses to COVID-19, before the Board. Mr. Powers; Ms. Pamela Herhold, Assistant General Manager, Performance and Budget; Ms. Alicia Trost, Chief Communications Officer; Mr. Val Menotti, Chief Planning and Development Officer, Systems Development; Ms. Tamar Allen; Mr. Carl Holmes; Chief of Police Ed Alvarez; Ms. Gia Ilole, Assistant General Manager, Administration; Mr. Jeffrey Lau, Chief Safety Officer, System Safety; Mr. Michael Jones, Deputy General Manager; and Mr. Matthew Burrows, General Counsel, presented the item. The presentation contained sections on Ridership, Federal Stimulus Legislation, Long-Term Budget Projections, Service Modifications, Front Line Safety Efforts, and Employee and Labor Partner Engagement.

Ms. Williams read written comments submitted by the following individuals into the record:

Jack Evans
Elisabeth Romero
Doug Dray
Christopher McKenzie
Hildegard Dodd

Aleta Dupree addressed the Board via telephone.

Director Allen commented on the following subjects: the Fiscal Year 2020 (FY20) budget being projected as overbudget; the inclusion of full service in the original budget; reduction of service and the projected loss of \$184 million in revenue; the amount that will be spent in excess of the amount budgeted to finish the year; desire to reduce expenditures in the system to mitigate lost revenues; utilizing scenario analysis for Fiscal Year 2021 (FY21) and characterizing the low scenario as the worst-case scenario; the percentage of the low scenario operating sources in relation to the original FY21 budget; the reduction in expected ridership; the low scenario reflecting the lowest expectation from a realistic standpoint; that the low scenario is probably too high; satisfaction with the low, medium, and high scenario analysis format; providing actual real projections of expenditures under the three scenarios; the potential for projections to change; providing an educated guess regarding the financial scenarios and expenditures with certain levels of fare revenue reduction and service reduction at the next Board meeting; whether other Board Members were in agreement with adding information regarding operating uses to the FY21 budget scenarios for the next meeting; ascertaining current revenue; the end of the current Fiscal Year; updating revenue and sale tax proceeds numbers as they change; presentation of FY21 budget reduction options to the Board; the inability to match the revenue decrease; reliance on federal and taxpayers' assistance with mitigating revenue decreases; that BART cannot expect taxpayers to provide the \$246 million to \$440 million in revenue loss without reviewing which programs and projects could be deferred for one or two years until BART recovers from this crisis; the labor bidding process; whether the labor bid will include the current level of service; the reason for not using 30-minute headways as the service level in the labor bid; train operators training on the Fleet of the Future during reduced service hours; the inclusion of employees engaged in training in the labor bid; the preservation of current employees in the labor bid; the timing of the labor bid for maintenance and other positions; continuing to bid positions for capital work if the positions are not needed for operations work; the expectation that calls for police service from riders would decrease as ridership decreases to 7%-9% of normal; the expectation that the total number of call for police service from riders would decrease more than it has and that the number of calls for police service suggests that the amount of bad behavior on trains has not decreased as much as paid ridership has decreased; that the number of welfare checks has not declined much and that the data suggests the presence of a fair number of homeless individuals and others in need of assistance on

trains; the change in the number of officer initiated, station agent, and patron/citizen calls for service; that while paid ridership has decreased by 93%, police activity on the trains has not declined much; continuing to focus efforts on restricting bad actors' access to the system; and a desire to place a police officer at every faregate even if overtime must be used, noting that BART needs to do everything possible to keep employees and essential workers safe. Director Allen thanked Ms. Herhold, staff, and senior management for their work during this unprecedented time and commented on the following subjects: her concerns regarding financial issues; instability; the unknown amount of federal assistance; the inability to rely on taxpayers' assistance; her desire for additional information; the lack of information presented to the Board and the public; creating an Audit and Finance Subcommittee that includes outside professionals; providing an Audit Committee presentation to the Board and the urgency of establishing of an Audit and Finance Subcommittee at the next Board meeting.

Director Ames commented on the following subjects: desire to imagine the worst-case scenario; the lack of information regarding worst-case scenario related to ridership and necessary reductions in expenses; the long-term and short-term risks to the agency outlined in the Long Range Outlook; the need for reviewing a benchmark that may assist with creating a worst-case ridership scenario; the risk of the negative impact on jobs and the University of California, Los Angeles' (UCLA) ridership study results, noting that BART relies on San Francisco jobs and commute-related job trips; analyzing unemployment in the core system at the job centers and how quickly ridership can return; the global recession; her expectation that BART will not have 70% ridership by next June; that risks to BART will continue for 18 months to 2 years until a vaccine is created and deployed; utilizing observation of businesses' recovery and maybe San Francisco's recovery as the benchmark; belief that San Francisco will not recover next year, given the trends; a public comment regarding concern about bringing the COVID-19 virus home; desire to review a decrease in ridership that is lower than the information presented and based on jobs returning to the area; utilizing data to support the ridership loss; refocusing efforts on capital projects; whether station hardening and improving faregates would be considered essential infrastructure work; Director Allen's suggestion to place a police officer at every faregate to prevent fare evasion; that BART needs to be proactive and state that station hardening is needed for public safety purposes; whether funding is available for station hardening; public comments regarding fear, BART Police Department data, and riders' fear of being on trains; controlling fare evasion to increase ridership when jobs return; the importance of scrub crews and power-washing surfaces and floors given the COVID-19 virus' ability to live on floor surfaces and the potential for transmission of the COVID-19 virus onto train floors by people who walk onto a platform and into a train; characterizing additional cleaning of the stations and trains as essential infrastructure work, noting the operational cost of the work and potential available funding; whether additional steam cleaning and funding from other federal sources would be pursued; desire for additional funding to be pursued because people are going to expect more cleanliness; desire to match service with ridership; that BART should follow the growth in employment, noting that the ridership model should focus on the return of jobs; the potential assistance provided by the stimulus package toward the end of the year; and the prediction of massive declines in the economy and the expectation of years of recession. Director Ames expressed appreciation for Ms. Herhold's work to develop other scenarios and requested that the Inspector General provide her risk assessment; expressed desire to review the Inspector General's risk assessment as the Board considers establishing an Audit and Finance Subcommittee, temporarily re-open union contracts, and temporarily freeze upcoming raises to reduce expenses; commended Ms. Tamar Allen for re-deploying staff to capital work; noted that she was looking forward to reviewing worst-case scenario information, more data on expected jobs returning to the Bay Area, and a more realistic decrease in projected ridership before new contracts are bid; and indicated that she does not wish for massive lay-offs or furloughs to

occur and that BART needs to analyze expenses and implement temporary reductions to avoid lay-offs and furloughs.

Director Dufty expressed gratitude for frontline workers' efforts – including Station Agents, Police Officers, Community Service Officers, System Service Workers, and Train Operators – over the past few weeks and commented on the following subjects: feedback he has received from the public and public comments at the Meeting regarding BART's response to the current situation; the public's observation of frontline employees' greatness; staff's assumption of leadership roles and the unexpected nature of the current time; the devastating financial reality faced by BART; social distancing; possible resurgence of the COVID-19 virus in the fall; the challenges that BART's leadership team is addressing; gratitude for staff's diligence, noting difficulty with continuing to provide transportation for critical personnel; the lack of response to homelessness amid the COVID-19 response in the Bay Area; Governor Newsom's allocation of \$50 million of \$150 million to address homelessness and COVID-19 and the lack of leveraging the \$50 million to assist BART; his work with Mr. Powers and BART's lobbyists to contact Senator Scott Wiener and Assemblymember Phil Ting to request that the state budget include a provision that any city or county that receives funding to address homelessness be required to coordinate and present a plan to any major transit agency within their jurisdiction regarding efforts to address homelessness; San Francisco's efforts to address critical public health needs and the lack of resolution regarding homelessness; press coverage regarding opening a shelter at the Moscone Center and the Palace of Fine Arts; the absence of an implemented plan to adhere to social distancing within shelters or among the thousands of people on the streets; that BART is fighting hard to state that if counties are going to receive state funding to address homelessness, then the counties must be required to advise BART on how they are going to engage and serve the people that are entering the system because their needs have not been addressed; his appreciation for Mr. Powers' work; his scheduled virtual meeting with the Mayor's Office regarding the homelessness issue; and whether a hiring freeze had been implemented for Community Service Officers. Director Dufty commended Chief Alvarez for implementing train checks twice daily and Chief Alvarez's responsiveness to staffing issues presented by COVID-19; commented on a photograph he had received depicting a person laying across the floor in an empty train car, that BART is taking all possible action with the available resources in the current reality, noting that cities and counties around BART have not yet addressed the impact of COVID-19 on the homeless population, and the Shanghai Metro System's offer of protective masks; asked whether management could buy and distribute fabric and materials, and ask employees who are working from home if they can sew fabric masks; commented on a public comment regarding the lack of access to masks due to the limited supply and asking lobbyists to contact Governor Newsom regarding acquiring masks; acknowledged Ms. Trost's leadership in communicating with the public every day regarding ridership; congratulated Ms. Ilole for her selection as Assistant General Manager, Administration; expressed support for providing reimbursement to frontline workers' expenditures for protective equipment; commented on previous reliance on employees to obtain basic cleaning supplies; asked whether reimbursement to frontline workers' expenditures for protective equipment could be provided, noting the public comment regarding reimbursement; and thanked Ms. Nathifa Clark for her comments regarding the care and support to keep the Operations Control Center (OCC) free from COVID-19 and thanked the thousands of BART employees who have helped BART respond to the COVID-19 challenge.

Director Li commented on the following subjects: BART employees' efforts to keep the system running, including frontline and OCC employees; her gratitude for senior management's transparency, noting that BART is setting a model for how transit operators need to communicate publicly during a crisis; BART's COVID-19 testing partner and the absence of COVID-19 cases among BART employees; comparison

of BART to Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) New York City Transit regarding positive COVID-19 test results among employees; efforts to mitigate transmission of the COVID-19 virus; the thoughtful nature of decisions regarding service that had been made; satisfaction with maintaining weekend service with the modified Saturday opening time, noting that essential employees depend on weekend service; feedback she has received from essential workers regarding the 9 p.m. closing, noting changes in parallel service; desire to discuss the 9 p.m. closing; the work performed by Community Service Officers who are no longer enforcing parking; whether the Community Service Officers are walking around or standing at the faregates; the work performed by Proof-of-Payment Officers and the number of citations; desire for the number and type of citation to be provided in future presentations; whether Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT) are still assigned to BART; desire for information regarding the activities of HOT and CORE; a constituent's inquiry regarding hand sanitizer for the public; whether hand sanitizer is still in supply and will be placed at central locations as entrances are changed and possibly closed; the prior four-week supply of hand sanitizer when hand sanitizer was first placed in the stations; whether BART has coordinated with local jurisdictions, particularly San Francisco, to place resources such as pit stops or handwashing stations at or near BART plazas; possibility of state assistance to procure PPE; support for working with Shanghai Metro; the expectation of limited to no additional transit assistance from the state and federal governments at this time and that state assistance is focused on homelessness, housing, and procuring medical equipment; her hope that BART will be prioritized as a recipient of PPE due to its status as an essential service with essential employees; looking forward to her upcoming meeting with Mayor London Breed's Chief of Staff regarding homelessness; that COVID-19 (Coronavirus) does not discriminate and that unhoused people should not be equated to people who have contracted the Coronavirus; the lack of safe places for unhoused populations to shelter-in-place; and looking forward to working with BART's leadership, Board Members, and local jurisdictions to prioritize BART and public transit needs regarding resources for unhoused populations, noting that this was clear at the Board Workshop and is becoming more clear during the global pandemic.

Director McPartland noted that his comments were from the life safety perspective and commented on the following subjects: commending Chief Alvarez for his efforts regarding law enforcement and redistribution of staff; the positive COVID-19 test results for more than 50% of the Hayward Fire Department security staff; the absence of positive COVID-19 test results among the Hayward Fire Department personnel; providing masks to BART Police Department personnel and ensuring they wear gloves when they are in contact with patrons; commending Ms. Tamar Allen for her contingency planning regarding the back-up OCC; providing Station Agents with gloves and masks; Governor Newsom's announcement regarding wearing masks in public; whether the Board could develop a policy that people should not enter BART stations without wearing a mask; the timeline for receiving gloves, masks, and PPE from Shanghai and whether Shanghai Metro's offer to BART was certain; protecting BART's personnel and contractors; the absence of masks as part of PPE worn by workers in the Transbay Tube; that Transbay Tube workers should be included in the list of people who should be wearing masks; the possibility of requesting PPE from the state; if there was any advantage to BART declaring an emergency or disaster; that if BART cannot obtain PPE for System Service Workers, Station Agents, and Train Operators who come directly in contact with the public, then BART should go through other avenues to get material as fast as possible; desire to clean trains every day, noting that foggers were obtained to decontaminate trains on a cyclical basis, that the number of trains in service had been reduced by 50%, that trains were originally cleaned every 90 days, and that trains are currently cleaned every four days; the procedure for handling a hazardous material incident relative to BART and Shelter-In-Place; reducing the number of cars in a train to ensure that the entire fleet in service can be cleaned each night; his experience as a first responder; cautioning against placing people in harm's way just so the

railroad can run; and reducing the number of cars or re-allocating law enforcement personnel to clean trains every day.

Director McPartland submitted the following RCI request: Within one week, report back to the Directors how and when staff will be able to fully clean/decontaminate all scheduled main line revenue rolling stock on a daily basis. Director Allen seconded the request.

Director McPartland noted that the RCI request was for an action; requested that the Board support him; indicated that BART is putting people at risk by allowing them to ride on potentially contaminated cars and that displaced staff members could be re-allocated to cleaning train cars; and suggested that he might discuss this issue with union leaders for the BART Police Officers' Association and Train Operators. He clarified the request, asking that the staff report and/or memo include the potential plan, costs, time, and staffing levels.

Director Raburn commented on the following subjects: the extraordinary nature of the current situation; the reduction of service with Board Members' support, even if the support is tacit; the change in environmental protections at the federal level as service is being reduced; Fruitvale Station's status as the leading station in passenger volume in the East Bay and the fifth busiest station in the entire system; his experience with visiting Fruitvale Station, noting his observation of dependent passengers who use the system on a daily basis, Revenue Protection Guards, the emergency gate being locked but operable by the Station Agent, and the absence of faregate jumping for fifteen to twenty minutes; commending Chief Alvarez for deploying available staff; the 39 passenger exits per day from the Oakland Airport Connector (OAC) and whether any load shift is occurring or any cost savings is possible for the operation of the OAC or eBART system; whether reducing service levels also provides reduction in expenditures; whether any savings are available in the operation of eBART; the \$173 million shortfall in the FY20 budget; the multiple capital load shed figures presented in the Fiscal Year 2020 budget; the preparation of a needs assessment; the effectiveness of the letter submitted by Bay Area transit agencies to legislators in Washington, D.C.; that Core Capacity grants should be released and the status of Core Capacity grants; whether Stimulus 4 letters were being drafted; whether any input was being prepared for the MTC's meeting on April 22, 2020; the Stimulus 4 package shifting from opening the infrastructure toward support for small business programs; his support for small business programs, his participation in the Small Business Support Services workshop, and the number of participants in the Workshop; the messages from the Federal Small Business Association and the State Governor's Office at the Workshop; his use of Google Mobility to analyze South Korea and Germany, noting that Germany is locked down and that South Korea has 80% ridership and is moving toward recovery; that there are two different models to follow; that BART cannot draw a conclusion from the Google Mobility data, but that testing, tracing, and treatment have been available in both South Korea and Germany; that his observations of South Korea ridership on trains depicts everyone wearing masks; that South Korea was prepared and the United States is suffering from lack of preparation; whether the assumptions in the budget include the proposed additional police officers, and whether the proposed number of additional police officers matches Chief Alvarez's needs assessment.

Director Saltzman thanked the whole BART team for their work during this time and commented on the following subjects: that BART has the best on-time performance since she began serving as a Board Member, noting the absence of passenger-caused delays; that transit agencies have been struggling to maintain service levels after implementing reductions; that it is impressive that BART has been stable and that this is important for the riders; whether the funding from the Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security (CARES) Act and the savings from implemented service reductions would fill the

budget gap for FY20 without additional reductions; the importance of communicating to the public that BART will not stop running in June if the budget is not balanced; desire for information at the next meeting regarding the FY20 budget after the upcoming MTC meeting; her concern that the projections in the FY21 budget are not sufficiently conservative, including the low revenue scenario; that the lack of information and the projections suggest a volatile situation with the expiration and return of the Stay-at-Home orders; that all the projections estimate that ridership will begin to return in the summer and continue to grow through the rest of the year; the possibilities that ridership may return after the summer or that ridership may return in the summer but decline in fall and winter; desire for an extremely low revenue scenario to be presented the next time this information is provided, noting that this is the safest way to budget for next year; whether a lower-revenue scenario could be presented; implementing budget reductions in a way to avoid lay-offs and provide the ability to scale up quickly as ridership returns; preparing for a better scenario than what is projected; that laying off employees would be extremely hard for employees and the system, and would prevent BART from scaling back up and returning to full service; and that the Board needs to have some discussions regarding how to return to full service. Director Saltzman thanked staff and Board Members for their advocacy for funding; commented that advocacy for funding would likely need to continue for the next year or more, and that BART will need to educate outside decision makers about why additional funding is necessary to maintain current service and restore full service; requested that staff and Board Members advocate for funding when speaking to decision-makers; noted that advocacy for funding will be the first priority for the Board and staff for the next year at least; requested a comprehensive update on the speed at which capital projects are moving forward within the next month; requested that information explaining BART Police Department staffing be posted on bart.gov for the public; associated herself with comments from Directors Dufty and Li regarding homelessness, noting that BART needs to partner with the counties, cities, and the state; and indicated that an opportunity exists for the state to house people and that BART needs to be a part of the advocacy efforts to house people, as housing impacts the District's financial situation because of the amount of time and money spent offering services, helping people, and cleaning encampments, and that this issue is important for the region and BART.

Director Foley expressed concern that the low budget scenario assumption is not low enough; expressed desire for 25% or 50% scenarios in the future; asked whether all the safety issues raised during the March 26, 2020 Board Meeting had been resolved and whether any new issues had arisen; commented that he supports the reimbursement of personal expenses for PPE; asked why employees feel the need to purchase their own PPE; referenced Director McPartland's suggestion of reaching out to the state and requested that staff contact the state regarding masks before the state offers masks to other locations; expressed support for cloth masks or face coverings, noting that cloth masks or face coverings could be used as alternatives in some situations; asked whether any budgetary savings would be recognized if a station were closed and the employees shifted to a different location; asked for an explanation of the impacts on the 2150 Webster Street BART headquarters project and requested that the Board be advised of any impacts of the Shelter-In-Place on the headquarters project; expressed support for BART declaring an emergency at some point if doing so would provide access to funding; commented on the Ms. Hildegard Dodd's public comment regarding paper submittals, indicating that BART should try to move away from a paper process and move toward an all-digital process throughout the District; expressed disagreement with the assumption that a public bail out is a negative solution, noting that BART is a public agency with a flawed revenue model that relies on fare revenue for more than 60% of its budget, and that BART needs to move toward a more sustainable revenue model and reconsider how to fund the agency in the future to insulate the agency against valleys and peaks in ridership; thanked all BART employees and essential workers for reporting to work every day, noting that BART cannot operate without its employees and that employees need to be able to work safely; and requested that staff

continue to work with labor unions and maintain the highest level of station and train cleanliness for riders.

Director McPartland commented on Director Foley's suggestion to reconsider BART's funding model.

President Simon commended staff and commented on the following subjects: the PPE procurement, indicating that the cost for products is high and that encouraging Ms. Tamar Allen and her team to locate safety gear as the number one priority; Chief Alvarez's deployment strategy and her observation of BART Police Officers wearing PPE and assisting a homeless individual at Powell Street Station; that staff is doing everything possible to ensure that riders, housed and unhoused residents, and staff move through this unprecedented situation; that staff is contacting transit institutions in the United States, Shanghai, Hong Kong, and Singapore to learn about the return of ridership and new infections; Ms. Herhold and staff's efforts to create best and worst-case modeling and review situations around the world; that the Board and community had been in conversation with staff; that BART's communication team is communicating with the public at least three to five times per day regarding BART's activities; the importance of continuing to bolster communication efforts because bad information will continue to surface and BART needs to safeguard against this; that with 8% ridership, BART is transporting almost 9,000 people to and from work, including hospital workers, in-home healthcare workers, and grocery workers who are among those at the highest risk of COVID-19 transmission in their jobs; her observation of a System Service Worker named Alex cleaning the station entry gates on her hands and knees at Montgomery Street Station; and that she would be working with Board Members, the Inspector General, and staff to move forward with Director Dufty's request for creating an audit committee.

President Simon called for the General Manager's Report. Mr. Powers commented on executive staff's efforts, accessibility, and decision-making and continuing to work on other projects and initiatives while responding to COVID-19. Mr. Powers thanked the Board Members' for their patience and support.

President Simon called for Board Member Reports, Roll Call for Introductions, and In Memoriam requests.

President Simon acknowledged that all Board Members had been communicating with their constituents, conducting outreach, and calling legislators.

Direct Dufty requested that the meeting be adjourned in honor of the 41 MTA New York City Transit workers who passed away due to the COVID-19 virus.

Director Li reported that she continues to speak with local elected officials and MTC Commissioners, noting the upcoming MTC meeting on April 22, 2020, and that she had attended a virtual San Francisco Bay Area Planning and Urban Research Association (SPUR) event regarding transit funding.

Director McPartland thanked everyone for their participation and Mr. Burrows for his clarification of a disaster declaration in relation to funding, and indicated that staff should consider contacting the Region 3 or the Governor's Office of Emergency Services (Cal OES) to request direct resources.

The Meeting was adjourned at 1:06 p.m.

Patricia K. Williams
District Secretary