



Title VI Fare Equity Analysis & Public Participation Report

Discontinuance of Sales of Magnetic-Stripe Tickets

January 23, 2020
Office of Civil Rights
Board of Directors



Overview



- Presentation of findings from Title VI Fare Equity Analysis and Public Participation Report for the Proposed Discontinuance of Sales of Magnetic-Stripe Tickets:
 - Blue Mag-Stripe Tickets for Regular Fare Riders
 - Green Mag-Stripe Tickets for Senior Riders
 - Red Mag-Stripe Tickets for Disabled Riders
 - Red Mag-Stripe Tickets for Youth Riders
- Board approval of Title VI Fare Equity Analysis

Title VI Process: Analysis

- Analysis of protected riders to determine if potential disproportionate impact from change, per BART's Disparate Impact/Disproportionate Burden Policy:
 - **Fare Type or Media**: Difference between protected ridership shares of affected fare type/media and overall system exceeds 10%
- BART's overall ridership is 64.5% minority and 20.1% low-income

Title VI Process: Public Outreach

- Public outreach to inform riders and ask them to complete the Clipper-Only Survey
 - 6 in-station events
 - Multilingual newspaper ads
 - Social media/DSS
 - Title VI/EJ & LEP Advisory Committees
 - BART Accessibility Task Force
 - San Leandro Senior Community Center
- 789 Surveys Completed

BART WANTS TO HEAR FROM YOU!

BART is planning to transition to “Clipper-only sales” in stations next year. This means BART ticket vending machines will no longer sell paper tickets.

Tell us what you think at the following BART station events:

Coliseum Tuesday, October 8 7:00-9:00 AM	West Oakland Wednesday, October 16 5:00-7:00 PM
Richmond Thursday, October 10 5:00-7:00 PM	16th Street Mission Tuesday, October 22 7:00-9:00 AM
Pittsburg/Bay Point Monday, October 14 7:00-9:00 AM	Hayward Thursday, October 24 5:00-7:00 PM

Take the survey online Oct. 7-25, 2019 at bart.gov/clipperonly

To thank you for your time, you can enter to win a \$120 Clipper card at the end of the survey. If you need language assistance services, please call (510) 464-6752. 한국어 필요하신 분은, 510-464-6752 에 문의하십시오. Kung kailangan mo ang tulong ng mga serbisyong wika, pakitawagan ang (510) 464-6752. Nếu quý vị cần dịch vụ trợ giúp về ngôn ngữ, xin vui lòng gọi số (510) 464-6752.



Public Comments

Blue Mag-Stripe Tickets:

- *Low-income Commenter:* I think it is a wonderful idea. And it would move along crowds faster. And it would [be] the same as buying the paper tickets but you can hold on to the card and reuse it and save paper for the environment.

Green Mag-Stripe Tickets:

- *Minority Commenter:* I have Clipper today. But I also have lots of BART tickets. I hope there is a way to convert the BART tickets to Clipper deposit.

Red Mag-Stripe Tickets (Disabled Discount):

- *Minority Commenter:* Because I have an RTC card, if paper tickets are eliminated completely I will not have a back-up plan available to me should my RTC card expire or get lost. I will not be able to afford to rider BART without the discount for people with disabilities available to me in instances when my RTC card isn't with me.

Red Mag-Stripe Tickets (Youth Discount):*

- Um I think it would be harder if I forget my Clipper card since it would be a pain to get a new one.

Discontinuance of Blue Mag-Stripe Tickets for Regular Fares



- **Analysis: Disproportionate burden on low-income riders**

Minority Disparate Impact?	Low-Income Disproportionate Burden?
No	Yes

- **Public Comment: Majority of low-income riders paying a regular fare already use Clipper and support the proposal**

Survey Respondents (Regular Fare)	Support*	Don't Support	Comment Sample Size	Use Clipper**	Use Ticket**	Total
Minority	78.2%	21.8%	174	88.5%	20%	260
Low-Income	80.6%	19.4%	72	83.7%	23.1%	104

*Includes conditional and unconditional support

**Clipper + Ticket Users may add up to more than 100% of total, as respondents were able to select more than one fare media type

Equity Findings & Proposed Mitigations



- No disparate impact on minority riders
- May disproportionately affect low-income riders
 - Balanced out with public comments from riders who are already using Clipper card and support the proposal
- Mitigations:
 - MTC's free Clipper card distribution through CBOs program
 - MTC's upcoming Regional Means-Based Fare Discount Program (Clipper START)
 - 26,123 free Clipper cards distributed at four-station Clipper only pilot program

Discontinuance of Green Mag-Stripe Tickets for Senior Discount Fares



2018 Customer Satisfaction Survey

- Insufficient demographic information so a DI/DB analysis could not be conducted
- Senior discount rider 22% less likely to be minority than overall BART minority ridership
- Also 4.5% less likely to be low-income than overall BART low-income ridership

Revenue Trip Exit Data (November 1, 2018-October 31, 2019)

- 94.8% of trips completed with a Clipper card compared to 5.2% with mag-stripe tickets
- 5.2% of senior trips were completed with a mag-stripe ticket compared to 19.4% of regular trips

		% Ticket Media			% Ticket Media
Clipper Senior	6,371,799	94.8%	Clipper Adult	67,013,435	80.6%
Mag-stripe Senior (Green)	347,754	5.2%	Mag-stripe Regular (Blue)	16,139,566	19.4%
Total Senior	6,719,553	100.0%	Total Regular	83,153,001	100.0%

Public Comment

- While sample sizes are small, riders paying a senior fare are generally using Clipper card and support the proposal

Discontinuance of Red Mag-Stripe Tickets for Disabled Fares



2018 Customer Satisfaction Survey

- Insufficient demographic information so a DI/DB analysis could not be conducted
- Disabled discount rider is 13.1% more likely to be minority than overall BART minority ridership
- Also 31.6% more likely to be low-income than the overall BART low-income ridership

Revenue Trip Exit Data (November 1, 2018-October 31, 2019)

- 84.6% of trips completed with an RTC card compared to 15.4% with mag-stripe tickets
- 15.4% of disabled trips were completed with a mag-stripe ticket compared to 19.4% of regular trips

		% Ticket Media			% Ticket Media
RTC Disabled	2,248,752	84.6%	Clipper Adult	67,013,435	80.6%
Mag-stripe Disabled (Red)*	409,898	15.4%	Mag-stripe Regular (Blue)	16,139,566	19.4%
Total Disabled	2,658,650	100.0%	Total Regular	83,153,001	100.0%

*Note that revenue trip exits do not record the discount being used, but only the fare media. Because Red mag-stripe tickets are used for both the Youth and Disabled fare discounts, staff applied the proportion of Red youth (26%) and Red disabled tickets (74%) sold during this same timeframe to the number of Red ticket exits to determine youth and disabled exits respectively.

Public Comment

- While sample sizes are small, riders paying a disabled fare are generally using RTC cards with protected riders almost equally split between support and don't support

Discontinuance of Red Mag-Stripe Tickets for Youth Fares



2018 Customer Satisfaction Survey

- Insufficient demographic information so a DI/DB analysis could not be conducted
- Youth discount rider 22.8% more likely to be minority than overall BART minority ridership
- Also 36.5% more likely to be low-income than the overall BART low-income ridership

Revenue Trip Exit Data (November 1, 2018-October 31, 2019)

- 93.6% of trips completed with a Clipper card compared to 6.4% with mag-stripe tickets
- 6.4% of youth trips were completed with a mag-stripe ticket compared to 19.4% of regular trips

		% Ticket Media			% Ticket Media
Clipper Youth	2,105,627	93.6%	Clipper Adult	67,013,435	80.6%
Mag-stripe Youth (Red)*	144,018	6.4%	Mag-stripe Regular (Blue)	16,139,566	19.4%
Total Youth	2,249,645	100.0%	Total Regular	83,153,001	100.0%

*Note that revenue trip exits do not record the discount being used, but only the fare media. Because Red mag-stripe tickets are used for both the Youth and Disabled fare discounts, staff applied the proportion of Red youth (26%) and Red disabled tickets (74%) sold during this same timeframe to the number of Red ticket exits to determine youth and disabled exits respectively.

Public Comment

- While sample sizes are small, riders paying a youth fare are generally using Clipper cards with minority riders equally split between support and don't support
- Only one identified low-income rider who did not support

Equity Findings

- For all three discount fare types, equity finding based on the fare change analysis and public comment received cannot be determined due to insufficient ridership and public input data
- Assume the discontinuance of all discount mag-stripe tickets may disproportionately impact minority and low-income riders using each fare type and that existing fare media alternatives could mitigate these adverse effects

Proposed Mitigations

- Green Mag-Stripe Tickets
 - Protected riders can avoid the mag-stripe ticket surcharge by paying their fares with a Clipper card, which has no acquisition fee for senior discount riders
- Red Mag-Stripe Tickets for Disabled Riders
 - Proposed mitigation is to offset the \$3 administration fee
 - Recommendation for staff to work with our regional partners to identify a feasible solution to offset this fee for the RTC card
- Red Mag-Stripe Tickets for Youth Riders
 - Protected riders can avoid the mag-stripe ticket surcharge by paying their fares with a Clipper card, which has no acquisition fee for youth discount riders

Motion

Board of Directors approves the Title VI Fare Equity Analysis for the Proposed Discontinuance of Sales of Magnetic-Stripe Tickets