



Title VI Fare Equity Analysis

2024 Productivity-Adjusted Inflation-Based Fare Increase & Clipper® STARTSM Discount Increase

Office of Civil Rights | May 25, 2023



Discussion

1. Background
2. Overview
3. Title VI Process
4. Findings
5. Motion

Background

- Feb 2019 – CPI Fare Increase Update (Board Workshop)
- Jun 2019 – Approved the increase (Board Meeting)
- Jul 2022 – CPI Fare Increase Implementation (Board Meeting)
- Mar 2023 – OCR Initiates Title VI Equity Analysis (Board Memo)
- May 2023 – Title VI Equity Analysis Board Approval (Board Meeting)

Overview

	2024	2025
CPI Fare Change		
Productivity-Adjusted Inflation-Based Fare Increases (CPI Fare Increase)	Up to 5.5%*	Up to 5.5%*
CLIPPER® STARTSM Discount Increase		
Metropolitan Transportation Commission's (MTC) Regional Means-Based Transit Fare Discount (CLIPPER® START SM Pilot Program)	From 20% to 50%**	

*Two Productivity-Adjusted fare increases of "up to" 5.5% each.

**CLIPPER® STARTSM Pilot Program discount is currently 20% off BART fares- Increase would raise discount to 50%.

Title VI Process: DI/DB Analyses Methodology

1. All Riders (Overall Demographic) analysis (Analysis 1)

- Compare the impact of the proposed fare increases on protected riders against overall BART riders.

2. Clipper[®] STARTSM Pilot Program Discount Analysis (Analysis 2)

- Compare the impact of increasing the Clipper[®] STARTSM pilot program discount for protected riders against overall riders.

3. Public Participation (Analysis 3)

- The consideration of public input within the analyses to determine if there is an impact.

Title VI Process: DI/DB Analysis – CPI Fare Increase (Analysis 1)

Across-the-Board Fare Change: Difference between fare change for protected riders and non-protected riders is equal to or greater than five percent (5%)

	% Difference (Minority vs. Non-Minority)	Minority Disparate Impact?	% Difference (Low Income vs. Non-Low-Income)	Low-Income Disproportionate Burden?
DI/DB Threshold: \geq 5%				
Proposed up to 5.5% Fare Increases	0.00%	No	0.01%	No
Cumulative Impact (2020-25) ¹	-0.02%	No	-0.01%	No

¹ Per BART’s DI/DB Policy, the cumulative impacts of similar fare changes occurring during a three-year Title VI triennial reporting period will be analyzed as part of an equity analysis. BART’s last reporting period, approved by FTA, includes changes for the period from January 1, 2018 through December 31, 2021, noting that the last Triennial Review was delayed by one year due to COVID-19. BART’s current triennial reporting period includes all changes from January 1, 2022 through December 31, 2024.

No disparate impact or disproportionate burden



Title VI Analysis Process: DI/DB Analysis – Clipper® STARTSM (Analysis 2)

Fare Type Changes: Difference between the affected fare type’s protected ridership share and the overall system’s protected ridership share is greater than 10%

	Minority Riders	% Difference (Minority vs. Non-Minority)	Minority Disparate Impact?	Low-Income Riders	% Difference (Low Income vs. Non-Low Income) ¹	Low-Income Disproportionate Burden?
DI/DB Threshold: =/> 10%						
Clipper® STARTSM Discount Increase	1.1%	0.6%	No	2.5%	2.1%	No

1 - The BART 2022 Customer Satisfaction Survey used for this analysis includes different income levels in its questions than the qualifying income thresholds for Clipper® STARTSM. As such, the low-income designation of BART riders is approximate as compared to the qualifying income threshold for the pilot program discount, creating a small share of “non-low-income” riders who use Clipper® STARTSM.

This analysis accounts for the proposed fare increases of up to 5.5%. This explains the values being positive.

No disparate impact or disproportionate burden



Title VI Process: Public Participation (Analysis 3)

- At-station outreach
- Informed riders about the proposed increase and the CPI and Clipper® STARTSM Survey
 - Title VI/EJ & LEP Advisory Committees
 - BART Accessibility Task Force
 - 6 in-station events with interpreters
 - LEP Serving newspaper ads
 - 1,256 survey responses received

4 **Visión Hispana** **LOCALES**

iBART quiere escuchar tu opinión!

BART está considerando la posibilidad de modificar su política de estacionamiento, incluyendo las tarifas y los horarios. Obtén más información y danos tu opinión tomando la encuesta en línea del 28 de noviembre al 16 de diciembre en bart.gov/parkingurvey.

Al final de la encuesta, puedes entrar en el sorteo de una tarjeta Clipper de \$130 para agradecer tu participación. Encuestas disponibles en varios idiomas en línea.

*Encuesta disponible en varias idiomas en línea

Let's go **ba**

La National Hispanic Health Foundation invita a las comunidades hispanas a no olvidar ponerse la vacuna de refuerzo contra el Covid-19

A través de recursos educativos y actividades comunitarias, la Fundación promueve la vacunación y difunde información confiable.

Las vacunas de refuerzo actualizadas, también conocidas como "vacunas booster" o "booster booster", son una medida preventiva muy eficaz contra el Covid-19, ya que han sido modificadas para protegernos de las nuevas variantes que circulan en la actual temporada de invierno 2022. Estas vacunas protegen específicamente contra las más recientes variantes Omicron BA.4 y BA.5. Otro de los beneficios de las vacunas booster es que no solamente brindan una nueva barrera de protección sino que ayudan a reforzar la inmunidad creada por vacunas recibidas anteriormente.

Con alrededor de 250,000 nuevos casos de Covid-19 por semana en los Estados Unidos, la pandemia causada por este virus no se ha ido. Además, con la llegada de la temporada invernal y las bajas temperaturas, se pronostica que los nuevos casos y las hospitalizaciones aumenten considerablemente. Es por esto que los Centros para la Prevención y Control de Enfermedades, o CDC, recomiendan a todas las personas mayores de 6 años o más acudir a su centro de salud y solicitar el refuerzo booster o el esquema regular de vacunación si es que no lo ha hecho hasta ahora. También se recomienda la vacuna contra la influenza estacional para prevenir la enfermedad crónica.

La vacunación oportuna es incluso más importante para personas que sufren de condiciones de salud pre-existentes, ya que estas pueden agravar los síntomas y la probabilidad de muerte. Algunas de las condiciones más comunes son la hipertensión, la diabetes y las enfermedades cardíacas. Si usted tiene dudas acerca de su historial de vacunación, condiciones de salud pre-existentes o sobre los beneficios de la vacuna contra el covid, le invitamos a acercarse a su centro de salud o farmacia local para obtener mayor información.

La National Hispanic Health Foundation es la rama educativa y científica de la National Hispanic Medical Association (NHMA). A través de sus programas de activación comunitaria y herramientas educativas han ayudado a que las comunidades latinas en los Estados Unidos tengan información precisa así como acceso a la vacunación. Si desea aprender más sobre el trabajo que hace la NHMF para mejorar la salud de las comunidades latinas, puede entrar a www.nhmfoundation.org

NHMF
National Hispanic Health Foundation

Mantenerse cerca de tus raíces hace que tu salud florezca.

El Center For Elders' Independence está aquí para ayudarte a florecer con nuestro plan de salud PACE, servicios personalizados que ayudan a las personas mayores a vivir seguros e independientes en casa, porque en casa es donde tu salud florece.

Las personas de 55 años o más, que viven con una condición de salud, pueden confiar en nuestros cuidados médicos, dentales y para la vista. Además, servicios adicionales como transporte, gimnasio, actividades en grupo y más. Todo sin deducibles.

Center for Elders' Independence
Your life just got better

Llama al 844-326-1150 o visita Elders.org y descubre si calificas para el plan PACE

BART
ba

Title VI Process: Public Input Received (CPI Fare Increase)

- Oppose:

- Minority: *“As it is I don’t make enough to cover the fare to get to school. I’m a full time student and part time employee and the more the prices go up I won’t be able to afford to go to school”*
- Low-Income: *“I live on a limited income for a family of 4. I am the sole provider. Any little increase in anything affects me and my family. Therefore, I oppose the fare hike.”*

- Support:

- Minority: *“I know it wouldn’t have much financial impact on me but I imagine it may have a negative strong financial impact on others but I think it’s important to upkeep the services and trains/platforms”*
- Low-Income: *“It would be hard for me since I’m low income but it’s better than the fare increasing all at once”*

- Miscellaneous/General Comments about BART:

- Minority: *“BART service and security really needs improvement”*
- Low-Income: *“Need more security on the BART train and surrounding area”*

Title VI Process: Public Input Received (Clipper[®] STARTSM)

- Oppose:
 - Minority: *“I barely make over low income and I am already struggling to pay the fare.”*
 - Low-Income: *“Public transport should be affordable for all, not just a few.”*
- Support:
 - Minority: *“As a person who takes BART w/ discounted fare (youth card) it really helps me”*
 - Low-Income: *“Yes if you do that then it will help me a lot as I am a student and have to manage my expenses.”*
- Miscellaneous/General Comments about BART:
 - Minority: *“It shows that BART is considerate for those in need and for those who are unable to have a financial stable life.”*
 - Low-Income: *“Please make the fares reasonable and consistent for all riders, and do not unfairly shift the burden to others.”*

Title VI Findings: DI/DB Analysis – CPI Fare Increase (Analysis 1)

Fare Increase	Proposed Increase 2024	Proposed Increase 2025	Disparate Impact (Y/N)	Disproportionate Burden (Y/N)
CPI Fare Increase	Up to 5.5%	Up to 5.5%	No	No

- Public input indicated general opposition.
- Protected riders are more likely to indicate **personal impacts** than non-minority and non-low-income respondents, respectively.

Title VI Findings: DI/DB Analysis – Clipper® STARTSM (Analysis 2)

Discount Program	Existing Discount	Proposed Discount	Disparate Impact (Y/N)	Disproportionate Burden (Y/N)
Clipper® START SM Discount Pilot Program	20%	50%	No	No

- Public input indicates that riders favor the Clipper® STARTSM discount pilot program increase

Motion

- The Board of Directors approves the Title VI Fare Equity Analysis for:
 - BART's productivity-adjusted inflation-based fare increase for two fare increases up to 5.5% each in January 2024 and January 2025
 - Increasing the Metropolitan Transportation Commission's (MTC) Regional Means-Based Transit Fare Discount (Clipper[®] STARTSM) from 20% to 50% off BART fares

Appendices

Title VI Process: Public Input Received

(CPI Fare Increase)

- **Q1: Would you support or oppose the two proposed fare increases (up to 5.5% each) to keep up with the cost of providing BART service?**

	Total Oppose (Strongly + Somewhat)	Neutral	Total Support (Strongly + Somewhat)	Don't Know	Sample Size (n)
Minority	61%	11%	28%	0%	775
Non-Minority	45%	8%	46%	1%	378
Low-Income	62%	11%	25%	1%	273
Non-Low-Income	54%	10%	36%	0%	881
TOTAL	57%	10%	33%	0%	1,248

<i>Comparison to prior*</i>	Minority		Low-Income	
	Support	Don't Support	Support	Don't Support
Fare Increase Year				
2024 & 2025 (current)	28%	61%	25%	62%
2022	20%	67%	25%	62%

* Per Title VI Report "Title VI Fare Equity Analysis for the Proposed 2022 Productivity-Adjusted Inflation-Based Fare Increase"
<https://www.bart.gov/sites/default/files/docs/Title%20VI%20Fare%20Equity%20Analysis.July%202022%20CPI%20Fare%20Increase.pdf>



Title VI Process: Public Input Received

(Increasing Clipper[®] STARTSM Discount from 20% to 50%)

- **Q4: Would you support or oppose a larger discount for Clipper[®] STARTSM users (eligible low-income riders) -- from 20% off BART fares to 50% off BART fares?**

	Total Oppose (Strongly + Somewhat)	Neutral	Total Support (Strongly + Somewhat)	Don't Know	Sample Size (n)
Minority	16%	15%	69%	1%	774
Non-Minority	14%	13%	72%	1%	378
Low-Income	11%	10%	78%	1%	272
Non-Low-Income	17%	16%	66%	1%	882
TOTAL	17%	15%	68%	1%	1,250