

San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District

Measure RR Program

BART Bond Oversight Committee

Friday, September 20, 2024

9:30 AM – 12:00 PM

Draft Minutes

Agenda Item	Meeting Notes
1. Call to Order	9:30am Chair McGill calls meeting to order
A. Roll Call	Staff conducts roll call. Shrawagi absent. All other members present.
2. Public Comment	Aleta Dupree made a comment expressing the importance of Bond Oversight Committee and need to ensure a state of good repair to prevent service disruptions. No written public comment was received. No comments on Zoom.
3. Administrative Items <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Meeting Minutesb. Review of Tentative Schedule for 2025 – 2026 Termc. Discuss AB 1234 Ethics Training Schedule	Committee Member Stewart, request edits to meeting minutes item 7 Future Agenda Items & Questions/Committee Member Announcements to clarify the comment/question that was made to include the tools, processes and documentation used to manage risk like the shortfall in funding. No additional comments were received on the meeting minutes. Motion approve June Minutes with changes Loosen. Second Wang. Roll Call Vote. Motion Passes. 3 Yes, 1 Abstain 1 Absent Russell, Measure RR Program Manager, introduced the 2025-2026 calendar and the calendar will be voted on during January 2025 meeting. Committee members will provide comments via email. Russell introduced the AB 1234 Ethics Training. Training is required every 2 years BART Bond Oversight Committee Host training typically during the month of April. 2hr training. All members expressed that they have been trained within the last two years.

	<p>Russell will provide training in April for any new members to the committee.</p>
<p>4. Annual Report Committee Debrief July 11th Board Presentation</p>	<p>Committee Member Rosenthal provided an overview of the July 11th presentation of the Annual Report to the BART Board of Directors and described the subcommittee process of working with staff. The goal this year was to take a fresh look at the report, reorganize it, make it accessible, and add detail when possible. This was well received by BART Directors.</p> <p>Feedback received from the Directors was very positive, around accessibility and that the report is a very useful document. Some challenges that were expressed showed a desire to dig deeper and conduct a proactive analysis of Measure RR. The landscape of transit systems has changed and now is an opportune time to reflect on how we are adjusting post pandemic. Consider doing some exploration, set aside time to take the opportunity to ask is BART changing its priorities for Measure RR, can we show that Measure RR is dynamic? Step back and look at the big picture, since we are halfway done, and we are at a different place since when we got started.</p> <p>Rosenthal recommends reappointment of 2024 subcommittee members to 2025 Annual report subcommittee.</p> <p>Committee Member Wang, for future format recommends more data visualization, more accessible data. Where the public can just click to access or link directly to a certain project. More interaction with the public.</p> <p>Sylvia Lamb, Assistant General Manager Infrastructure Delivery, we will also look into updating the Measure RR website to make it more user friendly</p> <p>Chris Filippi, BART Communications, suggest the Annual Report subcommittee meet before next year to begin incorporating suggestions.</p> <p>Rosenthal, suggests a workshop to discuss priorities and the current landscape. How does the drop in ridership affect priorities? How does</p>

	<p>the RR program adjust to the new landscape, are some projects moved up or moved down in priorities? This is not a deep dive subcommittee topic and is important for the entire committee to be engaged in this discussion.</p> <p>Stewart, suggest that it would be helpful to dig deeper and ensure we are doing our due diligence.</p> <p>Committee Member Loosen, seconds Rosenthal's suggestion for a deeper look at how BART is dealing with ridership changes and landscape now as compared to 2019. This is something that we should be aware of. How is BART positioning itself for a future bond measure?</p> <p>Wang, agrees with the proactive analysis we need to look forward and with a broader prospective. We can look at environmental justice on specific projects.</p> <p>Lamb, The BART Board of Directors hosts a workshop once a year. We could plan a workshop style format for the Bond Oversight Committee.</p> <p>Russell, committee members can provide a list of topics that they would like covered in the workshop.</p> <p>Stewart, can we provide a presentation on the overall funding shortage for BART and other transportation organizations in the United States, so that we can compare them and understand if issues are BART-specific or are common to other agencies?</p> <p>Chair McGill agrees to do a workshop to identify parts of Measure RR that don't make sense anymore or need more detail. Once this is identified it can be taken back to the BART Board for direction on how to move forward with addressing them.</p> <p>Lamb, Capital Improvement Program will be presented to the BART Board on September 26th. A portion of the workshop can include funding,</p>
--	---

	<p>Capital Improvement Program (CIP), and fiscal cliff.</p> <p>Chair McGill, in December there will be new BART Board Directors. Can the committee participate in the onboarding so that the committee is up to speed with the BART Board?</p> <p>Motion to reappoint subcommittee members include: Shrawagi (Subcommittee Chair), Loosen, Rosenthal for 2025 Annual Report Committee made by Rosenthal. Second made by Stewart, Roll Call Vote. 5 Yes, 0 Abstain, 1 Absent. Motion Passes.</p>
5. Measure RR BART Safety, Reliability and Traffic Relief Program Presentation	<p>Rachel Russell, Measure RR Program Manager, presented the Bond Oversight Committee Framework quarterly agenda.</p> <p>Joy Sharma, Chief Delivery Officer, presented an overview of the Annual Review of the Measure RR program.</p>
A. Measure RR Overall Progress	<p>Russell, presented an overview of Measure RR Project Success for 2023-2024.</p> <p>Stewart, asked for clarification on how Cost Performance Index (CPI) and Schedule Performance Index (SPI) is impacted when a new project is added.</p> <p>Lamb, provided clarification on how new projects are added. Planned spending is in the program level. The CPI and SPI does not increase because the project is added. It increased because the overall program is performing well.</p> <p>Rosenthal, on the Program Level Schedule Update slide 7, we show the projection/forecast going out to 2038, we don't do that on the RR Overall Program Budget Progress slide 5. I'm wondering if at the rate we are going will we level off and start to come down? Suggest extending graph on RR Overall Program Budget Progress slide 5 to show the trajectory.</p> <p>Lamb, suggest an alternative on RR Overall Program Budget Progress slide 5, this slide is meant to show how we are handling the tranches. It might be helpful on slide 6 Measure</p>

	<p>RR Cashflow, to add a column that shows when we expect each program to be completed.</p> <p>Rosenthal, agrees with the suggested approach and recommends changing the title of RR Overall Program Budget Progress slide 5 to Management of Revenue and Spending.</p> <p>Loosen, ask if “Drill Down” means details. Can we change the term “Drill Down” to “Detail” slide? This could help make it clearer to the public.</p> <p>Lamb, suggests the Deep Dive Committee take a look at the drill-down slides to see if they are still needed or if data should be conveyed differently.</p> <p>Rosenthal agrees with Loosen on amending the term “drill” down.</p> <p>Rosenthal points out that the comments on the Relieve Crowding slide are helpful to provide context on the project and program priorities.</p>
B. 10-Minute Break	6 min break
C. Measure RR Program Updates a. Office of Civil Rights	<p>Joseph Towner, Manager of Program Planning Support presented an update on Office of Civil Rights Small Business Outreach.</p> <p>Wang asked what the attendance is for the online meetings.</p> <p>Towner responded that attendance depends on the topic. For popular topics we see about 80-90 attendees.</p> <p>Stewart, mentioned that she attended a Small Business event and felt it was very helpful.</p>
D. Program Status & Milestones	<p>Rachel Russell, Measure RR Program Manager presented the Program Status & Milestones.</p> <p>Wang, regarding renew crowding in the drill down the comments regarding the East Storage Yard. Will the project evaluation affect the milestones?</p> <p>Lamb, the value engineering analysis is part of what added this comment on the watchlist. There is RR funding but this project is also funded by Federal Transit Administration (FTA) and there is a</p>

	<p>funding gap that we will need to figure out before moving forward.</p> <p>Loosen, Station Access Status and Milestones slide 33, the milestone for 19th Street Access Improvement Project, why is this on hold.</p> <p>Russell, explained that this project has been placed on hold to reevaluate the need of bike station.</p> <p>Rosenthal, how many years will the 18 shutdowns occur over for the Renew track program?</p> <p>Russell, responded that 18 shutdowns will occur over 3 years.</p> <p>Filippi, provided response on feedback received during the 1st shutdown. The plan is still to have 18 shutdowns over 3 years. Whenever shutdowns are postponed, there are notifications to the public.</p> <p>Lamb, explained the complexity of the shutdown in this specific area. Staff are taking lessons learned from the first shutdown and will implement those lessons learned moving forward. We've received positive feedback on the first shutdown. The pause is not because of any negative feedback that was received. We paused to see if there are ways we can make the work more efficient.</p> <p>Chair McGill, asked if the transponders are a major component to ensure trains can move closer together.</p> <p>Lamb, responded that the transponders are a key element in train control and communications to Operations Control Center (OCC), and other trains, and will allow us to move beyond the fixed block systems.</p> <p>Chair McGill asked what the next steps are for Link21 deep dive committee.</p> <p>Stewart, explained that there are remaining discussions scheduled to review the Link21 dashboard to understand how money has been</p>
--	--

	<p>spent and the plan moving forward. There is a deep dive subcommittee meeting scheduled at the end of September.</p> <p>Chair McGill, isn't BART the lead for the Link21 effort but we don't pay for everything how does that work?</p> <p>Lamb explained that BART is taking the lead on planning efforts, but future phases will include other funding.</p> <p>Chair McGill asked if the fire protection requirements such as PFAS are impacting the fire suppression projects.</p> <p>Lamb, explained that we will need to look directly at the projects to see if these requirements are having an impact on the cost. We are keeping a close eye on these projects and we are doing ok on the mechanical projects at this point.</p>
6. Future Agenda Items & Questions	<p>Russell, Measure RR Program Manager, provided an update on member elections. Applications were extended to September 13. Next step is interviews and seek Board approval in December.</p> <p>Russell provided an overview of upcoming meetings, including workshops, committee procedures, 2025 Annual Report, and Project Site Tours.</p> <p>Stewart expressed interest in seeing bicycle channels at 19th and 12th Street or in San Francisco.</p>
7. Committee Member Announcements	None.
8. General Public Comment	<p>Aleta Dupree provided public comment. Suggest that we revise the term "Drill Down". Aleta discussed the need for fire suppression facilities and appreciates the information about the Small Business and Disadvantaged communities.</p> <p>Introduction of Charlie Castillo, AGM Administration.</p> <p>Chair McGill suggest we explain the terminology that we use. (drill down, frogs, milestones, etc.)</p> <p>No comments were received on zoom.</p>

9. Adjournment	Meeting Adjourned at 11:30 am.
----------------	--------------------------------