

# **San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District**

2150 Webster Street, P. O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94612-2688



## **BOARD OF DIRECTORS MINUTES OF THE 1,941<sup>ST</sup> MEETING THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 28, 2023**

Members of the Board of Directors  
Janice Li, President (District 8)  
Mark Foley, Vice President (District 2)  
Debora Allen (District 1)  
Rebecca Saltzman (District 3)  
Robert Raburn (District 4)  
John McPartland (District 5)  
Elizabeth Ames (District 6)  
Lateefah Simon (District 7)  
Bevan Dufty (District 9)

Adopted: January 25, 2024

## **MEETING DESCRIPTION**

A Regular Meeting of the Board of Directors was held on September 28, 2023, convening at 9:03 a.m. in the BART Board Room, 2150 Webster Street, 1st Floor, Oakland, California. President Li presided, April B. A. Quintanilla, District Secretary.

### **1. CALL TO ORDER**

President Li called the Meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

#### **A. Roll Call.**

Directors Present in Oakland: Directors Ames, Dufty, Foley, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, Simon, and Li.

Directors Present via Teleconference: None.

Absent: None. Director Allen entered the Meeting later.

#### **B. Pledge of Allegiance. Director McPartland led the Pledge of Allegiance.**

#### **C. Introduction of Special Guests. No Special Guests were introduced.**

### **2. REPORT OF THE BOARD PRESIDENT**

President Li brought the item before the Board. President Li announced that agenda items would likely be moved due to a ribbon cutting event on BART land at the Balboa Park upper yard.

### **3. BOARD COMMITTEE REPORTS**

President Li called for Board Committee Reports. Director Dufty, Chairperson of the Audit Committee, provided a report of the Audit Committee meeting held on September 19, 2023. Director Dufty noted that the Committee heard four presentations from the Office of the Inspector General and that the Committee meeting schedule was changed from meeting monthly to every other month. Director Dufty also indicated that Member Tammy Willis had concluded her term serving on the Audit Committee and thanked her for her contributions.

Director Saltzman requested that the recruitment information for the vacant Audit Committee public member seat be provided to the Board.

### **4. BOARD MATTERS (Part I)**

#### **A. Resolution Commending Matthew Burrows.**

President Li brought the item before the Board.

Robert Powers, General Manager, and Jeana Zelan Peterson, Associate General Counsel, presented the item.

General Manager Powers presented General Counsel Burrows with a commemorative crystal train and

Matthew Burrows, General Counsel, thanked the Board and gave remarks.

Director Allen entered the Meeting in Oakland.

#### Public Comment

Aleta Dupree addressed the Board.

Director Raburn moved that Resolution No. 5573, Resolution Commending Matthew Burrows, be adopted.

Director Dufty seconded the motion.

#### Action

Upon motion by Director Raburn and second by Director Dufty, Resolution No. 5573, Resolution Commending Matthew Burrows, was adopted by unanimous roll call vote.

#### *Vote Summary:*

*Moved / Seconded: Director Raburn / Director Dufty*

*Aye: Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, Simon, and Li.*

*No: 0.*

*Abstain: 0.*

*Absent: 0.*

*Result: 9-0, motion carried by unanimous roll call vote.*

A photo was taken with General Counsel Burrows, Board Members, and staff.

#### Discussion

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Vice President Foley expressed appreciation for the conversations he had with General Counsel Burrows and the advice he provided, and he wished him a good retirement.

Director Raburn acknowledged General Counsel Burrows' accomplishments and contributions to the Capitol Corridor Joint Powers Authority, noting that he wrote the Joint Powers Agreement that transferred the Capitol Corridor service from Caltrain to BART. Director Raburn also thanked General Counsel Burrows for the smooth transition he has enabled.

Director Simon commented on General Counsel Burrows' deep care and love for people and BART and noted that he oversaw deep issues with law enforcement and handled them with integrity.

Director Ames thanked General Counsel Burrows for his responsiveness to her questions throughout her time on the Board and expressed how much he will be missed.

Director Saltzman noted that there has been a lot of change at BART and thanked General Counsel Burrows for being the constant throughout.

Director Allen shared a memory of her first meeting with General Counsel Burrows after being elected to the Board and thanked him for his brief and concise legal advice.

Director McPartland expressed that he had the pleasure of working with General Counsel Burrows for the longest amount of time and thanked him for the interpersonal relationship and trust that they formed.

Director Dufty thanked General Counsel Burrows for the teachings he gave him and expressed how much he enjoyed their conversations.

President Li expressed that General Counsel Burrows had always done what was best for BART and the Bay Area during his 27 years of service.

5. **CONSENT CALENDAR (Part I)**

*Item 5 was heard in two parts, once after Item 4-A, Resolution Commending Matthew Burrows, and again after Item 11-A, Modifications to Bikes on BART Rules.*

President Li brought the following Consent Calendar items before the Board.

- A. Approval of Minutes of the Meetings of April 13, 2023 and April 27, 2023.
- B. Purchase of Rubrik Software Expanded Software License Subscription Term from ePlus Technology, Inc.
- C. Amendment to Agreement No. 6M4424, with Foster and Foster Consulting Actuaries, Inc., to Extend the Term of the Agreement.
- D. Amendments to Agreement No. 6M4600, with Athens Administrators, Inc., to Extend the Agreement and Increase Funding and to Agreement Nos. 6M4601, with CareWorks Managed Care Services, Inc., and 6M4599A, with Genex Services, LLC, to Extend the Agreements.
- E. Amendment to Statement of Investment Policy for Retiree Health Benefit Trust and Approval to Implement the Updated Policy.
- F. Resolution Declaring Official Intent to Reimburse Certain Expenditures from Proceeds of Indebtedness.
- G. Change Order to Contract No. 01RQ-101, Hayward Maintenance Complex (Phase 2) Trackwork Procurement, with voestalpine Railway Systems Nortrak, Inc., for One Modified No. 08 Track Crossover.
- H. System Development Policy.
- I. Amendment to Fiscal Year 2023 Elevator Attendant Agreement.

J. BART Police Administrative Headquarters Title VI Siting Analysis Report.

Director Ames requested that Item 5-F, Resolution Declaring Official Intent to Reimburse Certain Expenditures from Proceeds of Indebtedness, be removed from the Consent Calendar.

President Li announced that Item 5-E, Amendment to Statement of Investment Policy for Retiree Health Benefit Trust and Approval to Implement the Updated Policy, would be continued to a future Board Meeting.

Director Dufty moved to approve all Consent Calendar items, except Items 5-E and 5-F, by one motion.

Director McPartland seconded the motion.

Public Comment

No comments were received.

Action

Upon motion by Director Dufty and second by Director McPartland, the Board took the following actions by unanimous roll call vote.

*Vote Summary:*

*Moved / Seconded: Director Dufty / Director McPartland*

*Aye: Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, Simon, and Li.*

*No: 0.*

*Abstain: 0.*

*Absent: 0.*

*Result: 9-0, motion carried by unanimous roll call vote.*

- A. The Minutes of the Meetings of April 13, 2023 and April 27, 2023, were approved. *(Vote: 9-0)*
- B. The General Manager was authorized to purchase a Rubrik Software expanded software license subscription term from ePlus for an amount not to exceed \$748,324.40. *(Vote: 9-0)*
- C. The General Manager was authorized to execute an amendment to Agreement No. 6M4424 with Foster and Foster Consulting Actuaries, Inc. for actuarial consulting services to extend the term of the Agreement for a period of one year from October 17, 2023, to October 16, 2024. *(Vote: 9-0)*
- D. The General Manager was authorized to execute amendments to extend the following agreements to May 1, 2024 at no additional cost to the District: Agreement No. 6M4601 for Utilization and Bill Review Services with CareWorks Managed Care Services, Inc.; and Agreement No. 6M4599A for Medical Case Management Services with Genex Services, LLC. Furthermore, the General Manager was authorized to execute an amendment to extend Agreement No. 6M4600 for Third-Party Administration (TPA) with Athens Administrators, Inc. to May 1, 2024 and increase the funding from \$6,060,652.00 to \$6,438,702.00. *(Vote: 9-0)*

- G. The General Manager was authorized to execute Change Order No. 009 to Contract No. 01RQ-101, Hayward Maintenance Complex (Phase 2) Trackwork Procurement, in the Amount not to exceed \$420,000.00. *(Vote: 9-0)*
- H. The attached System Development Policy was adopted. (The System Development Policy is attached and hereby made a part of these Minutes). *(Vote: 9-0)*
- I. The Board authorized the General Manager to execute an amendment to the Agreement with Urban Alchemy for Attendant services in an amount not to exceed \$540,000.00. *(Vote: 9-0)*
- J. The Board of Directors approved the “Title VI BART Police Department (BPD) Admin HQ Siting Analysis.” *(Vote: 9-0)*

President Li announced that the order of agenda items would be changed.

## 12. **CLOSED SESSION**

*Item 12 was heard after Part I of Item 5, Consent Calendar.*

### A. CONFERENCE WITH LABOR NEGOTIATORS

Designated Representatives: Robert Powers, General Manager; Michael Jones, Deputy General Manager; and David Coleman, Director of Labor Relations

Employee Organizations: Amalgamated Transit Union, Local 1555; American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees, Local 3993; BART Police Officers' Association; BART Police Managers' Association; Service Employees International Union, Local 1021, BART Chapter; Service Employees International Union, Local 1021, BART Professional Chapter; and Unrepresented Employees (Positions: All)

Government Code Section: 54957.6

### B. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL – ANTICIPATED LITIGATION

Initiation of litigation pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(4): one case

President Li brought the item before the Board and indicated that the Board would enter into Closed Session under Items 12-A (Conference with Labor Negotiators) and 12-B (Conference with Legal Counsel – Anticipated Litigation) of the Regular Meeting agenda.

#### Public Comment

No comments were received.

The Board Meeting recessed at 9:40 a.m.

---

The Board reconvened in Closed Session at 9:41 a.m.

Directors Present in Oakland: Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, Simon, and Li.

Directors Present via Teleconference: None.

Absent: None.

The Board Meeting recessed at 11:10 a.m.

---

---

### **13. OPEN SESSION**

The Board reconvened in Open Session at 11:12 a.m.

Directors Present in Oakland: Directors Ames, Foley, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, Simon, and Li.

Directors Present via Teleconference: None.

Absent: None. Directors Allen and Dufty entered the Meeting later.

A. Announcements from Closed Session, if any.

President Li announced that the Board had concluded its Closed Session under Items 12-A and 12-B and that there were no announcements to be made.

### **11. BOARD MATTERS (Part II)**

*Item 11-A was heard after part one of Item 13, Open Session.*

A. Modifications to Bikes on BART Rules. (Director Saltzman's request.)

President Li brought the item before the Board.

Director Saltzman presented the item.

Director Dufty entered the Meeting in Oakland.

Director Allen entered the Meeting in Oakland.

Director Saltzman moved that the proposed modifications to the Bikes on BART Rules policy be adopted.

President Li seconded the motion.

Public Comment

The following individuals addressed the Board:

Jerry Grace  
Glenn Overton  
Adina Levin  
Jon Spangler  
Robert Prinz

### Discussion

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Director Allen inquired about data regarding accident rates involving bicycles on escalators and expressed concern about allowing bigger bikes on escalators and, ultimately, rail cars. Director Allen also expressed intent to abstain from voting on this item as she had not seen the redlined version of the policy and concern about public safety regarding carrying bicycles on escalators and stairs.

Vice President Foley indicated that the proposed modifications should have first been presented to the BART Bicycle Task Force before the Board. Vice President Foley also expressed safety concerns for other riders when stations have narrow escalators, such as those at the 19<sup>th</sup> Street, Antioch, and Oakland Airport Connector Stations, and proposed a friendly amendment to exclude those stations from the escalator provision of the modified policy and direct staff to place signage at these stations advising of the prohibition of bicycles on escalators at these stations.

Directors Saltzman and Li accepted Vice President Foley's friendly amendment.

Director McPartland expressed safety concerns about having bicycles on escalators and suggested that there is a greater risk to other riders if someone were to lose control of their bicycle.

Director McPartland made a substitute motion to adopt only Items 2 (Bikes are allowed on all trains except in the first car or any crowded car), 3 (Bicyclists must hold or secure their bikes while on the trains), and 4 (Not riding bikes in stations, prohibiting gas-powered vehicles in BART stations and on BART trains, and proper bike storage rules for inside stations) of the proposed policy modifications.

Director Ames seconded Director McPartland's substitute motion.

Director Ames expressed concern about having bicycles on escalators and asked for clarification on incidents involving bicycles on escalators.

President Li noted that, as a regular BART and bicycle commuter, the status quo is to carry your bike up and down stairs regardless of the width of the stairs. President Li expressed discomfort with excluding e-bikes from the policy and support for the original motion, as amended by Vice President Foley.

Director Saltzman shared additional statistics involving escalators and encouraged her colleagues to vote against the substitute motion.



### Action

Upon motion by Director McPartland and seconded by Director Ames, the substitute motion to adopt only Items 2 (Bikes are allowed on all trains except in the first car or any crowded car), 3 (Bicyclists must hold or secure their bikes while on the trains), and 4 (Not riding bikes in stations, prohibiting gas-powered vehicles in BART stations and on BART trains, and proper bike storage rules for inside stations) of the proposed policy modifications failed by roll call vote.

#### *Vote Summary:*

*Moved / Seconded: Director McPartland / Director Ames*

*Aye: Directors Allen, Ames, and McPartland.*

*No: Directors Dufty, Foley, Raburn, Saltzman, Simon, and Li.*

*Abstain: 0.*

*Absent: 0.*

*Result: 3-6, motion failed by roll call vote.*

### Discussion

Discussion continued, with the following highlights:

Director Raburn indicated that the modified policy is warranted and that people who cannot carry their bicycles up and down stairs need the additional option of the escalator. Director Raburn also suggested that the exclusion of any stations was unnecessary, as there is no data that suggests that narrower escalators are a greater danger to others, and that because the escalators are narrow, there is no passing or blocking pedestrians and no danger to others. Director Raburn expressed a desire for the Board to approve a universal rule and not a rule that excludes some escalators.

Vice President Foley commented on the number of incidents with bicycles on escalators while it is prohibited.

### Action

Upon motion by Director Saltzman, second by President Li, and amendment by Vice President Foley, the proposed modifications to the “Bikes on BART Rules” policy were adopted and the 19<sup>th</sup> Street, Antioch, and Oakland Airport Connector Stations were excluded from the modified policy, by roll call vote.

#### *Vote Summary:*

*Moved / Seconded: Director Saltzman/ President Li*

*Aye: Directors Dufty, Foley, Raburn, Saltzman, Simon, and Li.*

*No: Directors Allen and McPartland.*

*Abstain: Director Ames.*

*Absent: 0*

*Result: 6-2-1, motion carried by roll call vote.*

President Li indicated that Vice President Foley would preside over the remainder of the Meeting.

## 5. CONSENT CALENDAR (Part II)

*Item 5 was heard in two parts, once after Item 4-A, Resolution Commending Matthew Burrows, and again after Item 11-A, Modifications to Bikes on BART Rules.*

Vice President Foley brought Item 5-F, Resolution Declaring Official Intent to Reimburse Certain Expenditures from Proceeds of Indebtedness, before the Board.

### Discussion

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Director Ames explained her request to remove the item from the Consent Calendar and asked clarifying questions about the nature of the item and the origin of the \$950 million.

Director Allen asked clarifying questions about the nature of the programs and how issuing bonds for reimbursement for capital expenditures help the operating budget and commented on the Board's prior approval of a similar program versus the current request. Director Allen also expressed concern about not receiving project-by-project detail and the request for broad authorization and indicated that she would not support the request without receiving specific information.

Director Dufty moved that Resolution No. 5574, Resolution of the San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District Declaring Official Intent to Reimburse Certain Expenditures from Proceeds of Indebtedness, be adopted.

Director Raburn seconded the motion.

Director Raburn noted that the Internal Revenue Service (IRS) requires that BART indicate an intention for reimbursement prior to the expenditure of any funds.

### Public Comment

Glenn Overton addressed the Board.

### Action

Upon motion by Director Dufty and seconded by Director Raburn, Resolution No. 5574, Resolution of the San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District Declaring Official Intent to Reimburse Certain Expenditures from Proceeds of Indebtedness, was adopted by roll call vote.

*Vote Summary:*

*Moved / Seconded: Director Dufty / Director Raburn*

*Aye: Directors Dufty, Foley, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, Simon, and Li.*

*No: Directors Allen and Ames.*

*Abstain: 0.*

*Absent: 0.*

*Result: 7-2, motion carried by roll call vote.*

President Li exited the Meeting.

6. **GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORT**

- A. Report of Activities, including Updates of Operational, Administrative, and Roll Call for Introductions Items.

General Manager Powers reported on the steady increase of ridership during the week and the Not One More Girl initiative.

**Public Comment**

Aleta Dupree addressed the Board.

**Discussion**

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Director Saltzman inquired whether there was a plan to present an update to the Board regarding the train resizing and suggested that the update should be made available to the public as well.

Director Raburn noted that his constituents have been writing to him asking for larger trains and indicated that BART is being responsive, as he saw an 8-car train shortly after reading those customer comments. Director Raburn also suggested that BART needs to continue the reminders as to why train cars were shortened in the first place.

Director Ames requested an update regarding the A-Line tree removal project and thanked staff for agreeing to save three large eucalyptus trees that are now used as a perch area for Bald Eagles.

Director Dufty thanked staff for the trains being so much cleaner and noted that he is observing the public's appreciation of this as well.

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Vice President Foley called for general Public Comment, an opportunity for members of the public to address the Board of Directors on matters under their jurisdiction and not on the agenda.

Glenn Overton and Aleta Dupree addressed the Board.

8. **ADMINISTRATION ITEMS**  
**Director Dufty, Chairperson**

Director Dufty, Chairperson of the Administration Committee, had no report and no items were presented.

9. **ENGINEERING AND OPERATIONS ITEMS**  
**Director Foley, Chairperson**

- A. BART's Annual Surveillance Report – 2023.

Vice President Foley, Chairperson of the Engineering and Operations Committee, brought the item before the Board.

#### Public Comment

Aleta Dupree addressed the Board.

#### Discussion

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Director Raburn congratulated Kevin Franklin, Interim Chief of Police, for receiving a glowing letter from the Secure Justice Group. Director Raburn inquired about how Automatic License Plate Readers (ALPR) were being used for policing and parking management.

Director Dufty echoed appreciation for the letter received by the BART Police Department from Secure Justice.

Director Raburn moved that BART's Board of Directors determines and finds, based on the information provided in the 2023 Surveillance Annual Report, that the benefits to the community of using the seven (7) surveillance technologies described in the report outweigh the costs associated with their use, and that civil liberties and civil rights are, concurrent with their use, adequately safeguarded by the policies adopted; and that the Board approves upon the stated findings the continued use of the seven (7) surveillance technologies described in the 2023 Surveillance Annual Report.

Director Dufty seconded the motion.

Director Allen inquired whether there were projects to improve surveillance inside of the parking lots, as property damage within parking lots has been increasing. Director Allen noted that BART should be able to secure the property of our patrons while they utilize our service.

Vice President Foley also commended the Bart Police Department for its work. Vice President Foley indicated that anything BART can do to improve surveillance in our garages would be beneficial to welcoming back riders who want to feel as though their personal property is safe as they take BART. Vice President Foley also inquired whether BART Police phone services could be expanded to the Antioch-Pittsburg Transfer Station.

#### Action

Upon motion by Director Raburn and second by Director Dufty, BART's Board of Directors determined and found, based on the information provided in the 2023 Surveillance Annual Report, that the benefits to the community of using the seven (7) surveillance technologies described in the report outweigh the costs associated with their use, and that civil liberties and civil rights are, concurrent with their use, adequately safeguarded by the policies adopted; and the Board approved upon the stated findings the continued use of the seven (7) surveillance technologies described in the 2023 Surveillance Annual Report by unanimous roll call vote.

*Vote Summary:*

*Moved / Seconded: Director Raburn / Director Dufty*

*Aye: Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon.*

*No: 0.*

*Abstain: 0.*

*Absent: President Li.*

*Result: 8-0, motion carried by unanimous roll call vote.*

B. Capital Programs and Project Status Update.

Vice President Foley brought the item before the Board.

Sylvia Lamb, Assistant General Manager, Infrastructure Delivery, and Mitra Moheb, Senior Manager of Engineering Programs, presented the item.

Public Comment

Aleta Dupree addressed the Board.

Discussion

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Director Allen inquired whether the Board would be receiving a detailed breakdown of the capital projects covered.

Director Ames thanked staff for breaking out capital projects and inquired about the status of capital projects that do not get funded. Director Ames requested that staff provide her with the Short-Range Transit Plan (SRTP) before Spring because it identifies projects that are in the backlog and expressed that she would like to know how the backlog relates to Resolution No. 5574 that was approved.

Director Raburn inquired about where the quarterly report, that would include additional capital project details, would be posted and encouraged staff to post it on bart.gov.

Director Allen inquired about the SRTP, the funding status of each item listed on that plan, and the funding deficits.

Action

No Board action was taken, as the item was presented for information only.

10. **PLANNING, PUBLIC AFFAIRS, ACCESS, AND LEGISLATION ITEMS**  
**Director Saltzman, Chairperson**

Director Saltzman, Chairperson of the Planning, Public Affairs, Access, and Legislation Committee, had no report and no items were presented.

**11. BOARD MATTERS (Part III)**

- B. Board Member Reports.
- C. Roll Call for Introductions.
- D. In Memoriam.

Vice President Foley called for Items 11-B, Board Member Reports; 11-C, Roll Call for Introductions; and 11-D, In Memoriam.

Director Salzman reported on attending an El Cerrito City Council meeting about the City's planned new library, which would be built at the El Cerrito Plaza BART Station.

Director Raburn reported on attending and presiding over the Capitol Corridor Joint Powers Authority Board meeting, where they approved the Fiscal Year 23/24 Service Plan and Budget. Director Raburn also reported that he had attended the Women in Transportation Scholarship Awards event and applauded the professionals at BART as well as Alameda County Supervisor Nate Miley's Public Safety Discussion.

Director Ames reported on working with Alameda County Creek Alliance and thanked BART for its assistance with a steelhead trout passageway and thanked staff for their efforts in preserving some of the trees used by local bald eagles.

Vice President Foley reported on giving a presentation at the Oakley City Council meeting regarding the status of BART.

**14. ADJOURNMENT**

The Meeting adjourned at 1:16 p.m.

April B. A. Quintanilla  
District Secretary

# System Development Policy

September 2023

## 1. Purpose

Future development of the San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) system must consider the continued growth and change of the region, and the role of the BART system in meeting the needs of the region and megaregion. This Policy is intended as a framework for BART to evaluate proposed new line extensions and stations as well as infill stations. Any major new system development project must provide clear, measurable benefits to the system and its riders, as well as demonstrate the ability to address the region's goals to grow transit ridership, address the climate emergency, improve mobility, and ensure equitable outcomes.

## 2. Goals and Objectives

- a) Support regional livability and a sustainable, equitable, and prosperous Bay Area.
  - i. Increase ridership and transit mode share via greater accessibility, connectivity, and service that complements changing travel patterns and serves transit dependent riders.
  - ii. Ensure transit-oriented communities bolster BART extensions and infill stations, help address the housing crisis, and improve the region's jobs/housing balance.
  - iii. Advance BART, state, and regional environmental goals by improving transit access to regional destinations, reducing vehicle miles traveled, and ensuring climate resiliency.
- b) Better serve communities and improve the rider experience.
  - i. Ensure equity by prioritizing the needs of transit-dependent riders, with special emphasis placed on communities who are or who have been systemically disenfranchised, traditionally marginalized, and harmed by past infrastructure projects.
  - ii. Improve multimodal connectivity with a focus on improved transit connectivity and active access modes.
  - iii. Improve rider experience by enhancing service reliability and connectivity, reducing crowding, and providing a safe and healthy environment.
- c) Support stewardship of the BART District and taxpayer investment.
  - i. Ensure the District's long-term financial sustainability by considering the benefits of system development through a comprehensive cost assessment that considers operational and maintenance cost and complexity, as well as core system operational and capital impacts.
  - ii. Deliver cost-effective improvements that meet riders' needs, employing technology and mode appropriate transit service, and leveraging other capital investments in transportation.
  - iii. Improve system performance without detracting from existing service or overburdening existing assets, providing systemwide benefits where feasible.

## 3. Implementation

### a) Strategies

The following Strategies support extensions and infill station project development consistent with the Goals and Objectives.

- i. Partnership with local jurisdictions: Partner with jurisdictions to achieve policy goals by ensuring transit-supportive land use policies, zoning and practices, anti-displacement policies and practices, climate adaptation planning, safe multimodal access to stations, and funding support.
- ii. Community involvement: Ensure that a unified process for co-creation and community engagement is central to the development of any system expansion and that this process begins at this early stage of the planning process, is inclusive of priority populations and emphasizes equitable outcomes. Engagement with local communities and businesses must recognize that historically disenfranchised communities have been underserved and negatively impacted by transit.

- iii. Iterative and comprehensive benefits evaluation: Project sponsors of new extensions and/or infill stations will coordinate with BART staff to develop a business case that evaluates cost-benefit and demonstrates comprehensive, equitable, and transparent measurable project benefits to the region and transit riders.
- iv. Funding: Projects will be consistent with applicable local, state, and federal funding programs' requirements to maximize the ability to receive funding. All projects must develop a funding plan as a part of the business case process.
- v. Innovation and efficiency: Projects should seek to reduce delivery time and cost via innovative approaches and should incorporate lessons learned from previous major projects.

#### b) Project Evaluation Process

Projects are to be led or supported by a Project Sponsor (e.g., BART, local jurisdictions, Metropolitan Planning Organizations, County Transportation Authorities). Figure 1 shows the steps in the process to advance Project Evaluation are described in greater detail below, and consist of the following:

- i. Project Initiation: Project initiation includes the project definition, policy assessment, and an initial evaluation of the strategic opportunity by assessing a project's consistency with relevant BART, regional, and federal policy and guidance (e.g., BART's Transit-Oriented Development Guidelines, Metropolitan Transportation Commission's Transit-Oriented Communities Policy, and Federal Transit Administration's Capital Investment Grant Program, among others). For projects that are consistent with the initial policy assessment, the Project Sponsor shall enter into an MOU with BART and relevant regional funding body to fund and complete a business case assessment on the proposed project.
- ii. Business Case Process: Each business case assessment will be an iterative analysis that consists of four cases, two of which (Strategic and Economic Cases) relate to the rationale for pursuing a project, and two of which (Financial and Deliverability and Operations Cases) relate to project implementation. The level of detail increases over time in relationship to the project development. At each decision point, the BART Board must approve the continuation of the project to the next stage. Projects that don't demonstrate sufficient comprehensive benefits will not advance.
- iii. Project/Program Advancement: After a project has been approved for advancement under the Final Business Case, additional board actions may be required to continue advancement, such as where project cost and/or scope have changed substantively. After the project is operational, there may also be a review of the actual project outcomes (e.g., costs and performance to provide lessons learned).

Figure 1. System Development Project Evaluation Process

