

San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District

2150 Webster Street, P. O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94612-2688



BOARD OF DIRECTORS DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 1,991TH MEETING THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 13, 2025

Members of the Board of Directors

Mark Foley, President (District 2)
Melissa Hernandez, Vice President (District 5)
Matthew Rinn (District 1)
Barnali Ghosh (District 3)
Robert Raburn (District 4)
Elizabeth Ames (District 6)
Victor Flores (District 7)
Janice Li (District 8)
Edward Wright (District 9)

MEETING DESCRIPTION

A Regular Meeting of the Board of Directors was held on November 13, 2025 in the BART Board Room, 2150 Webster Street, 1st Floor, Oakland, California. President Foley presided, with Bob Franklin as Interim District Secretary.

1. CALL TO ORDER

President Foley called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

A. Roll Call.

Directors Present in Oakland: Directors Flores, Ghosh, Li, Raburn, Rinn and Wright, Vice President Hernandez and President Foley.

Directors Present via Teleconference: Director Ames (under “Just Cause”)

Absent: None.

B. Pledge of Allegiance: Director Rinn led the Pledge of Allegiance.

C. Introduction of Special Guests. There were no special guests.

2. REPORT OF THE BOARD PRESIDENT

President Foley announced that there will be two more BART Board meetings this year. The meeting on December 4, 2025 will be the last business meeting of the year, followed by the December 18, 2025 meeting, which will be the annual holiday gathering with a toy drive and the election of Board Officers.

Public Comment

Barney Smits, Aleta Dupree and Roland addressed the Board.

3. BOARD COMMITTEE REPORTS

Director Rinn gave a report on the November 10, 2025 meeting of the Audit Committee, which included the Inspector General’s Fiscal Year 2025 Annual Report, the outlook for FY26-28, and a presentation on BART’s Investment Policy. Additional information on the meeting may be found here: [Audit Committee 11-10 Agenda and Details](#)

Director Raburn gave a report on the November 7, 2025 BART-VTA Joint Committee meeting in San Jose, which included a presentation on VTA’s BART Silicon Valley Phase II extension project. Additional information on the meeting may be found here: [BART - VTA 11-7 Agenda and Details](#)

Public Comment

Aleta Dupree, Roland, and Barney Smits addressed the Board.

4. CONSENT CALENDAR

President Foley brought the following Consent Calendar items before the Board.

- A. Approval of Minutes for the October 23, 2025 Meeting. *Board requested to authorize.*
- B. Approval of 2026 BART Board of Directors Meeting Calendar. *Board requested to authorize.*
- C. Director Appointment to SB 63 Oversight Committee. *Board requested to authorize.*

Public Comment

There were no public comments on this item.

Vote Summary

Moved by Director Rinn/ Seconded by Director Raburn.

Aye: Directors Ames, Flores, Ghosh, Li, Raburn, Rinn, Wright, Vice President Hernandez, and President Foley.

No: 0

Abstain: 0

Absent: 0

Result: 9-0-0, motion carried by unanimous roll call vote.

The following action was taken:

A. The Board approved the Minutes for the October 23, 2025 BART Board Meeting.

B. The Board approved the 2026 BART Board of Directors Meeting Calendar.

C. The Board appointed Vice President Hernandez to SB 63 Oversight Committee.

5. GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORT

President Foley introduced this item: Report of Activities, including updates of Operational, Administrative, and Roll Call for Introductions Items. He then turned it over to General Manager Bob Powers, who provided the following updates:

Ridership: It was a high ridership month, about 6.9% above budget, and 10.7% above ridership from October 2024, thanks to the Board's direction to focus on the passenger experience. Tap and Ride usage is currently used by 10-11% of passengers.

Employee Town Hall was held November 4, the second of the year. Similar presentations will be given to the Board today.

BART's Transit Oriented Development team was awarded the Change Maker of the Year award by Enterprise Community Partners.

Today is National Transit Career Day, an APTA initiative. BART staff will host 3 career fairs from 3pm to 6pm at the Embarcadero, Montgomery and 19th Street BART stations.

The GM announced the retirement of Val Menotti, Assistant General Manager of Planning and Development, after 25 years at BART. He paid tribute to his remarkable career, positioning BART specifically and public transit in general to succeed. Val expressed his thanks to BART and gave a farewell tribute to his career in public service, a path that was instilled in him by his family. He was motivated by the vision of BART and will miss working with the people, the policy makers and the public. All the Directors gave their praise to Mr. Menotti, thanking him and wishing him well in his next phase. The Directors took a ceremonial photo with Mr. Menotti.

President Foley thanked General Manager Powers and opened the floor to public comments on the reports.

Public Comments

Aleta Dupree, Barney Smits, Roland, Olivia Rocha, and Adina Levin addressed the Board.

Action

No Board action was taken, as the item was presented for information and discussion only.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT

President Foley called for public comment, an opportunity for members of the public to address the Board of Directors on matters under their jurisdiction and not on the agenda.

Glen Overton, Evan Tschuy, Aleta Dupree, Roland, Barney Smits, and Adina Levin addressed the Board.

7. PLANNING, PUBLIC AFFAIRS, ACCESS, AND LEGISLATION ITEMS

Robert Raburn, Chairperson

President Foley reminded BART Directors and staff that the District is prohibited from engaging in campaign activities, but may provide factual information about the transit revenue measure to aid the public in understanding the measure's impact on BART service, operations and policies. He turned it over to Chairperson Raburn.

Chairperson Raburn brought forward the following informational item:

Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) Transit-Related Communications and Education Update for 2026.

He introduced MTC's Rebecca Long, Director of Legislation and Public Affairs, who gave the presentation.

Public Comments

Glen Overton, Evan Tschuy, Aleta Dupree, and Adina Levin addressed the Board on this item.

Discussion

President Foley thanked Rebecca Long for the presentation. He supports celebrating transit's success. He supports the development of the Congestion Relief fact sheet and what transit means for non-passengers.

Director Flores encouraged others to use their communications tool to spread educational information, to help inform the public about the successes of BART and MTC.

Director Wright encouraged MTC to do a Super Bowl fan fest Clipper pass partnership for events at Moscone Center. He asked how a second funding measure affected the polling for respondents in San Francisco. MTC's survey incorporated a "split sample" to address a potential second measure.

Director Ghosh thanked Ms. Long for the presentation. She asked questions about how the survey was conducted, as it related to the questions asked initially, after information on the measure was presented, and after the counter arguments to the measure were made. She noticed the gap from respondents between favorable ratings and how important transit is, leading her to say that the region needs to refocus messaging on improvements made with BART. She shared her thoughts about how accountability and equity are important components for successful messaging. She asked if there will be more polling, and any opportunity to pivot messaging based upon any changes that may occur.

Director Ames expressed concerns about the SB63 timeline, with respect to transit agencies short term improvements. MTC plans to put out fact sheets by the end of 2025. She asked questions about how to reach different sectors of the public, such as those who don't use transit as frequently. She asked about transit discount passes as a way to increase ridership. Staff said passes will be evaluated after December 10, when the Clipper 2.0 transition is scheduled to commence.

Director Li thinks the Super Bowl in the Bay Area next year will be an excellent opportunity to communicate about passes (such as the privately funded BayPass program) and the transition to Clipper 2.0. She doesn't think more polling is necessary at this point, but rather to get out there with messaging that resonates. She asked about outreach in Chinese and Spanish with respect to communications and how MTC reaches the public. She said that translation into various languages is less important in social media than doing outreach with appropriate sources and venues which resonate for dedicated populations. She asked how the region can get consistent messaging

across all 27 Bay Area transit providers. She suggested the messaging about how the cost of living is the top line issue across the U.S. She encourages the region to position transit as a contribution to affordability.

Chairperson Raburn agrees that communications aren't just translations, but need to be culturally appropriate. He asked how Clipper will be integrating with Capitol Corridor. He questioned about the ridership impact study, with a focus on rail connectivity.

8. ADMINISTRATION ITEMS

Janice Li, Chairperson

Chairperson Li introduced the following item: A. Fiscal Year 2027 Budget Strategy. For information She turned it over to Joe Beach, Chief Financial Officer, and Pam Herhold, Assistant General Manager, Performance and Budget, who gave the presentation.

Public Comments

Glen Overton, Adina Levin, Aleta Dupree, and Sal Cruz addressed the Board on this item.

Discussion

President Foley said these budget strategy decisions will probably be the most weighty that the Board will face. When out in the community, he is asked when can he address what will happen if the measure fails. The General Counsel said once the Board adopts the alternative framework, it can be discussed with the public, as it will then be factual. He also relayed that the public asks him about what BART is doing to help itself.

Director Raburn thanked staff for the presentation. He had a question about the TIFIA reserve and the cost to implement the loan, with interest. Staff said they would only use \$100 million as a bridge loan, if the measure passes. As it is an expensive loan, staff will only use with extreme prudence. Director Raburn said the loan is a worst case insurance policy and is not sustainable. The consequences of a failed measure is a death spiral of Bay Area transit and thus the region must act collectively to secure a transit loan.

Director Rinn asked about the retiree medical benefits, its deferral and the repayment of this deferral. He asked to see quantitative numbers of the hiring freeze that is in progress. He wanted to see how BART is cutting expenses, other than decreasing BART train service. He re-emphasized that BART needs to do more than cut service to reduce expenses and to communicate what BART is doing in this regard. He questioned the process of how to develop the two paths of the budget, one if the measure passes and one if the measure fails. Staff explained their basis for the two paths – to proceed as if the measure would pass to maintain similar levels of service, to demonstrate the importance of BART, but that the alternate plan will be presented, in place and balanced.

Director Ames said the budget also needs a worst case scenario budget if the measure doesn't pass. She asked questions about why costs and number of employees continue to increase each year, despite loss of ridership since Covid in 2020.

Director Wright thinks it may make sense to adopt the alternative framework ahead of the base budget to provide more flexibility. He said the Board made a decision to offer good service leading up to this point and it was the correct decision. He advocates the increased participation for the BayPass to increase buy-in to BART. He asked about the deferral of retiree health benefit costs, if that would be part of the base budget. If the measure doesn't pass, Director Wright asked if there was a sweet spot in the new service levels, and whether it was viable. He also said, a failed measure would be worse than anticipated, with loss of not only BART riders, but the transit system feeding BART ridership. Because of this, he wanted to analyze different levels of ridership loss. He said it is important to also look at the costs of not offering service, such as the costs to maintain the system if parts are shut down.

Director Ghosh said if BART doesn't get the funding, it is the beginning of the end. She concurred that the decisions of the previous Board have worked, and the public's perception of BART has increased favorably. She is focused on expanding the number of riders and expand the number of people who understand the role of public transit. Cutting staff and service won't make outages and budget issues go away. It does the opposite. People want more BART and more BART service, and improving riders experience. Cutting services is a disservice to riders, climate, and BART, as so much depends on it. She also said that Transit Oriented Development is also self-help, as it increases ridership.

Director Flores appreciates the dual budget process. He asked about the \$89 million savings from Scenario B, from reduced traction power and service. 70% service reductions can be realized through furloughs, cutting vacancies – which is a head count reduction. Service reductions do not necessarily lead to expense reductions, as was made evident during Covid cutbacks. He wants to see the impact of other service reductions – all internally – procurement, IT,.. He wants to see the conversion rate back to transit, when transit service isn't great, but Bay Bridge traffic becomes painful. He also wants to agree with presenting a non-service budget option, so taxpayers will see that there still is a cost to maintain infrastructure of what remains, even without service.

Vice President Hernandez wanted more of an expansive presentation in February, with fine-tuned messages and numbers at the February workshop.

Chairperson Li wrapped up the discussion by saying that BART made the right decision to continue service levels, instead of cutting expenses that would have negatively impact service. She will only support a budget if first half FY27 maintains current levels of service. She emphasized that this Board supported the current level of service, through an 8-1 vote on last year's budget. With 2 budgets, she recommends a monthly item to keep this discussion going, previewing what is coming and what is being worked on. She is looking for more interactive ways to bounce ideas off to discuss the budget, beyond what the workshop is set up to do, such as breaking the Board up into budget groups to shoot around ideas, and then come with more thought out ideas, including with labor leaders. Full conversations are too tough in the Board meeting. Staff will work with General Counsel on how to best navigate this proposal.

9. ENGINEERING AND OPERATIONS ITEMS

Elizabeth Ames, Chairperson

No items were presented.

10. BOARD MATTERS

- A. Board Member Reports.
- B. Roll Call for Introductions.
- C. In Memoriam.

President Foley called for Items 10-A, Board Member Reports; 10-B, Roll Call for Introductions; and 10-C, In Memoriam. The following Directors provided updates:

Director Raburn reported on the following events that he attended:

October 25: San Lorenzo Parade and Festival

October 27: Oakland Safety Forum with Mayor Lee, attended with Director Flores

October 29: 4th Annual NOBLE Luncheon, BART Honorees: Chief Franklin, former DC Angela Averiet, former Chief Kenton Rainey. MC: former Zone Cmdr Tanzanika Carter, now SF Assistant Sheriff.

October 30: Pulse of Oakland

November 2: 30th Annual Fruitvale Día de los Muertos

November 6: Niagara Movement Foundation to Honor Roy Wilson, Martin Luther King Jr Freedom Center and James Head, East Bay Economic Development Corp.

November 7: Joint BART VTA Committee

November 7: NAACP Freedom Fund Gala

Director Flores gave the following report:

October 27: Bay Area Council Public Safety Meeting

October 29: NOBLE luncheon at Scott's.

October 29: Joined Teamsters Local 350 to celebrate Robert Sandoval as the new Secretary-Treasurer.

October 30: Pulse of Oakland, followed by Filipino American History event at BART, and then to South San Francisco for the El Camino Real Mobility Plan.

November 5-7: attended the California Transit Association event in Long Beach.

November 8: Spoke at the Wa Sung Community Service Club.

November 12: Toured South San Francisco BART Station with elected officials and BART staff to discuss opportunities at that station, and later attended South San Francisco's State of the City presentation.

Director Ghosh gave the following update of events she attended:

October 27: North Berkeley Access Project Ribbon Cutting, with City and AC Transit officials, and past BART Director Rebecca Saltzman.

November 5-7: attended the California Transit Association event in Long Beach, including attending an art tour.

November 10: Attended the Audit Committee meeting.

Director Wright gave the following report:

November 5: He attended a Workshop for the 16th Street Plaza redesign, with many San Francisco Departments and BART staff participating. This was the start of community input on this project.

He also voiced support for a BART investment policy in the upcoming months.

Vice President Hernandez gave the following report:

Thanked Rodd Lee and his team for their participation in the Castro Valley Parade on Saturday, November 8.

President Foley provided the following update:

He presented many Role in the Region presentations, including to the Antioch Rotary Club and the Antioch City Council, as well as to Contra Costa County Supervisor Diane Burgis.

November 5-7: he attended the California Transit Association event in Long Beach.

Monday November 10: Attended the Pittsburg bike ribbon cutting, which was a recipient of the Safe Routes to BART program. The path goes to Pittsburg High School, improves access to the Pittsburg Center BART station, and improves the ped walkway to station from Bliss Avenue.

Public Comment

There were no public comments on this item.

11. CLOSED SESSION

Glen Overton provided public comment on the closed session.

The Board went into closed session at 1:17pm for the following items:

A. PUBLIC EMPLOYEE EMPLOYMENT / APPOINTMENT Title: District Secretary Government Code Section 54957(b)(1)

B. PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION Titles: General Manager, General Counsel, and Independent Police Auditor Government Code Section: 54957

C. CONFERENCE WITH LABOR NEGOTIATORS Designated Representatives: President Foley, Vice President Hernandez, and Director Flores Titles: General Manager, General Counsel, District Secretary, and Independent Police Auditor. Government Code Section: 54957.6

12. OPEN SESSION

A. Announcements from Closed Session, if any.

B. Compensation and Benefits for District Secretary. Board requested to authorize.

C. Compensation and Benefits for General Manager, General Counsel and Independent Police Auditor. Board requested to authorize.

The Board returned to open session at 4:05pm and had one announcement to make: the Board appointed Bob Franklin as District Secretary effective November 13. The vote was unanimous. Bob thanked the Board for the appointment.

The second announcement were the terms of employment: Effective November 13th, 2025, which shall be incorporated in a mutually-satisfactory written employment agreement for execution by Mr. Robert Franklin, and the Board President. Service is for an indefinite term at the pleasure of the Board, base salary of \$240,000 per year to be increased by 2% January 1st of 2026, when other non-represented employees will receive the same wage increase. 12-months' severance pay for involuntary termination unless as a result of death or gross misconduct. Mandatory arbitration of employee disputes, benefits afforded non-represented management employee and retirees and upon retirement, option to participate in an alternative retiree medical, dental or vision plan If Mr. Robert Franklin reallocates -- relocates to an area not within the service area of a District- sponsored plan, provided the alternative plan is comparable in both costs and coverage to the District-sponsored plan.

Vice President Hernandez moved the item, with Director Li providing the second. There was no public comment.

Vote Summary

Moved by Vice President Hernandez/ Seconded by Director Li

Aye: Directors Flores, Ghosh, Li, Raburn, Rinn, Vice President Hernandez, and President Foley.

No: 0

Abstain: 0

Absent: Director Ames and Wright

Result: 7-0-0, motion carried by roll call vote.

The Board also moved to increase the base salaries for the General Manager and General Counsel by 2% retroactive to July 1st, 2025, when other non-represented employees received the same wage increase and that the General Manager and General Counsel receive a 2% increase to their base salaries on January 1, 2026, when other non-represented employees will receive the same increase. The Board President is authorized to executive any necessary changes to the Board Appointees' appointment agreements to incorporate the change.

President Foley moved the item. Director Raburn seconded the motion. There was no public comment.

Vote Summary

Moved by President Foley/ Seconded by Director Raburn.

Aye: Directors Flores, Ghosh, Li, Raburn, Rinn, Vice President Hernandez, and President Foley.

Absent: Director Ames and Wright

Result: 7-0-0, motion carried by roll call vote.

13. ADJOURNMENT:

President Foley adjourned the meeting at 4:10pm.

Bob Franklin
District Secretary