

San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District

2150 Webster Street, P. O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94612-2688



BART Police Civilian Review Board (BPCRB)

DRAFT MINUTES OF THE MEETING

Monday, October 20, 2025

Members of the BPCRB

Dana Lang, Chair (District 4, BPCRB Representative)

Byron Norris, Vice-Chair (Public-at-Large Representative)

George Perezvelez (District 9, BPCRB Representative)

Sonja Shephard (District 2, BPCRB Representative)

Torin Fischer (District 1, BPCRB Representative)

Lester. M. Mensinger (District 6, BPCRB Representative)

Gabriel Rodrigues, (BPMA/BPOA/Union Representation, BPCRB Representative)

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688
BART Police Civilian Review Board Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 20, 2025

A regular meeting of the BART Police Civilian Review Board (BPCRB) was held on **October 20, 2025**, convening at 4:02 p.m. in the BART Board Room, 2150 Webster Street, 1st Floor, Oakland, California 94612.

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Dana Lang; and Mag Tatum, Recording Secretary.

Chairperson Dana Lang gave instructions on the in-person meeting, with an option for public participation via teleconference, accessing the presentation materials online, Public comments, and Members' remarks.

1. Call to Order.

The regular meeting was convened at 4:02 p.m. by Chairperson Dana Lang.

Members Present in Oakland, CA:	Members Torin Fischer, Dana Lang, Lester Mensinger, Byron Norris, George Perezvelez, Gabriel Rodrigues and Sonja Shephard
---------------------------------	---

Absent:	None.
---------	-------

1b. The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

2. Approval of Minutes of the Meeting of September 8, 2025.

Member Perezvelez moved that the Minutes of the Meetings of **September 8, 2025**, be approved, as amended. The item was discussed.

Vice Chair Norris specified to amend the minutes to 1) move the Chair and Vice Chairperson titles to the top of the BPCRB Members list located on the Cover-Page of the 10/20 BPCRB Minutes, and to 2) strike the "Norris -YES vote" on Item 9A in the notes section: "*Officer 1 – allegation 1 – the BPCRB voted to accept the findings of OIPA with Fischer, Lang, Mensinger, Perezvelez & Norris all voting yes and Norris voting No.*"

Member Mensinger seconded the motion, which was carried by a roll call vote.

Ayes – 7: Members Fischer, Lang, Mensinger, Norris, Perezvelez, Rodrigues, and Shephard. Noes – 0. Abstain – 0. Absent – 0.

Public Comment: No comments were received.

3. Public Comment.

Chairperson Lang called for Public Comments.

Public Comment: No comments were received.

4. BART Police Civilian Review Board (BPCRB) Reports (Verbal Reports).

Chairperson Lang presented information regarding BPCRB Communications and Outreach Activities. The item was discussed.

- a. Chairperson Lang's Report.
- b. Individual Member Reports on Public Outreach and Other Activities.
- c. Subcommittees Reporting Out Announcements.

Public Comment: No Public comments was received.

5. BART Police Civilian Review Board (BPCRB) First Quarterly Report (Chair Lang's Request).

Member Perezvelez moved that the BPCRB First Quarterly Report be approved, as amended. The item was discussed.

Member Perezvelez, stated to amend the BPCRB First Quarterly Report by 1) removing Vice Chairperson from Member Shepherd title, 2) correcting Inez Gonzalez last-name in the report 3) removal of the word unbiased located under Primary Duties and Responsibilities section, and 4) replace the word there with the word the under the Board Vacancies section.

Member Mensinger seconded the motion, which was carried by a roll call vote.

Ayes – 7: Members Fischer, Lang, Mensinger, Norris, Perezvelez, Rodrigues, and Shephard. Noes – 0. Abstain – 0. Absent – 0.

Public Comment: No Public comments was received.

6. Office of the Independent Police Auditor's (OIPA) Report(s).

- a. OIPA Monthly Report(s) for August 2025.

Inez Gonzalez, Independent Police Auditor and Patrick Caceres, Independent Police Investigator, presented the OIPA Report(s) for August 2025, before the Board. The item was discussed.

Public Comment: No Public comments was received.

7. Chief of Police's Report(s).

Chief Franklin presented Chief of Police's Reports, before the Board. The item was discussed.

- a. BART Police Department's Monthly Report(s) for August 2025.
- b. Lexipol Policy Updates from the BART Police Department to the BPCRB – August 2025:
 - i. Policy 302 Use of Force Review – Removed Specific Manual Number and Updated Review Procedure, Video Review, Documentation, and Potential Policy Violation Sections.
- c. Lexipol Policy Updates from the BART Police Department to the BPCRB – October 2025:
 - i. Policy 300 Use of Force – Updated Various Sections to Clarify Language and Definitions, Restructured and Updated De-escalation Techniques, and Included Crisis Intervention Training and Supervisor Training.

Member Perezvelez stated that Policy 302 Use of Force (an excerpt of page two) will be discussed at a future BPCRB - Use of Force Standing Committee.

*Excerpt of Policy 302 Use of Force, Page 2:

Minimal amount of force necessary - ~~The lowest level of force within the range of objectively reasonable force that is necessary to effect an arrest or achieve a lawful objective without increasing the risk to others.~~ Officers may only use the level of force they reasonably believe is proportional to the seriousness of the suspected offense or the reasonably perceived level of actual or threatened resistance.

Necessary – No reasonably effective alternative to the use of force appeared at the time and the amount of force used was reasonable based on the Department's policy and training to effect the lawful purpose intended.

Public Comment: No Public comments was received.

8. **Discussion on the BART Police Department's Progressive Policing and Community Engagement Bureau (PPCEB) regarding Housing Opportunities for the Winter Months (Member Mensinger's Request) (Verbal Report Only).**

Chief of Police Kevin Franklin and Natalie Robinson, Supervisor of Crisis Intervention & Outreach Programs, presented information before the Board, regarding PPCEB Housing Opportunities for the Winter Months. The item was discussed.

Public Comment: No Public comments was received.

9. Review of Status of BPCRB Subcommittees (Vice Chair Norris' Request).

Vice Chair Norris moved that the BPCRB Subcommittees be approved, as amended. The item was discussed.

Vice-Chair Norris stated to amend the BPCRB Subcommittees by disbanding the following subcommittees 1) BPCRB – Policy Standing Subcommittee, 2) BPCRB – BART Civilian Oversight Model Standing Committee, and 3) the BPCRB Ad Hoc Working Group on Fare Evasion.

Member Perezvelez seconded the motion, which was carried by a roll call vote.

Ayes – 7: Members Fischer, Lang, Mensinger, Norris, Perezvelez, Rodrigues, and Shephard. Noes – 0. Abstain – 0. Absent – 0.

10. Review of Draft BPCRB Brochure (Chair Lang and Vice Chair Norris' Request).

Chair Lang and Vice Chair Norris presented the Draft BPCRB Brochure before the Board. The item was discussed.

Member Perezvelez moved that the BPCRB Brochure be approved. Member Fisher seconded the motion, which was carried by a roll call vote. Ayes – 7: Members Fischer, Lang, Mensinger, Norris, Perezvelez, Rodrigues, and Shephard. Noes – 0. Abstain – 0. Absent – 0.

Public Comment: No Public comments was received.

Member Mensinger seconded the motion, which was carried by a roll call vote.

Ayes – 7: Members Fischer, Lang, Mensinger, Norris, Perezvelez, Rodrigues, and Shephard. Noes – 0. Abstain – 0. Absent – 0.

11. Status Update on the 2025 BPCRB Recruitment (Verbal Report Only). (Chair Lang's Request).

Mag Tatum, District Secretary's Office, presented information regarding the 2025 BPCRB Recruitment, before the Board. The item was discussed.

Public Comment: No Public comments was received.

12. Future Agenda Items – New Business and Committee Member Comments. For Discussion (An opportunity for Committee Members to briefly introduce or suggest new business items for consideration on future BPCRB agendas.)

Chairperson Lang brought the matter of the Future Agenda Items – New Business and Committee Member Comments, before the Board. The item was discussed.

Future Agenda Items:

- a. Discussion on the BPCRB – Public Outreach Calendar of Events (Member Shephard's Request).
- b. Review of Status of BPCRB Bylaws (Member Perezvelez' Request).

Public Comment: No comments were received.

Chairperson Lang announced that the Board would enter into a closed session under items 13-A, and 13-B. To Consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in the Office of the Independent Police Auditor (OIPA) Case #24-50 and Case #25-03 of the regular meeting agenda, and that the Board would reconvene in open session at the conclusion of the closed session.

The Meeting recessed at 5:52 p.m.

The Meeting reconvened in Closed Session at 6:35 p.m.

13. Closed Session.

Members Present in Oakland, CA:

Members Torin Fischer, Dana Lang, Lester. M. Mensinger, Byron Norris George Perezvelez, Gabriel Rodrigues and Sonja Shephard.

Absent:

None.

a. To Consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in the Office of the Independent Police Auditor (OIPA) Case #24-50, Govt. Code §54957.

Chairperson Lang announced that the Board voted to accept the findings in OIPA Case# 24-50, with Member Shephard voting No.

Ayes – 6: Members Fischer, Lang, Mensinger, Norris, Perezvelez, and Rodrigues.

Noes – 1: Member Shephard. Abstain – 0. Absent – 0.

Public Comment: No comments were received.

b. (Continued from the September 8, 2025, BPCRB Meeting) To Consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in the Office of the Independent Police Auditor (OIPA) Case #25-03. Govt. Code §54957.

Chairperson Lang announced that the Board unanimously voted to accept the findings in OIPA Case# 25-03.

Public Comment: No comments were received.

14. Adjournment.

The Meeting was adjourned at 6:37 p.m.

DRAFT