

2013 Report

Conclusion/Observation	Details	Implemented
1. Prohibition Orders Distribution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Prohibition orders issued across all BART stations, with downtown San Francisco stations having the highest number.</li> <li>- Top areas of concern include domestic violence, batteries/threats on patrons and employees, batteries/threats on officers, and robbery.</li> <li>- Rising incidences of indecent exposure noted.</li> </ul>	
2. BART Employee Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 26% of prohibition orders issued in response to employee-involved incidents.</li> <li>- Reported crimes against employees decreased, potentially influenced by contract negotiations.</li> <li>- Suggested increased training and signage to improve employee safety.</li> </ul>	
3. Domestic Violence Incidents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 25% of prohibition orders involved domestic violence cases.</li> <li>- Recommendation to empower BART officers to issue Emergency Protective Orders (EPOs).</li> </ul>	
4. Mental Health Outreach	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- BART Police addressing homelessness, mental health, and substance abuse issues.</li> <li>- Majority of contacts did not qualify under prohibition order criteria.</li> <li>- Collaboration with Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT) and Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Team (MDFT).</li> </ul>	
5. Fewer Mental Health Instances	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Marginal impact on mental health community observed from new prohibition citation process.</li> <li>- Indecent exposure cases noted, potentially linked to mental health challenges.</li> </ul>	
6. Youth Involvement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Disproportionate number of prohibition orders issued to riders aged 15-25.</li> <li>- Recommendation to categorize age groups</li> </ul>	

	into juveniles and young adults for better analysis. - Plans to work with local school programs to reduce delinquent behavior.	
7. Focus on Fare Evaders	- Increased fare evasion noted, correlated with serious nuisance behavior. - Recommendation to consider fare evasion as an AB 716 violation for improved safety.	

#### 2014 Report

Conclusion/Observation	Details	Implemented
1. Prohibition Orders Distribution	- Issued across all BART stations, with downtown San Francisco stations having the highest number. - Top areas of concern include battery/threats to patrons, domestic battery, battery/threats to police officers, battery/threats to other BART employees, and robbery.	
2. Domestic Violence Cases	- 20% of prohibition orders involved domestic violence cases. - SB 1154 empowers BART officers to issue Emergency Protective Orders (EPOs), potentially decreasing these cases.	
3. BART Employee Impact	- 24% of prohibition orders issued in response to cases involving employees. - Reported crimes against employees continue to decrease. - Increased training for employee groups recommended.	

4. Mental Health Outreach	- BART Police addressing homelessness, mental health, and substance abuse issues. - Majority of cases did not qualify under prohibition order criteria. - Collaboration with Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT) and Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Team (MDFT).	
5. Mental Health Instances	- Marginal impact on individuals with mental health challenges observed from new prohibition citation process. - Tools and resources created for officers to better handle encounters with individuals with specific needs.	
6. Indecent Exposure Cases	- Rise in indecent exposure cases noted. - Continued monitoring and outreach efforts recommended.	
7. Domestic Violence Numbers	- Total domestic violence cases in 2014 totaled 74. - 20% of total prohibition orders issued related to domestic violence.	
8. Youth Involvement	- Disproportionate number of prohibition orders issued to riders aged 18-25. - Plans to work with local school programs to address delinquent behavior and gang activity.	
9. Appeals for 2014	- Six prohibition orders appealed, with various outcomes. - Suggestions for modifications to accommodate work or school schedules.	
10. Fare Evaders Focus	- Increased fare evasion noted. - Recommendation to consider fare evasion as an AB 716 violation for improved safety.	
11. Ridership Increase	- 6% increase in ridership from 2013 to 2014. - Correlation between ridership increase and prohibition orders issuance suggested.	
12. Overall Effectiveness	- More time needed to determine the program's effectiveness. - Recommendations	

	for further studies on fare evasion and criminal activity correlations. - Continued training for frontline BART employees recommended.	
--	--	--

2015 Report

Conclusion/Observation	Details	Implemented
1. Reduction in Prohibition Orders	<p>- Despite increased ridership from 2014 to 2015, fewer prohibition orders were issued in 2015 (255 compared to 281 in 2014). - Corresponds with a decrease in reported part 1 crimes and violent crimes. - AB716 contributes to crime reduction and violence prevention.</p>	
2. Reduction in Crimes of Violence	<p>- Significant reduction in prohibition orders issued for robbery, batteries/threats involving patrons, and threats/batteries involving employees. - Factors contributing to reduction include heightened patron awareness, increased employee training, and low recidivism rate.</p>	
3. Increase in Domestic Batteries	<p>- 25% of prohibition orders issued in 2015 involved domestic violence cases, slightly higher than in 2014 (20%). - BART stations serve as neutral custody exchange locations,</p>	

	leading to potential domestic violence incidents.	
4. Fare Evasion Related Assaults	- Increased fare evasion remains a problem not addressed by AB 716. - TSAC recommends reviewing system-wide statistics to determine correlations with other crime-related activities.	
5. Focus on Youth Outreach	- Fewer prohibition orders were issued to individuals under 18 in 2015 compared to 2014. - Continued plans for youth outreach programs to address delinquent behavior, youth violence, and gang activity.	
6. Appeals Process	- Only 2% of prohibition orders were appealed in 2015. - Various outcomes, including voiding, modifications, and upholding of orders, based on appeal review.	
7. BART Employee Impact	- Continued training for employees crucial to reducing incidents, especially assaults on station agents and service workers. - Reviewing training content with union leaders for possible modifications.	
8. Improvements Needed for Unruly Behavior	- Suggestions for additional signage, relocating fare machines/elevators, increasing staffing levels, and public service announcements to minimize unruly behavior.	
9. Continued Outreach Efforts for Mental Health	- Fewer prohibition orders related to mental health issues in 2015 compared to 2014. - BART Police actively address homelessness and mental health concerns, offering crisis intervention services and collaborating with allied agencies.	
10. Mental Health Outreach Efforts	- Collaboration with Homeless Outreach Teams and Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Team meetings to assist individuals with mental	

	illness and substance abuse issues. - Referrals made to the DA's office for specified treatment.	
--	--	--

2016 Report

Conclusion/Observation	Details	Implemented
1. Increase in Prohibition Orders	- BART District saw a 2% ridership increase in 2016, corresponding with an overall 3% decrease in reported crimes of violence and property crimes. - However, reported crimes of violence increased by 38% during this period. - AB 716 continues to assist in crime reduction and violence prevention.	
2. Prohibition Orders for Specified Crimes	- Overall increase in prohibition orders, notable reductions in robbery and domestic violence, but an increase in battery against District employees. - Factors contributing to reduction include heightened awareness, increased training, police patrol focus, and low recidivism rate.	
3. Decrease in Domestic Battery Prohibition Orders	- Decrease in the percentage of prohibition orders involving domestic violence cases from 2015 to 2016. - Potential factors include increased community outreach and reduction in civil standby calls at BART stations.	



4. Battery on BART Patrons	- Assaults and batteries on BART patrons remain a noticeable problem. - Highest percentage of prohibition orders issued for battery on patrons.	
5. Focus on Youth and Young Adult Outreach	- Increase in the number of prohibition orders issued to juveniles in 2016 compared to 2015. - Plans to work with local schools to reduce recidivism of delinquent behavior, youth violence, and gang activity.	
6. Appeals	- Only a small percentage of prohibition orders were appealed in 2016. - Various outcomes of appeals, including modifications and rescinding due to compliance issues.	
7. BART Employee Impact	- Training for employees crucial to reducing incidents of violence. - Reviewing training content for possible modifications.	
8. Improvements Needed for Unruly Behavior	- Suggestions to minimize conflict with frontline employees, including additional signage and increased staffing.	
9. Continued Need for Mental Health Outreach	- Decrease in the percentage of prohibition orders involving mental health issues. - Continued efforts to address homelessness and mental health concerns.	
10. Reduction in Repeat Offender Statistics	- Promising data showing a decrease in repeat offenders violating prohibition orders. - Overwhelming adherence to prohibition orders, with only a small percentage reoffending.	

2017 Report

Topic	Recommendation	Implemented
-------	----------------	-------------

1. Overall Crime Trends	Examine the relationship between increases and decreases in criminal activity within the communities BART serves.	
2. Prohibition Orders for Specified Crimes	Monitor and address the increase in prohibition orders for robbery, battery to employees, and other specified crimes, considering the percentage of total orders issued for each crime category.	
3. Increase in Domestic Battery Orders	Acknowledge the decrease in the percentage of prohibition orders issued for domestic violence and attribute it to increased community outreach, reduced civil standby calls, and the authority to issue Emergency Protective Orders (EPO) at stations.	
4. Impact on BART Employees	Recognize the challenges faced by BART employees and emphasize the need to decrease assaults and batteries against them. Advocate for consistent, system-wide training to prevent violence against employees.	
5. Battery on BART Patrons	Address the ongoing problem of assaults and batteries on BART patrons, especially focusing on specific groups such as juveniles, elderly riders, and persons with disabilities.	
6. BART Improvements for Unruly Behavior	Recommend additional training for frontline BART employees, including station agents, train operators, and system service personnel. Propose measures such as de-escalation training, increased staffing, support for Proof of Payment (POP) program, public service announcements, additional signage, and crisis intervention training.	
7. Youth and Young Adult Outreach	Suggest expanding Community Oriented Policing and Problem Solving (COPPS) programs, increasing personnel in COPPS and	

	Government and Community Relations Department, educating the public on youth Clipper Card, continuing GREAT program, developing Crisis Intervention Response Team, and recruiting a youth services representative to TSAC.	
8. Appeals	Highlight the low percentage of appeals (2%) in 2017 and recommend continued outreach efforts to inform individuals about the appeals process.	
9. Mental Health Outreach	Recognize the need for outreach efforts involving mental health. Acknowledge the percentage (11%) of offenders with mental health issues and emphasize Crisis Intervention Training (CIT), collaboration with Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT), and referrals to specific mental health or social services.	
10. Repeat Offender Statistics	Acknowledge the promising data showing high adherence to prohibition orders (94-98%) and emphasize the effectiveness of prohibition orders in preventing repeat offenses. Commit to ongoing collection and examination of repeat offender data for future reports.	
11. Homeless Outreach Initiatives	Highlight the investments in homeless outreach initiatives, including partnering with the San Francisco Homeless Outreach Team (HOT) and joining the San Francisco Law Enforcement Assisted Diversion (LEAD) program.	

2018 Report

Conclusions and Observations	Recommendations	
------------------------------	-----------------	--

1. Increase in Prohibition Orders	- Utilize AB 716 as a tool for crime reduction and prevention of violence. - Analyze demographic data with the Center for Policing Equity (CPE). - Initiate a study with the Hayward Burns Institute to analyze demographic data from BART Police Proof of Payment Citations.	
2. Prohibition Orders Issued for Specified Crimes	- Promote rider safety through education campaigns.	
3. Decrease in Domestic Battery Prohibition	- Monitor and address domestic violence cases.	
4. BART Employee Impact, Slight Increase in Employee Battery	- Prioritize prevention of violence against employees through consistent system-wide training. - Consider additional measures beyond training.	
5. Battery on BART Patrons: A Continued Issue	- Implement additional training for employees to enhance safety. - Increase employee staffing levels. - Support the Proof of Payment (POP) program. - Conduct public service announcements regarding AB 716.	
6. BART Improvements to Improve Safety and Security	- Provide additional training for employees. - Review training content with union leaders for possible modifications.	
7. A Focus on Youth and Young Adult Outreach	- Expand COPPS Unit outreach to all patrol zones. - Continue and expand the GREAT program. - Develop a Crisis Intervention Response Team. - Recruit a youth services representative to TSAC.	
8. Appeals	- Monitor and address appeal processes.	
9. Continued Need for Outreach Efforts Involving Mental Health & Homelessness	- Continue Crisis Intervention Training (CIT) for personnel. - Collaborate with Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT).	
10. Repeat Offender Statistics	- Collect and analyze data on repeat offenders for further examination.	

11. Homeless Outreach Initiatives	- Invest in initiatives to reduce prohibition orders related to homelessness. - Partner with external organizations for homeless outreach.	
-----------------------------------	--	--

2019 Report

Topic	TSAC Recommendations	
Ridership Trends and Customer Satisfaction	- Address factors impacting customer satisfaction: crowding, cleanliness, aging trains/stations, personal security - Prioritize customer safety - Continue safety emphasis	
Prohibition Orders and Crime Rates in 2019	- Analyze crime trends in relation to prohibition orders - Focus on prevention of violent crimes - Consider additional measures for violence prevention	
BART Improvements to Improve Safety and Security	- Additional training for employees - Active listening and de-escalation training - Mental Health First Aid Training - Increasing employee staffing levels	
Youth and Young Adults	- Special attention to youth population - Expanding outreach efforts - Recruitment of a youth services representative	

Request for Appeals	- Appeal process review	
Continued Need for Outreach Efforts Involving Mental Health & Homelessness	- Collaborate with outreach teams - Homeless outreach initiatives - Join LEAD program	
Repeat Offender Statistics	- Track repeat offenders - Address repeat violations	
Prior Year Annual Reports	- Reports available online for transparency and accountability	

2020 Report

Topic	Recommendations/Conclusions	
-------	-----------------------------	--

Ridership Trends and Customer Satisfaction	- BART's ridership significantly declined in 2020 due to COVID-19, leading to service reductions. - Despite the decline, customer satisfaction increased to 72% compared to 2018.	
Prohibition Orders and Crime Rates in 2020	- 255 prohibition orders issued in 2020. - Highest number of orders issued in core East Bay stations. - Young adults under 35 form most orders, with a high number issued to young African American males.	
Violent Crime Statistics	- 352 violent crimes and 1,154 property crimes reported in 2020. - Robberies and larceny/auto burglary were the most common.	
Part 1 DOJ UCR Crime Rates	- Violent and property crime rates fluctuated over the years.	
Prohibition Orders Issued for Specified Crimes	- Decrease in orders related to domestic violence and robbery. - Battery/threats to employees decreased slightly.	
Battery Against BART Employees by Classification	- Proportion of battery against station agents decreased in 2020.	
TSAC Trainings and Presentations in 2020	- Various trainings conducted including violence in the workplace, Narcan and Fentanyl use, and updates on policing and community engagement.	
Battery on BART Patrons	- Decrease in prohibition orders for battery on patrons compared to 2019.	
BART Improvements to Improve Safety and Security	- Recommendations for additional training and social distancing protocols for employees.	
Youth and Young Adults	- Decrease in prohibition orders issued to persons under 18. - Focus on outreach programs for youth populations.	



Request for Appeals	- No appeals initiated in 2020.	
Repeat Offender Statistics	- 21 persons violated prohibition orders in 2020.	
Continued Need for Outreach Efforts	- Identification of individuals struggling with mental health and homelessness. - Collaboration with outreach teams and referral to services.	
Homeless Outreach Initiatives	- Partnerships with county departments and Salvation Army for homeless outreach.	
Center for Policing Equity Report	- Analysis of racial disparities in policing practices. - Adoption of recommendations from the report.	
Prior Annual Reports	- Access to prior year reports on BART's prohibition order program online.	

## 2021 Report

Category	Recommendation	
<b>**Ridership Trends and Customer Satisfaction**</b>	- Increase service hours to accommodate rebounding ridership.	
- Maintain long trains for social distancing.	- Continue monitoring and responding to customer feedback for service improvement.	
<b>**Prohibition Orders and Crime Rates**</b>	- Analyze and address trends in prohibition orders, especially among young adults and specific demographic groups.	
- Monitor and address crime rates, with a focus on violent crimes and property crimes.	<b>**Battery Against BART Employees**</b>	
- Provide additional training for employees on de-escalation and conflict resolution.	- Increase employee staffing levels, especially for frontline positions.	

<b>**Youth and Young Adults**</b>	- Focus on outreach programs for youth, especially those who are transit dependent.	
- Expand community outreach efforts and partnership with youth programs.	<b>**Request for Appeals**</b>	
- Ensure individuals served prohibition orders have the right to appeal.	<b>**Mental Health &amp; Homelessness*</b>	
- Address issues related to mental health and homelessness through outreach and collaboration with local agencies.	<b>**BART Improvements for Safety and Security**</b>	
- Implement additional training for frontline employees.	- Continue efforts to minimize conflicts with frontline employees.	
<b>**Center for Policing Equity Report**</b>	- Adopt recommendations from the report to ensure equitable policing practices.	
<b>**Repeat Offender Statistics**</b>	- Monitor and address repeat offenders violating prohibition orders.	

Topic	Conclusions and Observations for 2022	
Ridership Trends and Customer Satisfaction	- BART's average weekday ridership slowly rebounded throughout most of 2022, reaching 41% of pre-pandemic levels in September.	
- Ridership dipped again towards the end of 2022 due to the spread of new COVID variants, ending at 35% of pre-pandemic levels in December.	- Customer satisfaction, as per BART's fall 2022 survey, was at 67%, down from 72% in 2020 but up from 56% in 2018.	
Prohibition Orders and Crime Rates in 2022	- In 2022, 310 prohibition orders were issued, with the highest number (106) issued in Oakland stations.	
- Violent crimes in 2022 totaled 350, with property crimes totaling 1,382.	- The most common violent crime was robbery, while larceny and auto burglary were the most common property crimes.	
Department of Justice (DOJ) Uniform Crime Reporting (UCR)	- Violent crime rates increased from 2021 to 2022, reaching 20% of total reported crimes.	
- Property crime rates remained relatively stable, comprising 80% of total reported crimes in 2022.	Specified Crime	
- Prohibition orders for battery/threats to employees increased significantly in 2022.	- Prohibition orders for battery/threats to patrons also rose, comprising 30% of all orders in 2022.	
Battery Against BART Employees by Classification	- Battery against police officers accounted for the highest percentage of issued orders in 2022.	
- Battery against station agents and system service/others remained relatively consistent.	TSAC Training and Presentations	
- In 2022, TSAC received presentations on updates from the PPCEB and ethics training.	- 2021 TSAC training included presentations on the District's Not One More Girl campaign and ethics training.	
- 2020 TSAC trainings covered violence in the workplace, Narcan and Fentanyl use, and BART Police Department procedures.	Battery on BART Patrons	

- Ninety-three prohibition orders were issued in 2022 for battery and threats to BART patrons.	- BART Police implemented new techniques and programs, including the ambassador program, to address safety concerns.	
BART Improvements to Improve Safety and Security	- The TSAC recommends additional training for frontline BART employees and increased staffing levels.	
- Recommendations include crisis intervention training and continued support for the Proof of Payment program.	Youth and Young Adults	
- In 2022, 29 prohibition orders were issued to persons under 18 years old, prompting increased attention to youth outreach efforts.	- Recommendations include expanding outreach programs and partnerships with youth-focused organizations.	
Request for Appeals	- None of the 310 prohibition orders issued in 2022 were appealed, demonstrating confidence in the exclusion process.	
Continued Need for Outreach Efforts	- In 2022, 18 offenders with mental health crises and 42 unhoused individuals were issued prohibition orders, highlighting ongoing challenges.	
- BART Police collaborate with various agencies to address homelessness and mental health concerns, focusing on referral to support services.	Homeless Outreach Initiatives	
- Partnerships with local organizations and the hiring of a Senior Manager of Social Service Partnerships demonstrate BART's commitment to addressing homelessness.	Prior Year Annual Reports	