

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE
DRAFT Committee Meeting Minutes
February 26, 2026

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Herb Hastings, **Chair**
2. Joshua Saunders, **Vice Chair**
3. Hillary Brown, **2nd Vice Chair**
4. Anita Ortega
5. Bruce Yow
6. Catherine Callahan - ABSENT
7. Clarence R. Fischer
8. Danny Kodmur
9. Daveed Mandell
10. Esther Waltz
11. Janice Armigo Brown
12. Roland Wong
13. Sam Buman
14. Shana Ray
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

Elena Van Loo
Kevin McDonald
Ryan Greene-Roesel

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

Director Robert Raburn
Ahmad Rassai (BART staff)
Michael Gerbracht (BART staff)
Ryan Manriquez (Guest)
Aleta Dupree (Guest)
Valerie Buell (Guest)

Vi Ibarra (Guest)
Jerry Grace (Guest)
Sarah Desumala (Guest)
Tanya Washington (Guest)
Nate Miley (Guest)
Wesley Morgan Toma (Guest)
Diana M. Leon (Guest)
Roger Acuna (Guest)
Katherine Kreft (Guest)
Marc Soto (Guest)

2. Public Comments

Diana Leon shared via email that Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)-designated seating is frequently not respected by other riders.

Aleta Dupree noted that she is continuing to learn about the BATF Advisory Committee and encouraged members to welcome all forms of diversity.

Katherine Kreft expressed concern that trains begin moving too quickly when she is transitioning from her walker to a seat, which she described as dangerous and frightening. She suggested that train operators announce when the train is about to depart.

Roger Acuna stated that the audio cues for the new fare gates need improvement to better indicate when gates are available for entry or exit, particularly for riders with low vision or who are blind. He added that he appreciates the new fare gates height, as it makes it more difficult to step over.

Vi Ibarra shared similar concerns to those raised by Katherine Kreft regarding train movement starting too quickly.

3. Approval of the January 22, 2026 meeting minutes

Esther Waltz moved for approval of the January 22, 2026 meeting minutes. Sam Buman seconded the motion.

- Motion passed with twelve (12) in favor, zero (0) against, and one (1) abstention

3. Next Generation Faregate Reliability and Access

Michael Gerbracht presented on the agenda item with the full presentation included in the BATF February 2026 agenda packet.

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few comments, concerns, and suggestions were provided:

- Hillary Brown expressed a desire for greater input from San Francisco residents regarding the new fare gates.
- Esther Waltz noted that the entry and exit indicator lights are confusing and asked whether the colors could be adjusted for clarity.
- Esther Waltz also recommended that the accessible fare gate close more quickly to reduce fare evasion, while still ensuring rider safety.
- Danny Kodmur asked whether elevator mitigation procedures are activated when accessible fare gates on the platform level are out of service for an extended period, and whether station agents provide assistance in those cases.
- Joshua Saunders recalled earlier discussions about shortening the fare gate closing time and shared concerns that the gate might close too quickly when he is traveling with luggage.
- Sam Buman stated that he is satisfied with the sensory system presentation. He noted, however, that he frequently experiences tailgating while using his scooter at El Cerrito del Norte and 12th Street Stations.
- Anita Ortega asked whether the sensors operate based on body heat.
- Clarence R. Fischer thanked staff for considering the sensory system and its importance for riders traveling with items that extend behind them.
- Daveed Mandell expressed concern that the fare gate may close too quickly and strike the long cane he uses. As a blind rider, he noted that he is hesitant to proceed when the gate opens for fear that it may close prematurely.
- Herb Hastings requested to have updated sensory fare gates at future BATF meetings.
- Herb Hasting would like a future agenda item if some of the accessible fare gates may be moved to a different location within the BART station. He would like staff to receive feedback from BATF members and members of the public.

Aleta Dupree stated that she supports the new fare gates and typically uses the standard narrow gates. She noted that on occasion, only one panel activates as she passes through, making it difficult to navigate. She asked that staff remain attentive to these issues and acknowledged that while the fare gates cannot address every challenge, they are an important tool in reducing fare evasion.

Ryan Manriquez mentioned he is a huge fan of putting fare gates on the concourse level to avoid fare evasions and increase access and awareness.

Ryan Manriquez added that you cannot see how much funds are left on your Clipper Card when scanning at the fare gates. His concern is that when you are on the platform and you do not have enough funds to go through the fare gates, you have to use the elevator to go back to the concourse level and add funds, which really slows you down trying to get on the train on time. He acknowledged that he may use “tap and ride” to pay with a credit card if the fare gate cannot read his Clipper Card, but that option is not available to riders utilizing the discount of 62.5%.

Ryan Manriquez noted that when BART reassesses accessible fare gate placement systemwide, the 24th Street Mission Station is a useful example. The station has three non-accessible fare gates located directly at the elevator to street level, while the accessible fare gate is positioned on the opposite side near the station agent booth. This layout highlights the need for clearer placement standards.

Katherine Kreft noted that if the accessible fare gates close more quickly, walkers and people in wheelchairs will not be able to get into the doors.

Sarah Desumala shared that sometimes she is able to go through the fare gates but is not able to exit the fare gates and does not know why this happens.

Roger Acuna expressed interest in being more involved in the development of the fare gate sensory system, particularly regarding its use by riders with guide dogs.

Director Robert Raburn thanked staff for their work on the fare gate initiatives and acknowledged the progress made. He emphasized the need for consistent functionality of the tagging process at accessible fare gate locations, noting that at times, only one of the tag readers works instead of both.

5. Update on Pilot Project to Improve Faregate Entry and Exit Tones for Blind and Low Vision Riders

Ryan Greene-Roesel presented on the agenda item. No presentation materials were used during the presentation.

Ryan Greene-Roesel shared that on March 2, 2026, BART will install new fare gate tones, including distinct tones for entry and exit, to make stations more welcoming and to improve navigation for riders who are low vision or blind. These tones had previously been pilot-tested with BATF members at a few stations, and will now be deployed systemwide beginning on March 02, 2026.

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few comments, concerns, and suggestions were provided:

- Sam Buman asked why riders need to hold their card for about a second while tagging and whether there is a specific reason for this.
- Shana Ray asked when the new fare gate tones will be installed or whether they are already in use.
- Joshua Saunders noted that while he has used the readers successfully, there have been occasions when his smartphone did not register on the reader.
- Roland Wong asked what the final two fare tones will be for entry and exit.
- Roland Wong also asked whether the fare gate tones will be loud enough to hear in stations with significant background noise.
- Anita Ortega noted that some riders may perceive higher-pitched versus lower-pitched tones differently.
- Danny Kodmur asked if additional feedback on the fare tones will be needed after installation begins on March 2, 2026.
- Danny Kodmur also mentioned that the previous fare gate system designated certain gates for entry only and others for exit only.
- Esther Waltz expressed support for using distinct chimes for entry and exit to assist riders who are low vision or blind.
- Hillary Brown shared that she plans to test the new fare gate tones and provide feedback.
- Clarence R. Fischer emphasized the need to ensure that fare gate tones are set at an appropriate volume, noting that background noise levels vary by station.
- Daveed Mandell highlighted the importance of providing ways for riders to locate fare gates when entering and exiting stations.
- Herb Hastings asked why spoken audio cues are not being used instead of tone-based cues.

Sarah Desumala had an idea that if the Clipper Card tag does not work, the audible cue should say, “see agent” for additional assistance.

Jerry Grace mentioned he could not hear the fare gate tones when trying to enter or exit the fare gates.

6. New BATF Committee Member Nomination – Ryan Manriquez

Ryan Manriquez introduced himself and expressed why he is interested in joining the BATF.

Sam Buman moved to recommend Ryan Manriquez as a BATF member. Hillary Brown seconded the motion.

Motion passes with eleven (11) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstentions

7. Debrief BATF Meet and Greet Event on January 22, 2026

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few comments, concerns, and suggestions were provided:

- Herb Hastings felt the Meet & Greet was very productive and appreciated the opportunity for BATF members to meet the BART Board of Directors and staff. He thanked Elena Van Loo for coordinating the event.
- Sam Buman said the Meet & Greet was a good event, but he was surprised that BATF members were not introduced individually as they had been the previous year. He believes member introductions add a personal touch and help the Board and staff get to know the committee.
- Shana Ray said holding this event annually is valuable because it helps everyone recognize faces and voices and provides an opportunity to ask questions to the Board and staff.
- Joshua Saunders felt the event was beneficial and appreciated the chance to meet with the Board and staff.
- Roland Wong enjoyed the event and appreciated everyone's company.
- Bruce Yow said the Meet & Greet event was valuable to speak directly with the Board and senior managers.
- Danny Kodmur enjoyed the Meet & Greet and was glad to have the chance to talk with several staff and managers. He said he had meaningful conversations and agreed that the event was worthwhile.
- Esther Waltz said she really enjoyed the event and noted that the food was very good and helped create a welcoming atmosphere.
- Hillary Brown enjoyed the event and appreciated the opportunity to speak with BART staff.
- Daveed Mandell said he would like to see all members of the BART Board attend future Meet & Greets. He thanked Elena Van Loo for organizing the event.
- Clarence R. Fischer felt there was a good turnout for BART staff and BART management at the event. He appreciated the attendance of some Board members but wished they could stay longer.
- BATF members suggested scheduling the Meet & Greet in January rather than December going forward.

8. Second Quarter: BART's Compiled and Analyzed Customer Complaints Related to Accessibility

Presentation will be moved to a future BATF meeting.

9. Member Announcements

Ester Waltz suggested installing two elevators at all newly built stations. Bruce Yow shared that there are Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) projects happening within the city of El Cerrito and wanted to share with BATF members and members of the public.

10. Staff Announcements

Elena Van Loo announced that Ethics Training AB1234 is scheduled for May 6, 2026, and informed BATF members that the training may be completed either in person or via teleconference. She added that travel reimbursement will be provided for those attending in person.

Ryan Greene-Roesel shared that on March 25, 2026, BART will host a Sensory Orientation for Low Vision and Blind Riders at the 19th Street BART Station from 12:00 p.m. to 1:30 p.m. She noted that travel reimbursement will not be provided because the event is open to the public.

11. Chairperson Announcements

Herb Hastings is continuing to recruit new BATF members.

12. Future Agenda Topics – Members Suggest Topics

Next Meeting Scheduled: March 26, 2026

No agenda items were suggested in person, but BATF members may email Elena Van Loo with suggestions for future agendas.

13. Adjournment

Esther Waltz moved to adjourn the February 26, 2026, meeting. Sam Buman seconded the motion. The meeting adjourned at 4:28 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, Thursday, March 26, 2026.