

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE

DRAFT Committee Meeting Minutes

November 20, 2025

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Herb Hastings, **Chair**
2. Joshua Saunders, **Vice Chair**
3. Hillary Brown, **2nd Vice Chair**
4. Anita Ortega
5. Bruce Yow
6. Catherine Callahan
7. Clarence R. Fischer
8. Danny Kodmur
9. Daveed Mandell - ABSENT
10. Janice Armigo Brown
11. Roland Wong
12. Sam Buman
13. Shana Ray
14. VACANT
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of seven (7) in-person appointed BATF members. No “Just Caused,” used.

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

Elena Van Loo – ABSENT
Ryan Greene-Roesel
Kevin McDonald

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

Tim Chan (BART staff)
David Coggshall (BART staff)
Garrett Stanton (BART staff)
Lydia Elias (Guest-MTC)

Esther Waltz (Guest)
Ryan Manriquez (Guest)
Mussie Gebre (Guest)
Aleta Dupree (Guest)
Sara Desumala (Guest)
Jerry Grace (Guest)
Vinith Llavaransan (Guest)

2. Public Comments

Ryan Manriquez shared that, as a disabled rider, using BART requires careful planning. He explained that he checks the elevator outages website before every trip, as unexpected outages can result in missed appointments, getting stuck, or needing to reroute. He noted a recent instance where the website's outage information did not match what a station agent told him and requested that staff investigate the discrepancy.

Ryan Manriquez noted that the elevator control buttons are positioned too high or on the wrong side of the elevator panel at some BART stations, posing accessibility challenges.

Aleta Dupree emphasized the importance of public input and feedback. She also stated that she should be able to use BART and its elevators without barriers.

3. Approval of the October 23, 2025 meeting minutes

Clarence R. Fischer moved approval of the October 23, 2025, meeting minutes. Bruce Yow seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with eight (8) in favor, zero (0) against, and three (3) abstentions

4. North Berkeley BART Station Access Improvement Project

Tim Chan presented on the agenda item, with the full presentation included in the BATF November 2025 agenda packet

Ryan Greene-Roesel noted that there has been improved wayfinding to the elevator. She mentioned the elevator is in an odd place and is difficult to locate and there have been complaints over the years in regard to the location of the elevator.

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few comments, concerns and suggestions were provided:

- Hillary Brown commented that she appreciated the presentation.
- Clarence Fischer expressed concern about the lack of benches near the accessible parking area while waiting for a ride and added that this issue extends beyond just the North Berkeley BART Station.
- Danny Kodmur stated that the elevator is located on a bizarre corner of the parking lot and the sidewalk to the elevator was not easily accessible, although it had been a while since his last visit to North Berkeley BART Station.
- Danny Kodmur asked if the accessible faregate is located at the platform level and asked if he could go to the main building to speak to a station agent.
- Sam Buman shared that he appreciated the agenda and praised the Ohlone Greenway.
- Bruce Yow stated that he was impressed with the improvements made.
- Roland Wong said he plans to visit the newly improved North Berkeley BART Station.

Jerry Grace mentioned he liked the improvements at the station.

Esther Waltz shared that she also plans to visit the North Berkeley BART Station.

5. Next Generation Clipper Program Update

Lydia Elias presented on the agenda item, with the full presentation included in the BATF November 2025 agenda packet.

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few comments, concerns, and suggestions were provided:

- Sam Buman mentioned that in recent years, the Clipper Card used to say “San Francisco Bay Area” on the back of the card and asked if this will come back.
- Joshua Saunders asked if holders of permanent disability discount cards are required to renew them periodically.
- Shana Ray asked whether discount Clipper Cards can be purchased and renewed online.
- Roland Wong inquired about Clipper 2.0 (the Next Generation Clipper Program), specifically whether users will be able to view their transactions online. He also requested a clearer list of locations where discount Clipper Cards can be obtained.

- Bruce Yow asked:
 - If card balances are visible when entering or exiting BART faregates.
 - Whether the discount Clipper Card is accepted across all Bay Area transit agencies, and whether the inter-agency transfer discounts would apply.
 - If funds from a discount Clipper Card can be transferred to another Clipper Card.
- Danny Kodmur expressed surprise that only about one-third of the 150,000 RTC/Clipper Access Card holders used their cards in the past year. He also asked:
 - Whether real-time usage of discount cards can be tracked at fare machines.
 - If the most accurate way to check a Clipper Card balance is by calling customer service or logging into the website.
- Catherine Callahan asked if permanent RTC Clipper Card holders are required to update their photo every six years.
- Clarence R. Fischer shared that:
 - His discount Clipper Card was blocked due to 60 days of inactivity, and he would prefer a notice rather than the card being deactivated and requiring him to contact Clipper to reactivate it.
 - He would like to use his discount Clipper Card for East Bay Paratransit, which currently does not accept it.
 - Not all Bay Area transit agencies honor the discount when transferring between systems.
- Hillary Brown liked the presentation.
- Anita Ortega asked whether she needs to apply for a Senior Discount Clipper Card upon turning 65 or if she can retain her current discount card. She also noticed that her card was blocked after six months. She also asked what the maximum value that can be added to her discount Clipper Card.
- Sam Buman asked whether senior and disabled discounts can be applied when using debit or credit cards, or if that functionality is not feasible.
- Herb Hastings expressed interest in seeing the fare amounts displayed when entering or exiting BART.
- Roland Wong would like to see a clearer list of locations where you can apply for the discount Clipper Card.

Sara Desumala would like the option to use her discount Clipper Card on both her smartphone and as a physical card. She finds it confusing that using the mobile version disables the plastic card.

Jerry Grace noted that not all Clipper Card fare machines operate the same way and requested more assistance with machines outside of BART's system.

Aleta Dupree shared that she currently uses open payments via credit card to ride BART. However, open payments via credit card will not support reduced fares to seniors and people with disabilities, even after the Next Generation Fare Gate update on December 10, 2025. She emphasized the urgency of enabling discounted open payment options for these groups.

6. New BATF Committee Member Nomination – Esther Waltz

Esther Waltz introduced herself and expressed why she is interested in joining the BATF.

Clarence Fischer moved to recommend Esther Waltz as a BATF member. Hillary Brown seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with eleven (11) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstentions

7. Member announcements

Joshua Saunders inquired whether diagrams are available showing the locations of escalators within the BART system.

8. Staff announcements

Kevin McDonald announced that the Customer Access and Accessibility Department will host a site visit at the Concord BART Station to test faregate sensors. He explained that a pilot program is underway to evaluate sensor modifications for faregate entry and exit. Kevin also reminded members that, because a quorum of members is not permitted, no more than six BATF members may attend the visit on December 3, 2025. Attending members will be eligible for travel reimbursement.

Kevin McDonald announced that Bob Franklin has been appointed BART District Secretary. Prior to the appointment, Bob Franklin had been serving in that role on an interim basis.

9. Chairperson announcements

Herb Hastings shared that he spoke with Director Hernandez of the BART Board of Directors to learn more about the BATF.

Herb Hasting mentioned the fire alarm went off at the 12th St. BART Station and was concerned that there was no announcement about what was going on.

10. Future agenda items – members suggest topics

- Next Generation Faregates
 - Sensors
- Station Agents assigned to which station agent booth, especially at stations with multiple station agent booths
- What is the policy for when the emergency gates should be open or closed
 - When station agents are authorized to open

11. Adjournment

Clarence R. Fischer moved to adjourn the November 20, 2025, meeting. Hillary Brown seconded the motion. The meeting adjourned at 4:10 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, Thursday, December 18, 2025.