

	<u>2013 Annual Report Observation</u>	<u>Details</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	<u>Implemented</u>	<u>Outcomes</u>
1	Prohibition Orders Distribution	Prohibition orders issued across all BART stations, with downtown San Francisco stations having the highest number. - Top areas of concern include domestic violence, batteries/threats on patrons and employees, batteries/threats on officers, and robbery. - Rising incidences of indecent exposure noted.	The Transit Security Advisory Committee (TSAC) The TSAC is comprised of local residents with experience in the areas of transit, youth advocacy, mental health, homelessness, public safety, and cultural awareness. The advisory committee, which is required by AB 716, monitors the number of citations and exclusions issued by BART and oversees the training of transit personnel. The training of transit personnel is mandated in order to recognize and facilitate the needs of the homeless and those struggling with mental health challenges or alcohol and other drug related issues. The TSAC reviews the appeals process, established for those who believe they have been mistakenly cited or are transitdependent.	TSAC monitors statistics of citations and makes recommendations as needed to correct any discrepancies or problems. For additional information on TSAC, please visit: http://www.bart.gov/about/bod/advisory/tsac/ .	
2	BART Employee Impact	26% of prohibition orders issued in response to employee-involved incidents. - Reported crimes against employees decreased, potentially influenced by contract negotiations. - Suggested increased training and signage to improve employee safety.	TSAC believes that increased training for employee groups, including modification of current training for Station Agents, Fore Workers, Train Operators, Operation Supervisors and System Service workers be considered to help employees better identify potentially dangerous situations and individuals with specific needs. The TSAC believes this will help achieve BART's AB 716 program goals of reducing domestic violence, employee battery and recidivism. The TSAC also suggests that additional signage located at station agents booths could help inform the public and remind employees of the protocol of the new authority.	8 Hr. Training to continue for each officer prior to having the authority to issue a prohibition order	
3	Domestic Violence Incidents	25% of prohibition orders involved domestic violence cases.	The TSAC believes the number of these cases could possibly be decreased if BART officers issued Emergency Protective Orders (EPO) at our stations. The TSAC was surprised to find out that although BART officers are California sworn peace officers, within the District, officers are not able to issue EPOs although they have the ability to enforce them. The committee strongly recommends that BART officers have the authority to issue EPOs and it should consider pursuing legislation in the California State Legislature.	EPO implemented to reduce incidents of DV	
4	Mental Health Outreach	BART Police addressing homelessness, mental health, and substance abuse issues. - Majority of contacts did not qualify under prohibition order criteria.	- Collaboration with Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT) and Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Team (MDFT).	Of the 189 sworn personnel at BART, 146 officers are CIT qualified. BART PD is dedicated to continuing this training though out the department to include both Community Service Officers and Dispatchers. The on-duty sergeant meets with the BART Police CIT Coordinator/Community Outreach Liaison to review individual cases and develop an action plans to connect or re-connect individuals to specific mental health services.	
5	Fewer Mental Health Instances	Marginal impact on mental health community observed from new prohibition citation process. Indecent exposure cases noted, potentially linked to mental health challenges.	The committee recommends that a continued emphasis be made to monitor this group of violators, as it may warrant additional outreach efforts and services in the future.	Monitored by CIT Coordinator, CIT Officers and Crime Analyst	
6	Youth Involvement	Data for the last six months indicates that riders between ages 15-25 received a disproportionate number of prohibition orders compared to other age groups.	Recommendation to categorize age groups into juveniles and young adults for better analysis. - Plans to work with local school programs to reduce delinquent behavior.	COPPS Unit	
7	Focus on Fare Evaders	Increased fare evasion noted, correlated with serious nuisance behavior. - Recommendation to consider fare evasion as an AB 716 violation for improved safety.	The TSAC has recommended that fare evasion should be strongly considered an AB 716 violation so that all patrons can feel safe riding the BART system.	Not implemented	
8	Ridership Increase				
9	Overall Effectiveness	More time needed to determine the program's effectiveness. - Recommendations for further studies on fare evasion and criminal activity correlations. - Continued training for frontline BART employees recommended.			

2014 Annual Report Observation	Details	Recommendation	Implemented	Outcomes
1 Prohibition Orders Distribution	Issued across all BART stations, with downtown San Francisco stations having the highest number. - Top areas of concern include battery/threats to patrons, domestic battery, battery/threats to police officers, battery/threats to other BART employees, and robbery.	TSAC believes that increased training for BART employee groups is the best means to decrease the number of occurrences and disruptions within the BART system. TSAC is currently reviewing training content with the union leaders of the following employee groups: station agents, fare workers, train operators, operation supervisors and system service workers, for possible modification of current training guidelines. TSAC believes potential benefits from additional training for employee groups could include TSAC also suggests the following to minimize unruly behavior: · Add signage located at station agent booths to help inform the public and remind employees of the protocol of the new authority and BART enforcement options · Make improvements to the transit system such as moving fare machines and elevators to more visible locations, and increasing station agent's public safety personnel staffing · Public Service Announcements (PSA) on radio, print ads, media and the BART website	Review and update current training model and curriculum with the BART District -	
2 Domestic Violence Cases	20% of prohibition orders involved domestic violence cases. - SB 1154 empowers BART officers to issue Emergency Protective Orders (EPOs), potentially decreasing these cases.	TSAC will continue to make recommendations that address the need to decrease these numbers.	Senate Bill 1154 empowers BPD	
3 BART Employee Impact	24% of prohibition orders issued in response to cases involving employees. - Reported crimes against employees continue to decrease. - Increased training for employee groups recommended.	TSAC believes potential benefits from additional training for employee groups could include: · Helping employees better identify potentially dangerous situations and reduce employee battery · Helping employees identify individuals with specific needs · Reducing employee battery TSAC also suggests the following to minimize unruly behavior: · Add signage located at station agent booths to help inform the public and remind employees of the protocol of the new authority and BART enforcement options · Make improvements to the transit system such as moving fare machines and elevators to more visible locations, and increasing station agent's public safety personnel staffing · Public Service Announcements (PSA) on radio, print ads, media and the BART website	Review and update current training model and curriculum with the BART District -	
4 Mental Health Outreach	BART Police addressing homelessness, mental health, and substance abuse issues. - Majority of cases did not qualify under prohibition order criteria.	Collaboration with Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT) and Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Team (MDFT).	BART PD is steadily accomplishing its goal of having all officers complete Crisis Intervention Training (CIT). Eightythree percent of Non-Command Personnel are CIT trained Eightythree percent of Non-Command Personnel are CIT trained CIT officers and police personnel continue to offer services on the spot by referring individuals to appropriate resources through local city or county organizations. The BART Police CIT Coordinator meets daily with police personnel to review individual cases and develop an action plan to connect or re-connect individuals to specific mental health services.	
5 Mental Health Instances	Marginal impact on individuals with mental health challenges observed from new prohibition citation process. - Tools and resources created for officers to better handle encounters with individuals with specific needs.			
6 Indecent Exposure Cases	Rise in indecent exposure cases noted. - Continued monitoring and outreach efforts recommended.			
7 Domestic Violence Numbers	Total domestic violence cases in 2014 totaled 74. - 20% of total prohibition orders issued related to domestic violence.			
8 Youth Involvement	Disproportionate number of prohibition orders issued to riders aged 18-25. - Plans to work with local school programs to address delinquent behavior and gang activity.	TSAC has recommended the current age groups used for prohibition statistics be further broken down into categories for juveniles and young adults: ages 17 and under and 18-25.	BART PD has plans to work with various local school programs within the BART service area to achieve the program goals of reducing recidivism of delinquent behavior, youth violence, and gang activity. BART PD is involved in programs such as Gang Resistance Education and Training (G.R.E.A.T.). It is intended to combat delinquency, youth violence and gang membership. This curriculum offers many components to help children focus on life skills while helping them avoid delinquent behavior and violence.	
9 Appeals for 2014	Six prohibition orders appealed, with various outcomes. - Suggestions for modifications to accommodate work or school schedules.	All persons who entered the appeal process were informed that while they are involved in the appeal process, the prohibition order was on hold until a decision had been reached and the appeal process had been completed.	AB716 guideline process used for each case	
10 Fare Evaders Focus	Increased fare evasion noted. - Recommendation to consider fare evasion as an AB 716 violation for improved safety.	TSAC recommends studying the correlation between fare evasion and criminal activity as well as fare evasion and assault on employees; in particular, station agents, train operators, and police officers. Furthermore, TSAC recommends the continued training of frontline BART employees to afford them the ability to identify, diffuse and solve situations, keeping them and BART riders safe.	Review and update current training model and curriculum with the BART District -	
11 Ridership Increase	6% increase in ridership from 2013 to 2014. - Correlation between ridership increase and prohibition orders issuance suggested.			
12 Overall Effectiveness	More time needed to determine the program's effectiveness. - Recommendations for further studies on fare evasion and criminal activity correlations. - Continued training for frontline BART employees recommended.			

####	2015 Annual Report Observation	Details	Recommendation	Implemented	Outcomes
1	Reduction in Prohibition Orders	- Despite increased ridership from 2014 to 2015, fewer prohibition orders were issued in 2015 (255 compared to 281 in 2014). - Corresponds with a decrease in reported part 1 crimes and violent crimes. - AB716 contributes to crime reduction and violence prevention.		AB716 is one of a number of tools assisting with crime reduction and the prevention of violence against persons on District property. Suspects known to commit violence against others are precluded from returning to District property, and therefore are less likely to commit another offense during the specified period of prohibition.	
2	Reduction in Crimes of Violence	- Significant reduction in prohibition orders issued for robbery, batteries/threats involving patrons, and threats/batteries involving employees. - Factors contributing to reduction include heightened patron awareness, increased employee training, and low recidivism rate.		TSAC believes the overall reduction of prohibition orders in many of the above categories were primarily due to: ☐ Heightened patron awareness and reporting of criminal activity ☐ Increase employee awareness and training ☐ Low recidivism rate (14 arrested for violating order in 2015 compared to 23 in 2014)	
3	Increase in Domestic Batteries	- 25% of prohibition orders issued in 2015 involved domestic violence cases, slightly higher than in 2014 (20%). - BART stations serve as neutral custody exchange locations, leading to potential domestic violence incidents.	TSAC believes these incidents may be decreased with the recent authority granted to BART Police to issue Emergency Protective Orders (EPO) at stations under SB 1154 (Hancock), along continued outreach and public awareness efforts.	Increased awareness of handoff locations and LE presence during this time, as well courts modifying process and location of handoff of child	
4	Fare Evasion Related Assaults	- Increased fare evasion remains a problem not addressed by AB 716.	TSAC recommends that system wide statistics be reviewed to determine if there is an actual correlation between chronic fare evasion and other crime related activity. In spite of specific restrictions expressed by legislators with respect to fare evasion, the TSAC recommends the provisions in this legislation be strongly reconsidered so that all patrons feel safe while in the BART system.		
5	Focus on Youth Outreach	- Fewer prohibition orders were issued to individuals under 18 in 2015 compared to 2014. - Continued plans for youth outreach programs to address delinquent behavior, youth violence, and gang activity.	TSAC recommends that system wide statistics be reviewed to determine if there is an actual correlation between chronic fare evasion and other crime related activity. In spite of specific restrictions expressed by legislators with respect to fare evasion, the TSAC recommends the provisions in this legislation be strongly reconsidered so that all patrons feel safe while in the BART system.		
6	Appeals Process	- Only 2% of prohibition orders were appealed in 2015. - Various outcomes, including voiding, modifications, and upholding of orders, based on appeal review.		AB716 guideline process used for each case	
7	BART Employee Impact	- Continued training for employees crucial to reducing incidents, especially assaults on station agents and service workers. - Reviewing training content with union leaders for possible modifications.	TSAC is currently reviewing training content with union leaders of station agents, fore workers, train operators, transportation supervisors and system service workers for possible modifications to the current training guidelines. The TSAC believes potential benefits from continued and additional training could include: ☐ Helping employees identify potentially dangerous situations ☐ Helping employees identify individuals with specific needs ☐ Reducing employee battery		
8	Improvements Needed for Unruly Behavior	- Suggestions for additional signage, relocating fare machines/elevators, increasing staffing levels, and public service announcements to minimize unruly behavior.	TSAC also suggests the following to help minimize unruly behavior: Additional signage at station agent booths to help inform the public of AB 716. Moving fare machines and elevators to more visible locations. Increasing employee staffing levels at stations (To include new station agents for opening and closing shifts, and the continued hiring of police officers and community service officers, increasing uniform staffing) Public Service Announcements (PSAs) via the media regarding AB 716.		
9	Continued Outreach Efforts for Mental Health	- Fewer prohibition orders related to mental health issues in 2015 compared to 2014. - BART Police actively address homelessness and mental health concerns, offering crisis intervention services and collaborating with allied agencies.	CIT Training and continued support of CIT Coordinator and community outreach liaison	Crisis Intervention Training (CIT) officers and police personnel continue to offer services at the scene by referring them to appropriate resources through local city or county organizations. The BART Police CIT Coordinator is either on scene or BART PD ANNUAL AB716 CALIFORNIA STATE LEGISLATURE REPORT 2015 14 meets with police personnel to review individual cases and develop an action plan to connect or re-connect individuals to specific mental health services on a daily basis. BART Police track cases involving individuals with mental health issues, and shares the information with allied agencies during line-ups or via email.	
10	Mental Health Outreach Efforts	- Collaboration with Homeless Outreach Teams and Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Team meetings to assist individuals with mental illness and substance abuse issues. - Referrals made to the DA's office for specified treatment.	Develop MDFT relationships in each of the four counties BART serves	All but San Francisco	

	<u>2016 Annual Report Observation</u>	<u>Details</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	<u>Implemented</u>	<u>Outcomes</u>
1	Increase in Prohibition Orders	BART District saw a 2% ridership increase in 2016, corresponding with an overall 3% decrease in reported crimes of violence and property crimes. - However, reported crimes of violence increased by 38% during this period. - AB 716 continues to assist in crime reduction and violence prevention.			
2	Prohibition Orders for Specified Crimes	Overall increase in prohibition orders, notable reductions in robbery and domestic violence, but an increase in battery against District employees. Factors contributing to reduction include heightened awareness, increased training, police patrol focus, and low recidivism rate.	The TSAC believes the significance of the aforementioned data is the result of: - Heightened patron and employee awareness and prompt reporting of criminal activity - Increased employee awareness and training - Police patrol focus on stations where a larger number of prohibition orders are issued - Lower recidivism rate (6 persons arrested for violating order in 2016 compared to 20 in 2015, and 23 in 2014)		
3	Decrease in Domestic Battery Prohibition Orders	Decrease in the percentage of prohibition orders involving domestic violence cases from 2015 to 2016. - Potential factors include increased community outreach and reduction in civil standby calls at BART stations.		The TSAC believes these incidents decreased due to increased community outreach, and anecdotal reduction in the number of civil standby calls for service at the BART stations. In addition, this year was the first calendar year BART Police had authority to issue Emergency Protective Orders at stations under SB 1154 (Hancock)	
4	Battery on BART Patrons	Assaults and batteries on BART patrons remain a noticeable problem. - Highest percentage of prohibition orders issued for battery on patrons.	Continue community outreach and education to the public using BART		
5	Focus on Youth and Young Adult Outreach	Increase in the number of prohibition orders issued to juveniles in 2016 compared to 2015. - Plans to work with local schools to reduce recidivism of delinquent behavior, youth violence, and gang activity.	The TSAC recommends providing additional outreach efforts, at the BART District and Police Department levels: - Expanding the COPPS Unit to extending the outreach to all patrol zones Investigate expanding and simplifying the process of obtaining discount tickets for juvenile BART patrons Continued efforts working with youth in the community and schools using the GREAT program and expand it outside of just Alameda County		
6	Appeals	Training for employees crucial to reducing incidents of violence. - Reviewing training content for possible modifications.		AB716 guideline process used for each case	
7	BART Employee Impact	Training for employees crucial to reducing incidents of violence. - Reviewing training content for possible modifications.	TSAC believes training for employees is an important way to reduce incidents of violence against station agents, train operators, and system service workers, who find themselves in the middle of disruptive and sometimes violent public actions. This recommended training should occur at the entry level stage of employment, as well as throughout the employee's career via routinely scheduled, specified recertification training.		
8	Improvements Needed for Unruly Behavior	Suggestions to minimize conflict with frontline employees, including additional signage and increased staffing.	TSAC would like to see a decrease in cases where this behavior leads to assaults and batteries on BART District employees. The TSAC suggests the following to help minimize areas of conflict with frontline employees: - Additional signage at station agent booths to help inform the public of AB 716 - Identification of specific locations within stations which are contributing factors to unruly behavior (fare machines or elevators not visible to station agents, areas of concealment, unstaffed booths, transition points between paid and unpaid areas, etc.) - Increasing employee staffing levels across service classifications - Public Service Announcements (PSAs) via BART Media Relations and the BART Police Department regarding AB 716		
9	Continued Need for Mental Health Outreach	Decrease in the percentage of prohibition orders involving mental health issues. - Continued efforts to address homelessness and mental health concerns.	CIT Training and Increase Awareness through community outreach. BART Police CIT Coordinator is either on scene and/or meets with police personnel to review individual cases and develop an action plan to connect or re-connect individuals to specific mental health or appropriate services on a daily basis	To increase relationships with key mental health groups in the Bay Area, BART PD has worked with the Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT) in all four of the counties it serves.	
10	Reduction in Repeat Offender Statistics	Promising data showing a decrease in repeat offenders violating prohibition orders. - Overwhelming adherence to prohibition orders, with only a small percentage reoffending.		The TSAC acknowledges the BART Police Department had a change in the reporting and report writing systems in early 2016. TSAC committee members took it upon themselves to locate and identify the repeat offender data for both 2015 and 2016, to further investigate the effectiveness of prohibition orders and their impact on offenders. The TSAC is committed to continuing the collection of this information for additional examination and inclusion in all future reports.	

2017 Annual Report Observation	Details	Recommendation	Implemented	Outcomes
1 Overall Crime Trends	Examine the relationship between increases and decreases in criminal activity within the communities BART serves. TSAC looked to the FBI Preliminary Semiannual Uniform Crime Report for 2017 https://ucr.fbi.gov/crime-in-the-us/2017/preliminary-report_home .	The TSAC supports BART's new proof of payment process which began January 1, 2018, and believes it is a step in the right direction in reducing the potential for employees being harmed while dealing with patrons in the system. The TSAC acknowledges the BART Police department is challenged at identifying the actual number of offenders who receive a prohibition order and have also committed the crime of fare evasion. The TSAC will continue to seek information on the correlation between increased fare evasion within the transit system and assaults on the front-line employees.		
2 Prohibition Orders for Specified Crimes	Monitor and address the increase in prohibition orders for robbery, battery to employees, and other specified crimes, considering the percentage of total orders issued for each crime category.	The TSAC believes the significance of the aforementioned data is the result of: • Heightened patron and employee awareness and prompt reporting of criminal activity through traditional methods, as well as the BART Watch application for smart devices. • Police patrol focus on stations where a larger number of prohibition orders are issued		
3 Increase in Domestic Battery Orders	Acknowledge the decrease in the percentage of prohibition orders issued for domestic violence and attribute it to increased community outreach, reduced civil standby calls, and the authority to issue Emergency Protective Orders (EPO) at stations.	Court assigned locations and LE presence	The TSAC believes these incidents decreased due to increased community outreach, and anecdotal reduction in the number of civil standby calls for service at the BART stations. In addition, 2016 was the first calendar year BART Police had authority to issue Emergency Protective Orders (EPO) at stations under SB 1154 (Hancock).	
4 Impact on BART Employees	Recognize the challenges faced by BART employees and emphasize the need to decrease assaults and batteries against them. Advocate for consistent, system-wide training to prevent violence against employees.	Advocate for consistent, system-wide training to prevent violence against employees. TSAC considers prevention of violence against employees a priority and seeks to identify additional measures beyond training in order to prevent incidents of violence affecting employees. This training must be consistent system wide, and should include the police department employees, the front-line staff, and the transit supervisors. The TSAC believes potential benefits from continued and additional training could include: • Helping employees deescalate potentially dangerous behaviors and situations • Helping employees identify individuals with specific needs • Reducing the likelihood an employee is the victim of assault or battery	Station Agent Training update	
5 Battery on BART Patrons	Address the ongoing problem of assaults and batteries on BART patrons, especially focusing on specific groups such as juveniles, elderly riders, and persons with disabilities.			
6 BART Improvements for Unruly Behavior	Recommend additional training for frontline BART employees, including station agents, train operators, and system service personnel. Propose measures such as de-escalation training, increased staffing, support for Proof of Payment (POP) program, public service announcements, additional signage, and crisis intervention training	TSAC recommends the following to help minimize areas of conflict with frontline employees: • Identification and implementation of de-escalation training • Continue increasing employee staffing levels across service classifications, especially station agents and police officers • Continued support of the newly implemented Proof of Payment (POP) program and its personnel assigned to the enforcement • Public Service Announcements (PSAs) via BART Media Relations and the BART Police Department regarding AB 730 • Additional signage at station agent booths to help inform the public of AB 730 • Crisis intervention training and a dedicated Crisis Intervention Response Team allowed to address problems district wide	Training on De Escalation for Station Agents and other BART personnel classifications	
7 Youth and Young Adult Outreach	Suggest expanding Community Oriented Policing and Problem Solving (COPPS) programs, increasing personnel in COPPS and Government and Community Relations Department, educating the public on youth Clipper Card, continuing GREAT program, developing Crisis Intervention Response Team, and recruiting a youth services representative to TSAC.	TSAC recommends providing additional outreach efforts, at the BART District and Police Department levels. • Expanding the COPPS Unit to extending the outreach to all patrol zones by providing one COPPS assigned employee per zone • Adding additional personnel to both the COPPS Unit and the District's Government and Community Relations Department to reach at-risk youth prior to any law enforcement contact • Educating the public on the new youth Clipper Card process • Continuation of the GREAT program and an expansion of the program outside of Alameda County • Development of a Crisis Intervention Response Team staffed by sworn law enforcement personnel and trained civilian staff • Recruitment of a youth services representative to the TSAC.	BART Police has been involved in programs in Alameda County such as Gang Resistance Education and Training (GREAT) at the grammar school level. GREAT offers many components to help children focus on life skills while helping them avoid delinquent behavior and violence. Educating our youth stakeholders and providing a positive citizen/police encounter at this early age group will assist in reducing the incidences of criminal behavior later in life for many of these juveniles.	
8 Appeals	Highlight the low percentage of appeals (2%) in 2017 and recommend continued outreach efforts to inform individuals about the appeals process.		AB716 guideline process used for each case	
9 Mental Health Outreach	Recognize the need for outreach efforts involving mental health. Acknowledge the percentage (11%) of offenders with mental health issues and emphasize Crisis Intervention Training (CIT), collaboration with Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT), and referrals to specific mental health or social services.	TSAC recognizes that it is important to increase relationships with key outreach groups in the Bay Area. BART PD has worked with the Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT) in all four of the counties it serves. Information on mental health incidents is gathered and shared at monthly Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Team (MDFT) workgroup meetings in Alameda, Contra Costa, San Mateo Counties, and a similar consortium in San Francisco.	BART is one of the only transit properties in the nation to employ a full-time CIT Coordinator/Community Outreach Liaison to connect individuals who may be in crisis to specific mental health or social services. The CIT Coordinator is a member of the TSAC and works with homeless outreach teams in all four counties that BART operates. The BART Police CIT Coordinator is either on scene and/or meets with police personnel to review individual cases and develop an action plan to connect or re-connect individuals to specific mental health or appropriate services on a daily basis.	
10 Repeat Offender Statistics	Acknowledge the promising data showing high adherence to prohibition orders (94-98%) and emphasize the effectiveness of prohibition orders in preventing repeat offenses. Commit to ongoing collection and examination of repeat offender data for future reports.	TSAC is committed to ongoing collection and examination of repeat offender data for future reports.	Yes, working with BPD Crime Analyst	
11 Homeless Outreach Initiatives	Highlight the investments in homeless outreach initiatives, including partnering with the San Francisco Homeless Outreach Programs	Increasing the number of partners in each county/line area of patrol to assist with resources	The BART Police Department also joined the San Francisco Law Enforcement Assisted Diversion (LEAD) program to divert low level drug offenders away from the criminal court system into state, county, and city funded programs. Modeled after the successful LEAD program in Seattle, Washington, the goal of this process is to provide persons struggling with addiction a means of obtaining basic needs and treatment, without resorting to criminal behaviors which adversely affect the District and City stakeholders.	

	2018 Annual Report Observation	Details	Recommendation	Implementation	Outcomes
1	Increase in Prohibition Orders	The number of prohibition orders issued also increased from 315 in 2017 to 376 in 2018, just over 19%. During its monthly meetings, the TSAC discusses crime trends that effect BART in relation to the number of prohibition orders issued. As crime rates either rise or fall in the BART system, TSAC compares the number of correlating prohibition orders. Utilize AB 716 as a tool for crime reduction and prevention of violence. - Analyze demographic data with the Center for Policing Equity (CPE). - Initiate a study with the Hayward Burns Institute to analyze demographic data from BART Police Proof of Payment Citations.		The BART Police Department is currently participating in a study with the Center for Policing Equity (CPE), to analyze demographics of arrests, citations, and law enforcement contacts made by BART Police Officers. The Department has submitted multiple years of demographic data. CPE is in the process of analyzing the data, and they have also completed a survey of BART Police employees. CPE anticipates that they will submit a report of their findings to Chief Rojas in the spring of 2019.	
2	Prohibition Orders Issued for Specified Crimes	With the overall increase in prohibition orders issued between 2017 and 2018, the rise in crimes related to robbery is significant. Part of this increase can be attributed to the robbery of cell phones and electronic devices - Promote rider safety through education campaigns.		BART created an education campaign reminding customers to be aware of their surroundings, use their phone discreetly, and avoid using devices near train doors, during station stops or when exiting the station.	
3	Decrease in Domestic Battery Prohibition	Monitor and address domestic violence cases.			
4	BART Employee Impact, Slight Increase in Employee Battery	Prioritize prevention of violence against employees through consistent system-wide training. - Consider additional measures beyond training.	TSAC would like to see a decrease in cases where this behavior leads to assaults and batteries on BART District employees. Battery against District employees (including officers) resulted in 22% of all prohibition orders issued in 2018, and 25% in both 2017 and 2016, compared to 20% of the total orders in 2015.	Increase in Awareness announcements and training for BART employees. The TSAC believes potential benefits from continued and additional training could include: • Helping employees de-escalate potentially dangerous behaviors and situations • Helping employees identify individuals with specific needs • Reducing the likelihood an employee is the victim of assault or battery	
5	Battery on BART Patrons: A Continued Issue	Implement additional training for employees to enhance safety. - Increase employee staffing levels. - Support the Proof of Payment (POP) program. - Conduct public service announcements regarding AB 716.			
6	BART Improvements to Improve Safety and Security	Provide additional training for employees. - Review training content with union leaders for possible modifications.	the TSAC recommends additional training for employees. Updated and expanded training is an important way to reduce incidents of violence against these employees who find themselves in the middle of disruptive and sometimes violent public actions. This recommended training should occur at the entry level stage of employment, as well as throughout the employee's career via routinely scheduled, specified recertification training. The TSAC is currently reviewing training content with union leaders of station agents, system service employees, fore workers, and train operators for possible modifications to the current training guidelines.	The TSAC recommends the following to help minimize areas of conflict with frontline employees: • Identification and implementation of de-escalation training • Continue increasing employee staffing levels across service classifications, especially station agents and police officers • Continued support of the newly implemented Proof of Payment (POP) program and its personnel assigned to the enforcement. • Public Service Announcements (PSAs) via BART Media Relations and the BART Police Department regarding AB 716 • Additional signage at station agent booths to help inform the public of AB 716 • Crisis intervention training and a dedicated Crisis Intervention Response Team allowed to address problems district wide with the assistance of county wide Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Teams (MDFT).	
7	A Focus on Youth and Young Adult Outreach	Expand COPPS Unit outreach to all patrol zones. Continue and expand the GREAT program. - Develop a Crisis Intervention Response Team. - Recruit a youth services representative to TSAC.	because of the high volume of juveniles in the area who are transit dependent. BART PD has plans to continue to work with the various local schools within the BART service area to achieve their program goals of reducing recidivism of delinquent behavior, youth violence, and gang activity through Community Oriented Policing and Problem Solving (COPPS) programs. Special attention will be paid to demographics, age and ethnicity as outreach programs are created and designed for the groups that have the greatest needs. The TSAC recommends providing additional outreach efforts, at the BART District and Police Department levels: • Expanding the COPPS Unit to extending the outreach to all patrol zones by providing one COPPS assigned employee per zone • Continuation of the GREAT program and an expansion of the program outside of Alameda County • Development of a Crisis Intervention Response Team staffed by sworn law enforcement personnel and trained civilian staff • Recruitment of a youth services representative to the TSAC.	Continued efforts in expanding the GREAT Program to elementary, middle schools and high schools	
8	Appeals	Monitor and address appeal processes.	TSAC to continue to review stats and trends on monthly basis	AB 716 guideline process used for each case	
9	Continued Need for Outreach Efforts Involving Mental Health & Homelessness	Continue Crisis Intervention Training (CIT) for personnel. - Collaborate with Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT).		BART is one of the only transit properties in the nation to employ a full-time CIT Coordinator/Community Outreach Liaison to connect individuals who may be in crisis to specific mental health or social services. The CIT Coordinator is a member of the TSAC and works with homeless outreach teams in all four counties that BART operates. The BART Police CIT Coordinator is either on scene and/or meets with police personnel to review individual cases and develop an action plan to connect or re-connect individuals to specific mental health or appropriate services daily.	
10	Repeat Offender Statistics	Collect and analyze data on repeat offenders for further examination.	The TSAC acknowledges the BART Police Department had a change in the reporting and report writing systems in early 2016. TSAC committee member took it upon themselves to locate and identify the repeat offender data from January 2015 through December 2017 to further investigate the effectiveness of prohibition orders and their impact on offenders. The TSAC is committed to continuing the collection of this information for additional examination and inclusion in all future reports.	Review reports and work with BPD Crime Analyst collaboratively	
11	Homeless Outreach Initiatives	Invest in initiatives to reduce prohibition orders related to homelessness. - Partner with external organizations for homeless outreach.	Continue to build relationships with our community partners in the four counties BART serves.	BART Police Department continues to work with the San Francisco Law Enforcement Assisted Diversion (LEAD) program to divert low level drug offenders away from the criminal court system into state, county, and city funded programs.	

2019 Annual Report Observation	Details	Recommendations	Implementation	Outcomes
1 Ridership Trends and Customer Satisfaction	Address factors impacting customer satisfaction: crowding, cleanliness, aging train/stations, personal security. Prioritize customer safety - Continuous safety emphasis. These issues include drug use and criminal activity on or near BART, untreated mental illness, fare evasion, homelessness, and panhandling. In BART of this, BART has prioritized customer safety with Continued emphasis on addressing These quality of life issues.	TSAC will continue to review data during the monthly meetings, they will discuss crime trends that effect BART in relation to the number of prohibition orders issued.	According to BART's most recent Customer Satisfaction Survey, 56% of respondents said they are very or somewhat satisfied with BART. This is down 11 percentage points since 2016. Key factors behind the decline in customer satisfaction continue to be: crowding, cleanliness, and aging trains and stations. In addition, concerns about personal security on BART have risen dramatically, likely driven by high profile incidents, as well as day to day quality of life issues that impact how our riders feel on BART.	
2 Prohibition Orders and Crime Rates	Analyze crime trends in relation to prohibition orders - Focus on prevention of violent crimes - Consider additional measures for violence prevention		The BART Police Department is currently participating in a study with the Center for Policing Equity (CPE), to analyze demographics of arrests, citations, and law enforcement contacts made by BART Police Officers. The Department has submitted multiple years of demographic data. CPE is in the process of analyzing the data, and they have also completed a survey of BART Police employees. CPE has submitted a draft report of their findings to Chief Alvarez in December of 2019. The report is in final stages of review and will be released by late 2020.	
3 BART Improvements to Improve Safety and Security	Additional training for employees - Active listening and de-escalation training - Mental Health First Aid Training - Increasing employee staffing levels		continued and additional training could include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing a Civilian Academy in partnership with OHA, CPE, BART PD, COPS and Community Partners Helping employees de-escalate potentially dangerous behaviors and situations Helping employees identify individuals with specific needs Reducing the likelihood an employee is the victim of assault or battery The TSAC recommends the following to help continue to minimize areas of conflict with frontline employees and management staff: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identification and implementation of active listening and de-escalation training Mental Health First Aid (MHFA) Training for BART Personnel Employee education and resources on conflict resolution and peer support Continue increasing employee staffing levels across service classifications, 	
4 Youth and Young Adults	Special attention to youth population - Expanding outreach efforts - Recruitment of a youth services representative		The TSAC recommends pursuing additional outreach efforts, at the BART District and Police Department levels including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Frontline staff and BART PD developed report with young riders through community outreach Expanding the COPS list to extending the outreach to all patrol zones by providing one COPS assigned employee per zone Continuance of the GREAT program and an expansion of the program outside of Alameda County Development of a Crisis Intervention Response Team staffed by sworn law enforcement personnel and trained civilian staff Recruitment of a youth services representative to the TSAC Partnering with local youth at risk/youth empowerment programs 	
5 Request for Appeals	Appeal process review		AB716 guideline process used for each case	
6 Continued Need for Outreach Efforts Involving Mental Health & Homelessness	Collaborate with outreach teams - Homeless outreach initiatives - Join LEAD program	In 2018, of the 373 prohibition orders issued, 17 of the offenders were identified as "in crisis" or struggled with a mental health condition and identified as a danger to self and/or others. This represents 4% of the total number of prohibition orders issued. In addition, 34 of the 373 individuals issued a prohibition were identified as transient. This is a promising downward trend compared to the previous year. In 2016, of the 376 prohibition orders issued, 34 offenders were identified as "in crisis" and 61 individuals were identified as transient. In all cases involving mental illness issues, subjects are transported to, and evaluated at, a licensed psychiatric facility prior to being booked at the jail.	nation as one of the only transit properties in the nation to employ a full-time CIT Coordinator/Community Outreach Liaison to connect individuals who may be in crisis to specific mental health or social services. The CIT Coordinator is a member of the TSAC and works with homeless outreach teams in all four counties that BART operates. The BART Police CIT Coordinator is either on scene and/or meets with police personnel to review individual cases and develop an action plan to connect or re-connect individuals to specific mental health or appropriate services daily. BART Police tracks cases involving individuals with mental health conditions and shares the information with allied agencies during live-ups or via email. BART PD has been able to make referrals to the District Attorney and Public Defender's office through collaboration with MDTF willingness to help	
7 Homeless Outreach Initiatives	BART continue to invest in a process to reduce prohibition orders resulting from conditions related to homelessness. BART recently partnered with Contra Costa County Department of Public Health CHSE Team, to conduct homeless outreach in BART stations and on BART trains in Contra Costa County. BART has partnered with the San Francisco Homeless Outreach Team (HOT) and the San Francisco Municipal (SF MUNI) Transit District in a joint effort funded by BART and SF MUNI. The harm reduction strategy involves deployment of a dedicated homeless outreach team assigned specifically to the downtown San Francisco BART and MUNI transit stations.	Continue developing relationships in each community	The BART Police Department also joined the San Francisco Law Enforcement Assisted Diversion (LEAD) program to divert low-level drug offenders away from the criminal court system to state, county, and city funded programs. Modeled after the successful LEAD program in Seattle, Washington, the goal of this process is to provide persons struggling with addiction a means of obtaining basic needs and treatment, without resorting to criminal behaviors which adversely affect the District and City stakeholders. BART District has become involved in a district wide approach to addressing the challenge of homelessness by partnering with each county in a regional collaboration.	
8 Repeat Offender Statistics	Track repeat offenders - Address repeat violations			
9 Prior Year Annual Reports	Reports available online for transparency and accountability			

	2020 Annual Report Observation	Details	Recommendation	Implementation	Outcomes
1	Ridership Trends and Customer Satisfaction	BART's ridership significantly declined in 2020 due to COVID-19, leading to service reductions. Despite the decline, customer satisfaction increased to 72% compared to 2018.	Comments about personal security referenced the need for more police, the presence of homeless riders, individuals not wearing masks, fare evasion, drug use/smoking on BART, and disruptive passengers. Some specifically mentioned that riding BART at night was a concern. TSAC continues to support training and outreach efforts to deal directly with all QOL challenges.	The BART Police Department recently launched a new Progressive Policing and Community Engagement Bureau, which includes Transit Ambassadors, a Crisis Intervention and Community Outreach Unit, and Community-Oriented Policing Division. The Bureau's mission is to engage the Department in leading transparent, equitable, and innovative policing practices to improve public safety across the diverse communities served by BART. The Bureau will eventually include 20 Crisis Intervention Specialists trained in de-escalation techniques. This builds on the successful launch of the department's Ambassador Program in 2020, which relies on non-sworn personnel to boost the visible safety presence in the system.	
2	Prohibition Orders and Crime Rates	255 prohibition orders issued in 2020 - Highest number of orders issued in core East Bay stations. - Young adults under 35 form most orders, with a high number issued to young African American males.			
3	Violent Crime Statistics	352 violent crimes and 1,154 property crimes reported in 2020. - Robberies and larceny/theft burglary were the most common.			
4	Part 1 DOJ UCR Crime Rates	Violent and property crime rates fluctuated over the years. Decrease in orders related to domestic violence and robbery. - Battery/threats to employees decreased slightly.			
5	Prohibition Orders Issued for Specified Crimes				
6	Battery Against BART Employees by Classification	Proportion of battery against station agents decreased in 2020.		TSAC considers the prevention of violence against any employee a priority and seeks to identify additional measures beyond training and public education to prevent violence against BART employees. This training must be consistent system wide, and should include the police department employees, the front line staff, and the transit supervisors. The TSAC believes potential benefits from continued and additional training could include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Developing a Civilian Academy in partnership with OPA, CIB, BART PD COPPS and a Community Partner • Helping employees de-escalate potentially dangerous behaviors and situations • Helping employees identify individuals with specific needs • Reducing the likelihood an employee is the victim of assault or battery in 2020, the TSAC received the following trainings and presentations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Violence in the Workplace • Districtwide use of Narcan and Fentanyl • BART's Proof of Payment Teams • Criteria for Dispatching BART Police Officers • Update on the Progressive Policing and Community Engagement Bureau • BPO's Communication Division • Office of the Independent Police Auditor 	
7	TSAC Trainings and Presentations in 2020	- Various trainings conducted including violence in the workplace, Narcan and Fentanyl use, and updates on policing and community engagement.			
8	Battery on BART Patrons	Decrease in prohibition orders for battery on patrons compared to 2019.		In February 2020, BART also launched a pilot Ambassador Program to increase the presence of uniformed personnel on trains to address customers' concerns about safety and security. The ten unarmed ambassadors were recruited from the ranks of the BART Police Department's Community Service Officers and are non-sworn personnel who perform a variety of police services.	
9	BART Improvements to Improve Safety and Security	Recommendations for additional training and social distancing protocols for employees.	The TSAC recommends the following to help continue to minimize areas of conflict with frontline employees and management staff: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identification and implementation of active listening and de-escalation training • Employee education and resources on conflict resolution and peer support • Continue increasing employee staffing levels across service classifications, especially station agents and police officers • Continued support of the Proof of Payment program and its personnel assigned to the enforcement • Support of the newly implemented Ambassador program and to personnel assigned to engage with the public and special populations • Public announcements and social media regarding AB 730 • Additional signage at station agent booths to help inform the public of AB 730 • Crisis Intervention training and a dedicated Crisis Intervention Response Team allowed to address problems district wide with the assistance of county wide Multidisciplinary Forensic Teams (MDFT) 		
10	Youth and Young Adults	- Decrease in prohibition orders issued to persons under 18 - Focus on outreach programs for youth populations.	The TSAC recommends pursuing additional outreach efforts, at the BART District and Police Department levels including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Frontline staff and BART PD developing rapport with young riders through community outreach • Expanding the COPPS Unit to extending the outreach to all patrol zones by providing one COPPS assigned employee per zone • Continuation of the GREAT program and an expansion of the program outside of Alameda County • Development of a Crisis Intervention Response Team staffed by law enforcement personnel and trained civilian staff to highlight the Progressive Policing & Community Engagement Bureau • Recruitment of a youth services representative to the TSAC • Partnering with local youth at risk/youth empowerment programs 		
11	Request for Appeals	No appeals initiated in 2020.		AB736 guideline process used for each case	
12	Repeat Offender Statistics	21 persons violated prohibition orders in 2020.			
13	Continued Need for Outreach Efforts	Identification of individuals struggling with mental health and homelessness. - Collaboration with outreach teams and referral to services.	To continue to develop and increase relationships with key outreach groups in the Bay Area, BPD has worked with the Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT) in all five of the counties it serves.	Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Team (MDFT) workgroup meetings in each of the following counties: Alameda, Contra Costa, San Mateo and San Francisco. The MDFT is a voluntary coalition of law enforcement agencies and allied service providers who assist individuals with mental illness, substance abuse and co-occurring disorders who are at high risk of involuntary hospitalization and are arrested for behaviors and activity related to their disabilities.	
14	Homeless Outreach Initiatives	Partnerships with county departments and Salvation Army for homeless outreach.		BART District continues to be involved in a district wide approach to addressing the challenge of homelessness by partnering with each county in a regional collaboration.	
15	Center for Policing Equity Report	Analysis of racial disparities in policing practices. - Adoption of recommendations from the report.		The key findings from the report include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Black Americans comprise less than 9 percent of residents served by BPD but represented 63 percent of people who experienced force. • After taking into account crime, poverty, and racial demographics of the area around each BART station, the estimated rate of BPD rider stops was eight times higher for Black riders than for white riders. In addition, rider stops were made more frequently in areas with higher poverty rates. 17 From the findings of the National Justice Database project, CPE created six recommendations for BPD moving forward, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update use of force, stops, and searches data collection. • Require supervisor review of stop records • Review fare enforcement policies • Adopt a new policy on drawing or displaying firearms • Further examine the causes of distrust with the community • Collaborate with other officials including the BART Office of the Independent Police Auditor and the BART Police Citizen Review Board BPD has adopted all the recommendation from the CPE report. 	
* 15	Prior Annual Reports	Access to prior year reports on BART's prohibition order program online.			

	<u>2021 Annual Report Observation</u>	<u>Details</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	<u>Implementation</u>	<u>Outcomes</u>
1	Ridership Trends and Customer Satisfaction	Increase service hours to accommodate rebounding ridership.		The BART Police Department recently launched a new Progressive Policing and Community Engagement Bureau, which includes Transit Ambassadors, a Crisis Intervention and Community Outreach Unit, and Community-Oriented Policing Division. The Bureau's mission is to engage the Department in leading transparent, equitable, and innovative policing practices to improve public safety across the diverse communities served by BART. The Bureau will eventually include 20 Crisis Intervention Specialists trained in de-escalation techniques; it currently has 50% hired. This builds on the successful launch of the department's Ambassador Program in 2020, which relies on non-sworn personnel to boost the visible safety presence in the system.	
2	Maintain long trains for social distancing.	Continue monitoring and responding to customer feedback for service improvement.			
3	Prohibition Orders and Crime Rates	Analyze and address trends in prohibition orders, especially among young adults and specific demographic groups.			
4	Battery against BART Employee	Monitor and address crime rates, with a focus on violent crimes and property crimes.			
5	BARTS improvement to improve safety and security	Provide additional training for employees on de-escalation and conflict resolution.	The TSAC believes potential benefits from continued and additional training could include: 13 • Developing a Civilian Academy in partnership with OIPA, CRB, BART PD COPPS and • Community Partners • Helping employees de-escalate potentially dangerous behaviors and situations • Helping employees identify individuals with specific needs • Reducing the likelihood an employee is the victim of assault or battery In 2021, the TSAC received the following trainings and presentations: • Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, TSAC was limited to what they received for 2021 •	Progressive Policing and Community Engagement Bureau • Ethics Training In 2020, the TSAC received the following trainings and presentations: • Violence in the Workplace • Districtwide use of Narcan and Fentanyl • BART's Proof of Payment Teams • Criteria for Dispatching BART Police Officers • BART Police Department's Communication Division • Office the Independent Police Auditor	
6	Youth and Young Adults	Focus on outreach programs for youth, especially those who are transit dependent.	The TSAC recommends pursuing additional outreach efforts, at the BART District and Police Department levels including: • Frontline staff and BART PD developing rapport with young riders through community outreach • Expanding the COPPS Unit to extending the outreach to all patrol zones by providing one COPPS assigned employee per zone • Continuance of the GREAT program and an expansion of the program outside of Alameda County • Development of a Crisis Intervention Response Team staffed by sworn law enforcement 15 personnel and trained civilian staff, an initiative of the Progressive Policing & Community Engagement Bureau • Recruitment of a youth services representative to the TSAC. • Partnering with local youth at risk/youth empowerment programs		
7	Request for Appeals	Expand community outreach efforts and partnership with youth programs.			
8	Mental Health & Homelessness*	Ensure individuals served prohibition orders have the right to appeal.		To continue to develop and increase relationships with key outreach groups in the Bay Area, BART PD has worked with the Homeless Outreach Teams (HOT) in all five of the counties it serves. Information on mental health incidents is gathered and shared at monthly Multi-Disciplinary Forensic Team (MDFT) workgroup meetings in each of the following counties: Alameda, Contra Costa, San Mateo and San Francisco. The MDFT is a voluntary coalition of law enforcement agencies and allied service providers who assist individuals with mental illness, substance abuse and co-occurring disorders who are at high risk of involuntary hospitalization and are arrested for behaviors and activity related to their disabilities. BART PD has been able to make referrals to the District Attorney and Public Defender's office through collaboration with MDFT workgroups to help specify treatment for individuals and focus on chronic cases that tend to exhaust valuable resources for many police agencies.	
9	BART Improvements for Safety and Security**	Address issues related to mental health and homelessness through outreach and collaboration with local agencies.			
10	Homeless Outreach Initiatives			PPCEB - The District also hired its first Senior Manager of Social Service Partnerships to advise and push forward the District's Quality of Life initiatives. This hire in coordination with several other departments has allowed time for staff to continue to work to expand its partnerships with the 5 counties, and staff anticipates further levels of financial and/or resource sharing in 2022.	
11	Center for Policing Equity Report	Adopt recommendations from the report to ensure equitable policing practices.		From the findings of the NID project, CPE created six recommendations for BPD moving forward, including: • Update use of force, stops, and searches data collection. • Require supervisor review of stop records • Review fare enforcement policies • Adopt a new policy on drawing or displaying firearms • Further examine the causes of distrust with the community • Collaborate with other officials including the BART Office of the Independent Police Auditor and the BART Police Citizen Review Board	
12	Repeat Offender Statistics	Monitor and address repeat offenders violating prohibition orders.			

2022 Annual Report Observation	Details	Recommendation	Implementation	Outcomes
1 Ridership Trends and Customer Satisfaction	average weekday ridership slowly rebounded throughout most of 2022, reaching 41% of pre-pandemic levels in September.			
2 Prohibition Orders and Crime Rates in 2022	In 2022, 310 prohibition orders were issued compared to 236 in 2021. Prohibition orders were issued at 42 BART stations. The highest number of prohibition orders (108) issued in a geographic BART policing zone were issued at Oakland stations (Zone 1) and represent 34% of all prohibition orders issued. The lowest number issued in a BART policing zone was 12 (or 4%), issued in Santa Clara County (Zone 6).			
3 Violent Crime and Property Crime Statistics	In 2022, there were 350 violent crimes and 1,382 property crimes reported. The most common violent crime was robbery, with 225 instances. Aggravated assault increased from 71 in 2021 to 114 in 2022, matching pre-pandemic 2019 levels. The most common property crime was larceny and auto burglary, with 1,118 instances.			
4 Prohibition Orders Issued for Specified Crimes	As society emerges from the COVID-19 pandemic, BART is seeing new trends in specified crimes. Battery/threats to patrons have rebounded to pre-pandemic levels, and battery/threats to employees are up more than three-fold from 2021.			
5 Battery Against BART Employees by Classification		TSAC considers the prevention of violence against any employee a priority and seeks to identify additional measures beyond training and public education to prevent violence against BART employees. This training must be consistent system wide, and should include the police department employees, the front-line staff, and the transit supervisors.	The TSAC believes potential benefits from continued and additional training could include: • Developing a Civilian Academy in partnership with OIPA, CRB, the Community Oriented Policing and Problem Solving (COPPS) program and other community partners and stakeholders. • Develop a Crisis Intervention Team training academy at BART Police Department • Helping employees de-escalate potentially dangerous behaviors and situations. • Helping employees identify individuals with specific needs, implement preventative measures to avoid negative outcomes. • Reducing the likelihood an employee is the victim of assault or battery.	
6 Battery on BART Patrons	Ninety-three, or 30%, of probation orders were issued in 2022 for battery and threats to BART patrons. This compares to 56 in 2021, 64 in 2020 and 104 in 2019; as we emerge from the COVID-19 pandemic, we are seeing numbers rebound to pre-pandemic levels.		To address crime on the BART system, BART Police have mounted a robust campaign to recruit more officers and implemented new techniques including high visibility foot patrols and dedicated commanders for specific zones of the system. In February 2020, BART also launched a pilot ambassador program to increase the presence of uniformed personnel on trains to address customers' concerns about safety and security. The unarmed ambassadors are nonsworn personnel who perform a variety of police services. The ambassadors receive additional de-escalation and anti-bias training and walk trains in teams of two, seven days a week. They focus their patrols on the most heavily traveled sections of the system.	
7 BART Improvements to Improve Safety and Security	In an effort to reduce incidents of violence against the front-line BART employees, specifically station agents, train operators, and system service personnel who deal with thousands of passengers each day, the TSAC recommends additional training for employees. U	The TSAC is currently reviewing training content with union leaders of station agents, system service employees, fore workers, and train operators for possible modifications to the current training guidelines. The TSAC recommends the following to help continue to minimize areas of conflict with frontline employees and management staff:	Identification and implementation of active listening, tactical communication, and deescalation training. • Employee education and resources on conflict resolution and peer support/wellness and self-care • Continue increasing employee staffing levels across service classifications, especially station agents and police officers. • Continued support of the Proof of Payment program and its personnel assigned to the enforcement. • Support of the newly implemented Ambassador and CS program and its unarmed personnel assigned to engage with the public and special populations. • Public Service Announcements (PSAs) via BART Media Relations and the BART Police Department regarding AB 730. • Additional signage at station agent booths to help inform the public of AB 730. • Crisis intervention training and a dedicated Crisis Intervention Response Team allowed to address problems district wide with the assistance of a county wide MultiDisciplinary Forensic Teams (MDFT).	
8 8. Youth and Young Adults	In 2022, 29 persons under 18 years old were issued prohibition orders, compared to 11 in 2021, 25 in 2020 and 43 in 2019. The TSAC has shown interest in the youth population because of the high volume of juveniles in the area who are transit dependent. Special attention will be paid to demographics, age and ethnicity as outreach programs are created and designed for the groups that have the greatest needs.	The TSAC recommends pursuing additional outreach efforts, at the BART District and Police Department levels including: • Frontline staff and BART PD developing rapport with young riders through community outreach. • Expanding the Community Engagement Team (CET) to extending the outreach to all patrol zones by providing one CIT assigned employee per zone. • Continuation of the GREAT program and an expansion of the program outside of Alameda County to include Crisis Intervention Specialist. • Deployment of Crisis Intervention Trained (CIT) law enforcement personnel, Crisis Intervention Specialists, Transit Ambassadors and trained professional staff, an initiative of the Progressive Policing & Community Engagement Bureau. • Recruitment of a youth services representative to the TSAC. • Partnering with local youth at risk/youth empowerment programs.	Frontline staff and BART PD developing rapport with young riders through community outreach. • Expanding the Community Engagement Team (CET) to extending the outreach to all patrol zones by providing one CIT assigned employee per zone. • Continuation of the GREAT program and an expansion of the program outside of Alameda County to include Crisis Intervention Specialist. • Deployment of Crisis Intervention Trained (CIT) law enforcement personnel, Crisis Intervention Specialists, Transit Ambassadors and trained professional staff, an initiative of the Progressive Policing & Community Engagement Bureau.	
9 Request for Appeals	Of the 310 prohibition orders issued in 2022, none were appealed. Of the 236 prohibition orders issued in 2021, one appeal was initiated, and the prohibition order was upheld. Of the 255 prohibition orders issued in 2020, none were appealed.			BART is one of a few transit agencies in the nation to employ two full-time CIS Supervisor and Community Outreach Liaison to connect individuals who may be in crisis to specific mental health or social services. Our CI Supervisor is a member of the TSAC and works with homeless outreach teams in all five counties that BART operates. The two BART Police CIT Supervisors are either on scene and/or meet with police personnel to review individual cases and develop an action plan to connect or re-connect individuals to specific mental health or appropriate services daily. CISs also track these individuals as they move forward with their action plan and share information with mental health and public health partners.
10 Continued Need for Outreach Efforts Involving Mental Health & Homelessness	In 2022, of the 310 prohibition orders issued, 18 of the offenders were identified as "in crisis" or struggled with a mental health condition and identified as a danger to self or others. An additional 42 individuals issued a prohibition order were identified as unhoused.			The District also hired its first Senior Manager of Social Service Partnerships to advise and push forward the District's Quality of Life initiatives. This hire has allowed the District to expand its partnerships within the five counties it serves. The Senior Manager was tasked with developing the District's first Homeless Action Plan, which was presented to the Board in early 2023.
11 Homeless Outreach Initiatives	BART continues to invest in a process to reduce prohibition orders resulting from conditions related to homelessness. BART extended partnerships with Contra Costa County Department of Public Health's CORE (Coordinated Outreach, Referral and Engagement) Team. New partnerships have been developed in Alameda County with La Familia CARES Navigation Center and in San Francisco with the Abode Program.			
12 Prior Year Annual Reports	In BART's commitment to transparency and accountability, prior year reports to the California legislature on BART's prohibition order program can be found online at bart.gov/reports.			

	<u>2023 Annual Report Observation</u>	<u>Details</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>	<u>Implementation</u>	<u>Outcomes</u>
1	Ridership Trends and Customer Satisfaction				
2	Prohibition Orders and Crime Rates				
3	Violent Crime and Property Crime Statistics				
4	Prohibition Orders Issued for Specified Crimes				
5	Battery Against BART Employees by Classification				
6	Battery on BART Patrons				
7	BART Improvements to Improve Safety and Security				
8	Youth and Young Adults				
9	Request for Appeals				
10	Continued Need for Outreach Efforts Involving Mental Health & Homelessness				
11	Homeless Outreach Initiatives				
12	Prior Year Annual Reports				

	NAME	DESCRIPTION	REMARKS
1	1.1.1.1	1.1.1.1	1.1.1.1
2	2.1.1.1	2.1.1.1	2.1.1.1
3	3.1.1.1	3.1.1.1	3.1.1.1
4	4.1.1.1	4.1.1.1	4.1.1.1
5	5.1.1.1	5.1.1.1	5.1.1.1
6	6.1.1.1	6.1.1.1	6.1.1.1
7	7.1.1.1	7.1.1.1	7.1.1.1
8	8.1.1.1	8.1.1.1	8.1.1.1
9	9.1.1.1	9.1.1.1	9.1.1.1
10	10.1.1.1	10.1.1.1	10.1.1.1
11	11.1.1.1	11.1.1.1	11.1.1.1
12	12.1.1.1	12.1.1.1	12.1.1.1
13	13.1.1.1	13.1.1.1	13.1.1.1
14	14.1.1.1	14.1.1.1	14.1.1.1
15	15.1.1.1	15.1.1.1	15.1.1.1
16	16.1.1.1	16.1.1.1	16.1.1.1
17	17.1.1.1	17.1.1.1	17.1.1.1
18	18.1.1.1	18.1.1.1	18.1.1.1
19	19.1.1.1	19.1.1.1	19.1.1.1
20	20.1.1.1	20.1.1.1	20.1.1.1
21	21.1.1.1	21.1.1.1	21.1.1.1
22	22.1.1.1	22.1.1.1	22.1.1.1
23	23.1.1.1	23.1.1.1	23.1.1.1
24	24.1.1.1	24.1.1.1	24.1.1.1
25	25.1.1.1	25.1.1.1	25.1.1.1
26	26.1.1.1	26.1.1.1	26.1.1.1
27	27.1.1.1	27.1.1.1	27.1.1.1
28	28.1.1.1	28.1.1.1	28.1.1.1
29	29.1.1.1	29.1.1.1	29.1.1.1
30	30.1.1.1	30.1.1.1	30.1.1.1
31	31.1.1.1	31.1.1.1	31.1.1.1
32	32.1.1.1	32.1.1.1	32.1.1.1
33	33.1.1.1	33.1.1.1	33.1.1.1
34	34.1.1.1	34.1.1.1	34.1.1.1
35	35.1.1.1	35.1.1.1	35.1.1.1
36	36.1.1.1	36.1.1.1	36.1.1.1
37	37.1.1.1	37.1.1.1	37.1.1.1
38	38.1.1.1	38.1.1.1	38.1.1.1
39	39.1.1.1	39.1.1.1	39.1.1.1
40	40.1.1.1	40.1.1.1	40.1.1.1
41	41.1.1.1	41.1.1.1	41.1.1.1
42	42.1.1.1	42.1.1.1	42.1.1.1
43	43.1.1.1	43.1.1.1	43.1.1.1
44	44.1.1.1	44.1.1.1	44.1.1.1
45	45.1.1.1	45.1.1.1	45.1.1.1
46	46.1.1.1	46.1.1.1	46.1.1.1
47	47.1.1.1	47.1.1.1	47.1.1.1
48	48.1.1.1	48.1.1.1	48.1.1.1
49	49.1.1.1	49.1.1.1	49.1.1.1
50	50.1.1.1	50.1.1.1	50.1.1.1
51	51.1.1.1	51.1.1.1	51.1.1.1
52	52.1.1.1	52.1.1.1	52.1.1.1
53	53.1.1.1	53.1.1.1	53.1.1.1
54	54.1.1.1	54.1.1.1	54.1.1.1
55	55.1.1.1	55.1.1.1	55.1.1.1
56	56.1.1.1	56.1.1.1	56.1.1.1
57	57.1.1.1	57.1.1.1	57.1.1.1
58	58.1.1.1	58.1.1.1	58.1.1.1
59	59.1.1.1	59.1.1.1	59.1.1.1
60	60.1.1.1	60.1.1.1	60.1.1.1
61	61.1.1.1	61.1.1.1	61.1.1.1
62	62.1.1.1	62.1.1.1	62.1.1.1
63	63.1.1.1	63.1.1.1	63.1.1.1
64	64.1.1.1	64.1.1.1	64.1.1.1
65	65.1.1.1	65.1.1.1	65.1.1.1
66	66.1.1.1	66.1.1.1	66.1.1.1
67	67.1.1.1	67.1.1.1	67.1.1.1
68	68.1.1.1	68.1.1.1	68.1.1.1
69	69.1.1.1	69.1.1.1	69.1.1.1
70	70.1.1.1	70.1.1.1	70.1.1.1
71	71.1.1.1	71.1.1.1	71.1.1.1
72	72.1.1.1	72.1.1.1	72.1.1.1
73	73.1.1.1	73.1.1.1	73.1.1.1
74	74.1.1.1	74.1.1.1	74.1.1.1
75	75.1.1.1	75.1.1.1	75.1.1.1
76	76.1.1.1	76.1.1.1	76.1.1.1
77	77.1.1.1	77.1.1.1	77.1.1.1
78	78.1.1.1	78.1.1.1	78.1.1.1
79	79.1.1.1	79.1.1.1	79.1.1.1
80	80.1.1.1	80.1.1.1	80.1.1.1
81	81.1.1.1	81.1.1.1	81.1.1.1
82	82.1.1.1	82.1.1.1	82.1.1.1
83	83.1.1.1	83.1.1.1	83.1.1.1
84	84.1.1.1	84.1.1.1	84.1.1.1
85	85.1.1.1	85.1.1.1	85.1.1.1
86	86.1.1.1	86.1.1.1	86.1.1.1
87	87.1.1.1	87.1.1.1	87.1.1.1
88	88.1.1.1	88.1.1.1	88.1.1.1
89	89.1.1.1	89.1.1.1	89.1.1.1
90	90.1.1.1	90.1.1.1	90.1.1.1
91	91.1.1.1	91.1.1.1	91.1.1.1
92	92.1.1.1	92.1.1.1	92.1.1.1
93	93.1.1.1	93.1.1.1	93.1.1.1
94	94.1.1.1	94.1.1.1	94.1.1.1
95	95.1.1.1	95.1.1.1	95.1.1.1
96	96.1.1.1	96.1.1.1	96.1.1.1
97	97.1.1.1	97.1.1.1	97.1.1.1
98	98.1.1.1	98.1.1.1	98.1.1.1
99	99.1.1.1	99.1.1.1	99.1.1.1
100	100.1.1.1	100.1.1.1	100.1.1.1

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]