

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE
DRAFT Committee Meeting Minutes
March 26, 2026

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Herb Hastings, **Chair**
2. Joshua Saunders, **Vice Chair**
3. Hillary Brown, **2nd Vice Chair**
4. Anita Ortega
5. Bruce Yow
6. Catherine Callahan
7. Clarence R. Fischer
8. Danny Kodmur
9. Daveed Mandell
10. Esther Waltz
11. Janice Armigo Brown
12. Roland Wong
13. Ryan Manriquez
14. Sam Buman
15. Shana Ray
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

Elena Van Loo
Kevin McDonald
Ryan Greene-Roesel

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

Director Robert Raburn
Ahmad Rassai (BART staff)
Aleta Dupree (Guest)
Vi Ibarra (Guest)
Sarah Desumala (Guest)
Tanya Washington (Guest)

Lucky Maxwell (Guest)
Roger Acuna (Guest)
Trisha Nguyen (Guest)
Marc Soto (Guest)
Kat (Guest)

2. Public Comments

Director Robert Raburn introduced himself and thanked the BATF members for their service to the community. He also welcomed Ryan Manriquez as the newest appointed BATF member.

Roger Acuna introduced himself and thanked the BART staff for organizing an amazing blind and low vision sensory event held on March 25, 2026, at the 19th Street BART Station.

Roger Acuna shared that it would be helpful to have an audible indicator identifying the location of accessible fare gates when entering and exiting BART stations.

Trisha Nguyen introduced herself and expressed interest in joining the BATF Advisory Committee.

Aleta Dupree introduced herself and congratulated Ryan Manriquez as the newest BATF member and would like to see a full roster for the BATF members. She mentioned she wrote a letter to better understand who Aleta Dupree is and would like to get to know the BATF members better.

Lucky Maxwell introduced themselves and shared that they appreciated attending the blind and low vision sensory event held on March 26, 2026, at the 19th Street BART Station.

3. Approval of the February 26, 2026 meeting minutes

Sam Buman motioned for approval of the February 26, 2026 meeting minutes. Joshua Saunders second the motion.

- Motion passed with thirteen (13) in favor, zero (0) against, and one (1) abstention

4. Second Quarter: BART's compiled and analyzed customer complaints Related to accessibility.

Kevin McDonald presented on the agenda item with the presentation included in the BATF March 2026 agenda packet.

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few comments, concerns, and suggestions were provided:

- Hillary Brown liked the presentation but would like to see fewer claims reported for people who are low-vision or blind.
- Danny Kodmur requested clarification on whether accessibility-related claims are reviewed every ninety (90) days, four times per fiscal year. He also asked whether all accessibility-related claims are captured through online customer service complaints, phone calls, and emails within the Salesforce database.
- Ryan Manriquez noted that many accessibility-related claims involve physical experiences that disabled riders encounter throughout BART stations. He asked whether BART collects any data—or if there are other forums—related to concerns about discrimination or ableism among riders. He stated that having this type of information would help the committee understand whether riders feel they have experienced discrimination within the system, both in practical and social ways.
- Joshua Saunders asked how many accessibility-related claims involving accessible fare gates had been reported in the past two to three months and inquired whether these issues have been addressed.
- Herb Hastings remarked that he was surprised by the high number of accessibility-related claims categorized under “Customer service/personnel problem.” He suggested assigning additional station agents to larger BART stations to improve customer service and potentially reduce the number of complaints.

Aleta Dupree stated that she was not aware that frontline employees could face disciplinary action for inappropriate behavior. She noted that when glass or liquid spills occur, they are typically cleaned promptly, and she appreciates this responsiveness. She also emphasized that some individuals using priority seating may have hidden disabilities and that one cannot assume someone without a mobility device is not disabled.

Lucky Maxwell noted that they have observed instances of incorrect pronoun use during BATF meetings and expressed the importance of ensuring that individuals' pronouns are used correctly, stating that this is both appropriate and necessary.

5. Overview of digital wayfinding technologies

Ryan Greene-Roesel presented on the agenda item with the presentation included in the BATF March 2026 agenda packet.

The BATF committee discussed the item to receive feedback on five (5) wayfinding tools: NaviLens, GoodMaps, Waymap, GTFS Pathways, and AIRA. A few comments, concerns, and suggestions were provided:

- Sam Buman did not have any comments related to the presentation but would like to see Wi-Fi in the trains.
- Joshua Saunders shared that he had previously used the GoodMaps wayfinding tool at the MacArthur Station and found it effective for locating various station features. He suggested considering an expansion of GoodMaps to additional BART stations. He also acknowledged that the low-vision and blind community represents a relatively small portion of overall BART ridership.
- Shana Ray shared that she had also participated in the GoodMaps study previously and found it useful. She expressed interest in having AIRA tested as well, noting that she believes it could be beneficial and is simple to use.
- Roland Wong acknowledged previous BATF discussions about adding Wi-Fi on BART trains and stated that he believes Wi-Fi would be beneficial. He also asked whether BART plans to undertake any initiatives related to artificial intelligence (AI).
- Ryan Manriquez stated that it would be helpful for the committee to see demonstrations of the different wayfinding programs and to pilot them when funding becomes available. He shared that he is a strong supporter of AIRA, noting that it appears to be the easiest tool to implement. He also asked whether there was any collaboration among the three potential wayfinding tool pilot projects, regional mapping efforts, and the Wayfinding Group at the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC).
- Clarence R. Fischer expressed interest in having BATF members test any wayfinding tools that become ready for use, so members can provide feedback and help identify any glitches on both iPhone and Android devices. He asked how users are trained when using the AIRA wayfinding tool. He also asked how wayfinding tools account for changes during construction or maintenance, and whether they notify customers of reroutes or elevator mitigation.
- Esther Waltz shared that she has not use any of the wayfinding tools presented.

- Danny Kodmur asked whether other public transportation agencies have used any of the wayfinding apps and how frequently they are used by riders who are low-vision or blind. He also asked whether existing accessibility-planning funds could support testing the different wayfinding tools or if additional funding would be required.
- Hillary Brown appreciated the presentation and she stated she was involved trying out different kinds of wayfindings.
- Daveed Mandell stated that he is very involved in trying different types of wayfinding tools. He expressed a desire for a standardized approach so that different wayfinding systems function consistently. He also emphasized that training is crucial for staff to understand how the various wayfinding tools work.
- Herb Hastings asked whether any of the listed wayfinding apps could be integrated into the BART App and expressed interest in having BATF members involved in testing the various wayfinding tools during the app's development stage.

Aleta Dupree noted that the NaviLens wayfinding system is currently in use in New York City and is expanding. She added that any technology that helps individuals navigate their surroundings, regardless of their condition, is beneficial.

6. Annual BATF committee goals for 2026

Herb Hasting led the agenda item.

The BATF committee shared goals for 2026:

- Hillary Brown would like to see accessibility related claims be reduced.
- Danny Kodmur mentioned that he does not have any goals at this time.
- Esther Waltz could not think of any goals at this moment.
- Clarence R. Fischer stated that he would like to see seating available at bus stations and pick-up zone areas so that individuals who cannot stand for long periods have a place to sit.
- Bruce Yow has been satisfied with how staff coordinate and facilitate BATF meetings and thanked the BART staff.
- Ryan Manriquez outlined three goals for 2026:
 - Have a way for the BART's app to have push notifications out to users to notify them that an elevator is out of service before they arrive at the station.
 - Host at least one community listening session per quarter in partnership with CILs (Center of Independent Living) and disability orgs across the region.

- Use existing data and Geographic Information Systems (GIS) to map elevators that have the highest reliability and ease of use. We should be able to grade elevators across BART's system to know which one will need to be worked on soon and which ones riders can always rely on.
- Roland Wong stated that although it may not be a formal goal, he expressed concern about potential future service cuts if the ballot measure in November does not pass, particularly the possibility of certain BART stations closing.
- Shana Ray stated that when funding becomes available for wayfinding efforts, the focus should be on the different wayfinding tools that were discussed earlier.
- Joshua Saunders agreed with Ryan Manriquez's suggestion to engage with other external accessibility advisory committees and expressed concern about the potential closure of some BART stations.
- Catherine Callahan stated that she would like to work on an awareness campaign focused on proper etiquette when using platform elevators.
- Anita Ortega stated that she would like to see improved coordination between BART and bus schedules.
- Daveed Mandel stated that there should be a broader discussion on what accessibility currently is and what it should be for BART. He recommended that BART hire individuals with disabilities to help guide efforts to make the system fully accessible for all riders.
- Sam Buman expressed interest in providing a disability awareness presentation to the BART Board of Directors and he requested increased engagement from the Board in the work and activities of the BATF.
- Janice Armigo Brown expressed concerns about the service closure between the Castro Valley BART Station and the Dublin/Pleasanton BART Station and requested ongoing updates.
- Herb Hastings stated that there should be better coordination between BART and the bus systems serving stations. He suggested adding more signage on trains to help recruit additional BATF members. Herb Hastings requested that members of the BART Board of Directors attend BATF meetings.

7. Member Announcements

Ester Waltz suggested installing two elevators at all newly built stations.

Bruce Yow shared that there are Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) projects happening within the city of El Cerrito.

Joshua Saunders reported that while at the El Cerrito del Norte BART Station, he used his Clipper Card to exit the station but did not receive an audio signal indicating that the fare gate was opening.

8. Staff Announcements

Director Robert Raburn shared during Public Comment that BART staff is implementing several adjustments to the fare gates, including efforts to address sensory-related issues. He noted plans to install fare gates at the concourse level, as previously discussed by Ryan Manriquez at earlier BATF meetings. In addition, he acknowledged that Esther Waltz has raised concerns regarding the varying color lighting throughout the BART system.

Elena Van Loo made a couple of announcements:

- Congratulated Ryan Manriquez on becoming the newest BATF member and noted that he was appointed by the BART Board of Directors on March 26, 2026.
- Announced that Ethics Training AB1234 is scheduled for May 6, 2026, and informed BATF members that the training may be completed either in person or via teleconference. She added that travel reimbursement will be provided for those attending in person.

Ryan Greene-Roesel shared that the Sensory Orientation for Low Vision and Blind Riders event at the 19th Street BART Station went well.

Kevin McDonald informed BATF members and members of the public that they are encouraged to visit either the Concord BART Station or the Antioch BART Station to test the sensory features when entering and exiting the fare gates. He noted that the sensors have been adjusted and that this is part of a pilot program at both stations running through March 31, 2026.

9. Chairperson Announcements

Herb Hastings is continuing to recruit new BATF members and shared that he continues to test the Clipper 2.0 pilot project.

10. Future Agenda Topics – Members Suggest Topics

Next Meeting Scheduled: April 23, 2026

- Update of BART Fiscal Year budget for FY26 & FY27
- Analyze how potential service cuts may effect the disability communities
 - Elevator services
 - Paratransit
 - Elevator mitigation

- Elevator out of service notices
 - BART App
 - Less “clicks” to locate elevator out of services
- Maintenance throughout the BART System
 - Consideration of chemical sensitivities in BART’s use of cleaning products, especially in elevators.

11. Adjournment

Esther Waltz moved to adjourn the March 26, 2026, meeting. Sam Buman seconded the motion. The meeting adjourned at 4:11 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, Thursday, April 23, 2026.